Gender Analysis for Technical Assistance for the Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme



Afiya S. Zia February 2018

Table of Contents

| 1. Introduction to demography, ethnicity, economic and legislative factors in Balochistan | List of Acronyms | 2 |
|--|--|-----------|
| 1. Introduction to demography, ethnicity, economic and legislative factors in Balochistan | Executive Summary | 6 |
| 2. Gender Norms and Culture of Balochistan | PART ONE: Gender Analysis for the BRDCEP 1. Introduction to demography, ethnicity, economic and legislative factors in Ba | lochistan |
| 3. Methodology | | 11 |
| 4. Analysis and Findings by the Eight Sectors: | | |
| 5. Case-study of Village Wali Shah, Killa Abdullah | | |
| 6. Analysis of the GoB Gender Policy Action Plan (2016-2019) | | |
| 7. Analysis of Implementing Partner's Gender Policy | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | |
| 8. Recommendations from this Gender Analysis | | |
| 9. Conclusion of the Gender Analysis | | |
| PART TWO: Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for BRDCEP 1. Purposes and Development of a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy | | |
| 1. Purposes and Development of a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy | 9. Conclusion of the Gender Analysis | 47 |
| 1. Purposes and Development of a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy | PART TWO: Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for BRDCEP | |
| 2. Recommendations for Gender Mainstreaming in BRDCEP 49 3. Gender Mainstreaming in Monitoring and Evaluation 61 4 Gender Responsive Budgeting 61 5 Checklists for Gender Mainstreaming 61 6 Self-Assessment Questions on Gender Mainstreaming for BRDCEP Staff 62 Literature Review 64 Useful Films as Resources 64 | | 48 |
| 3. Gender Mainstreaming in Monitoring and Evaluation | | |
| 4 Gender Responsive Budgeting | | |
| 5 Checklists for Gender Mainstreaming | | |
| 6 Self-Assessment Questions on Gender Mainstreaming for BRDCEP Staff | | |
| Literature Review | | |
| | | |
| References 65 | Useful Films as Resources | 64 |
| 1.0101 011000 | References | 65 |

List of Annexes

| Annex 1 | Gender Literature Review |
|---------|---------------------------|
| Annex 2 | Interviews transcriptions |

Glossary of Acronyms

| ADB | Asian Development Bank |
|---------|--|
| AF | Aurat Foundation |
| AJK | Azad Jammu and Kashmir |
| B.Ed | Bachelor of Education |
| BACP | Balochistan AIDS Control Programme |
| BACT | Balochistan Academy for College Teacher |
| BEF | Balochistan Education Foundation |
| BEEF | Balochistan Education Endowment Fund |
| BEMIS | Balochistan Education Management Information System |
| вни | Basic Health Unit |
| BISP | Banazir Income Support Programme |
| BLGA | Baluchistan Local Government Act 2010 |
| ВМС | Bolan Medical College Teaching Hospital |
| BPSC | Balochistan Public Service Commission |
| BRDCEP | Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme |
| BRSP | Balochistan Rural Support Programme |
| ВТВВ | Balochistan Textbook Board |
| BUITEMS | Balochistan University of Information Technology Engineering and Management Sciences |
| CIP | Community Implementation Partner |
| CNIC | Computerized National Identity Card |
| CPEC | China Pakistan Economic Corridor |
| DDR | Disaster Risk Reduction |
| DWSS | Drinking Water Supply Schemes |
| ECCE | Early Childhood Care and Education |
| EFA | Education for All |
| EFP | Environmental Focal Person |
| ESR | Education Sector Reform |
| FAFEN | Free and Fair Election Network |
| FAO | Food and Agriculture Organisation |
| FC | Frontier Constabulary |
| FGD | Focused Group Discussion |
| FSW | Female Sex Workers |
| GEP | Gender Equity Program |
| GGG | Global Gender Gap |
| GB | Gilgit Baltistan |
| GCC | Gender and Child Cell |

| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
|-------|--|
| GER | Gross Enrolment Ratio |
| GFP | Gender Focus Person/Point |
| GOB | Government of Balochistan |
| GPAP | Gender Policy Action Plan |
| GTF | Gender Task Force |
| НЕ | Higher Education |
| HEC | Higher Education Commission |
| ICT | The Islamabad Capital Territory |
| IDSP | Institute for Development of Studies and Practices |
| ILO | International Labour Organisation |
| IMR | Infant Mortality Rate |
| JUI | Jamiat Ulema-e Islam |
| КРК | Khyber Pakhtunkhwa |
| LB | Local Bodies |
| LFM | Logic Framework Matrices |
| LGRD | Local Government and Rural Development |
| МСН | Maternal and Child Health |
| MICS | Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey |
| M & E | Monitoring and Evaluation |
| MDG | Millennium Development Goals |
| MMR | Pakistan Maternal Mortality Rate |
| MNA | Member National Assembly |
| MPA | Member Provincial Assembly |
| MPI | Multidimensional Poverty Index |
| NADRA | National Database and Registration Authority |
| NCHD | National Commission on Human Development |
| NEP | National Education Policy |
| NER | Net Enrolment Rate |
| NFBE | Non formal Basic Education |
| NFC | National Finance Commission Award |
| NGO | Non-Government Organisation |
| NP | National Party |
| NMR | Neonatal Mortality Rate |
| OPM | Oxford Policy Management |
| PDHS | Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey |
| PDMA | Provincial Disaster Management Authority |
| PHED | Public Health Engineering Department |
| PKMAP | Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party |

| PMDC | Pakistan Mineral Development Corporation |
|--------|--|
| PML-N | Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz) |
| PPIU | Policy, Planning and Implementation Unit |
| PPP | Public Private Partnership |
| PSLM | Pakistan Social and Living Measurement |
| RHC | Rural Health Centre |
| SEHER | Society for Empowering Human Resources |
| SIW | Small Industries Wing |
| SUN | Scaling Up Nutrition |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNESCO | United Nation Education Scientific Cultural Organisation |
| UNICEF | United Nation International Children Fund |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| USAID | United States Agency for International Development |
| VAW | Violence Against Woman |
| WATSAN | Water Sanitation |
| WB | World Bank |
| WDD | Women's Development Department |
| WESS | Water, Environment and Sanitation Society |
| WFP | World Food Programme |
| WH0 | World Health Organisation |
| | |

Executive Summary

The objective of this assignment is to produce a comprehensive Gender Analysis of Balochistan for the Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme (BRDCEP) and Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for the Programme in general, but particularly for the community empowerment/social mobilisation component.

This Gender Analysis has had to rely on very little existing historical, or recent literary, social scientific studies, or other resources on Balochistan, especially related to gender social or development relations. Most of the findings, therefore, are derived from the research and direct interviews conducted for this Analysis and information received with the assistance of the Balochistan Rural Support Programme (BRSP)¹ and their collective experiences and institutional memory acquired from working with women and on gender and development projects over the past few decades in Balochistan.

This assignment occurred in the early startup phase of the BRDCEP and was the first technical assistance study to be conducted. Other baseline studies, such as the political, economic and stakeholder analysis, have not yet been completed. The Gender Expert found that given the early stage of the programme and limited time available for research and analysis, the development of a comprehensive gender mainstreaming strategy was not realistic. This report applied a more practical approach at this early stage through addressing GMS in the programme indicative Logframe and providing a framework and the necessary recommendations for ensuring that GMS strategies are mainstreamed by the Implementing Partners. This report suggests that a more comprehensive GMS should be developed after preparatory stage activities have been completed, strategic plans have been finalised and subsequent programme components and activities have begun implementation.

This report has two main components: Part One is a comprehensive gender analysis of Balochistan for the BRDCEP. The analysis details findings for eight sectors studied for this assignment in the context of Balochistan which includes: food insecurity, health, education, livelihood, poverty, water, democracy and governance, as well as some cross-cutting themes. As the findings show, these are sectors that carry the worst indices for gender disparity not just in global comparison but also against national averages. The analysis flags key challenges for the existing GoB Gender Action Plan ². It highlights institutional and programmatic concerns around the gender policy of both the Government ³ and BRSP as derived from the discussions with staff members and the gender focus persons from the BRDCEP identified districts.

¹ Balochistan Rural Support Programme is in fact a NGO, operating in Balochistan since the 1980s. Their website is https://www.brsp.org.pk/ They are a member of the Rural Support Programmes Network in Pakistan (11 RSPs in total).

² Available here:

http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/images/Women Development/Intiatives Bills/gender%20policy%20action%20plan%2 0WDD%20under%20review.pdf

³ Available here:

http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/images/Women Development/Intiatives Bills/Gender Policy Balochistan endorsed by Minister Secretry WDD.pdf

The gender analysis concludes with recommendations for a gender sensitive and creative approach to addressing gender inclusivity in community empowerment and development programmes in the Programme's selected districts of BRDCEP.

Part Two is a framework and offers recommendations for developing a GMS including a revised indicative Logframe. The Logframe for the BRDCEP programme has been reviewed to ensure gender inclusivity and maximise outcomes for women's empowerment. The framework includes recommended gender mainstreaming approaches developed in light of the findings as well as suggestions for strengthening the BRDCEP programme. Corresponding indicators and targets have been inserted directly into the Logframe.

A literature review supporting the gender analysis and recommendations is attached as Annex 1.

Overall, this report identifies key findings and offers recommendations to deepen and expand gender-related information and strategies for a more viable and long-term gender-based developmental approach for Balochistan.

There is a temptation to summarise all the challenges associated with achieving gender parity for any development initiative in Balochistan under the overarching theme of 'cultural norms', illiteracy and the poor health of women in the province. The other popular pretext for explaining slow progress on political empowerment is the ubiquitous 'security situation'. This Gender Analysis finds that while these are undoubtedly obstacles in skill development, economic participation and social and political progress, they are not uniform, permanent or systemic barriers across all districts. Focusing solely on these is not a helpful tool for the analysis of changes that may be taking place across this very disparate province.

Competing with these fundamental impediments are other structural and governance approaches and methodologies adopted by both government and non-governmental bodies, who are disabling the opportunity for gainful empowerment of and by women. One common finding in this Analysis was the heavy and almost exclusive emphasis on the Sexual Harassment at the Workplace law as found in government and non-government organisations' manuals, handbooks and as promotional material to show their commitment to gender concerns. While commendable, this has become almost a substitute to gender development/empowerment altogether – as if setting up committees and subscribing to the guidelines that come with the law takes care of the bulk of gender requirements within organisations and government alike. This narrow vision has limited the understanding of 'gender integration' to either mean enumerating women in projects, or subscribing to the sexual harassment law in the workplace.

The Analysis confirms that the prevailing overall social and political challenges for gender-related mainstreaming efforts or development training in Pakistan in general extend to Balochistan as well. However, these are additionally complicated by pre-existing conditions (tribal conflict, militancy, illiteracy, geographical location, ethnic/sectarian strife, exclusion from national political processes), and past policy negligence regarding empowerment programmes for women of Balochistan. These are further exacerbated due to the absence of

a strong political or autonomous women's movement in the province. These factors operate to create differentials in women's and men's access to and control over resources, and affect values, construct identities, influence choices and role behaviour. They also affect the societies, cultures and economies in which communities live but also, become embedded because unlike other provinces, there is little organised political resistance by women's collectives and groups in Balochistan.

Another key finding of this Gender Analysis is that the history of community development in the province has resulted in a range of community-based models and methodologies, including those deployed by the Government of Balochistan. Within each of these there is an attempt to incorporate 'gender' in some layered and top-down manner. These various models may not be contradicting each other but they are confusing and have led to a repetition of projects and, presumably, financial inefficiency. For example, some programmes find micro-credit lending does not yield successful results in Balochistan and are switching to interest-free loans. However, other programmes continue with micro-credit enterprises in various formations. Some of the GoB departments acknowledge the overlap and similarity in challenges and absence of gender-planning or policies, but there is no initiative to develop a holistic and cross-cutting method to enable gender integration and efficient streamlining of these concerns. Further, several members of the donor community who were interviewed for this Analysis reported that the various rural support programmes need to collate their activities and an alliance is needed. Examples were given of 8 to 10 projects that were very similar but running parallel. Given this duplication of efforts, it would be far more cost-effective and result-oriented to develop a chain of more diverse projects at any given time.

Two recommendations in this regard include the need for a survey/baseline that aims to measure gender relations as part of district profiles which would include gendered work divisions, time and activity allocation, access to resources and other qualitative factors that are not included in current surveys (poverty, health, education, efficacy of loans). It is also recommended that a targeted gender mapping of all the districts be carried out with the purpose of identifying all existing gender-related government and donor projects in each district and for the planning of new projects that avoid duplication. This would require a collaborative forum where government and donors provide information and plan future projects in a more efficient manner. Further, this Analysis also finds that there is an urgent requirement to survey, map, streamline and consolidate the span of gender-related information across thematic sectors in all districts across Balochistan. The BRDCEP should develop a comprehensive profile of all specific gender-related development projects that are currently running in the targeted districts. This element should be a part of any baseline exercise conducted.

⁴ A useful training exercise could be for working groups in BRSP to take existing analyses and work on critically assessing the limitations of these with regard to gender issues. For e.g., the PPAF study (2015) on poverty in Killa Abdullah (see References) offers a very limited and sometimes misplaced approach to gender analysis.

Another key finding is that the cultural tag that associates Baloch women with livestock or handicrafts has attracted all actors to jump onto multiple projects that box women into these activities with little imagination and unmeasured results beyond the project period. Little attention has focused on art, theatre or communication techniques or expanding economic opportunity beyond traditional crafts. There is neither a a project nor a policy designed for a women's market, assigned public spaces or local bazaars where women may buy and sell their own products in a recreational way, rather than following a simply male-specified economic exchange limited to Quetta. There are no known websites or online sites for the purchase of merchandise. Such initiatives could provide opportunities for increasing mobility and awareness and collectivity amongst women, even within their district downtowns and connecting them to a wider network.

Similarly, there is a tremendous shortfall of female doctors across rural Balochistan but there is no initiative for setting up medical helplines in Quetta where more doctors may be available and could advise local communities via some form of virtual/media clinics with the assistance of local NGOs or technology providers. This Analysis recommends that along the lines of new start-ups that provide online services and are being experimented with for the health sector in Pakistan, similar services should be considered for BRDCEP.⁵

The invaluable door-to-door pre- and post-natal services by the Lady Health Workers needs to be enhanced in this wide and intractable province with high fertility and maternal mortality rates and the highest rate of home-based deliveries in the country. This would require mass recruitment by the GoB, but also the timely payment of salaries, otherwise there is little incentive to join. The government's Benazir Income Support Programme⁶ (BISP) holds much promise and potential but needs concerted upgrading and several projects could be appended to this with careful planning.

Campaigns advocating the end of violence against women are not imaginatively planned. More stakeholders need to be involved and the stigma associated with speaking out on these issues needs to be challenged more purposefully than simply acquiescing to the notion that cultural taboos prevent open discussion. One key challenge in this regard is the lack of a strong women's rights movement in the province with identifiable leaders.

At local government levels, women councilors face tremendous challenges which are, in fact, directly related to their illiteracy. This is a severe handicap and political training becomes a big challenge. New methods that impart political education for women, such as those developed by the Quetta-based Institute of Development of Studies and Practices⁷ (IDSP) should be included in training material for community development projects.

This Analysis also finds that the lag in the wide variety of gender programmes and projects in Balochistan, as compared to the rest of Pakistan, has resulted in a lapse in women's development. However, this also affords an opportunity to learn from and avoid repetition

⁵ Anusha Zahid, "Health on Call." Aurora, Nov-Dec 2017. https://aurora.dawn.com/news/1142859/health-on-call.

⁶ http://bisp.gov.pk/

⁷ http://idsp.org.pk/

of failed approaches, or those that have met limited successes in other parts of the country. Quetta remains the centre of market and training activities for development projects and there is no ostensible plan to develop women-friendly districts. This Analysis recommends that women's spaces be developed within local town centres in the districts which would be more accessible for women given mobility restrictions and the distance to larger urban centres. With regard to development and environmental initiatives, projects can be consciously planned in a manner where subsistence and environmentally-prudent and long-term aims are in-built rather than large-scale, damaging urban expansion, or those that widen the gap between the rich and poor. It is recommended that the Provincial Disaster Management Authority which has a gender cell⁸ and a specialist advising the programme, should be encouraged to pool its resources with the BRDCEP and integrate knowledge on food security, sustainable agriculture, and nutrition requirements with a focus on good practices to reduce environmental damage - all through a gendered lens.

The Analysis also finds that the Balochistan government's Gender Policy Action Plan⁹ (GPAP) has identified a wide range of themes and issues and has planned corresponding activities while accounting for personnel requirements for the implementation of the plan. The Women's Development Department¹⁰ (WDD), however, needs infrastructural strengthening. There is virtually no space to host any of the activities envisaged in the GPAP or to accommodate women traveling to the city, and there are practically no sports facilities, women's hostels or shelter homes in most districts outside of Quetta. There is a shortfall in the appointment of personnel in the WDD to carry out these tasks. This Analysis recommends the appointment of experts committed to guiding the roll-out of the GPAP. Currently, the WDD is filling in vacancies, but more guidance is required for implementation of the many tasks as well as managing the financing of the plan. A group of external experts working closely with the stakeholders in Balochistan would provide critical support for the implementation of gender-related programmes in the province. Quarterly seminars in Balochistan should be held as part of a public-private initiative and should call on some key national experts to give advice, assistance and practical strategic feedback on the GPAP. An inter-provincial meeting to share lessons of integrating gender into community development approaches is also recommended.

⁸ https://pdma.gob.pk/?cat=38

⁹ See footnote 4

¹⁰ http://balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1147&Itemid=1176

PART ONE: Gender Analysis for the BRDCEP

1. Introduction to demography, ethnicity, economic and legislative factors in Balochistan

The districts identified for the BRDCEP include, Kech/Turbat, Jhal Magsi, Washuk, Khuzdar, Loralai/Duki, Killa Abdullah, Pishin, and Zhob. However, it is challenging to offer a generic analysis for any belt or district in Balochistan due to the sparsely spread populations across its vast territory, its diverse ethnic composition and the unevenness of resource distribution. The Gender Focus Persons associated with the Balochistan Rural Support Programme (BRSP) offer important insights for each district. Washuk is reportedly the most challenging context due to the lack of even basic amenities, including water. One of the most telling indicators of gender disparity and lack of agency is that unlike many women across the province, here they do not possess Computerised National Identity Cards and if they do, male family members retain these. 12

Table 1: Selected Districts for BRDCEP

BRDCEP Balochistan Districts: 1. Killa Abdullah (Pushtun) 2. Jhal Magsi (Baloch)

- 2. Julia Magsi (Dalocii)
- 3. Loralai/Duki(Pushtun)
- 4. Kech (Baloch)
- 5. Pishin (Pushtun)
- 6. Washuk (Baloch)
- 7. Zhob (Pushtun)
- 8. Khuzdar (Baloch)



Balochistan is 347,190 square km with a total population of 12,344,408 and a population density of 36 sq km. Quetta is the provincial capital and largest populated city. Balochistan

¹¹ District profiles can be found in the Population Census 2008 conducted by the Government of Pakistan, http://www.pbscensus.gov.pk/content/balochistan which includes literacy rates and sex ratio for each district. The data is expected to be updated by mid 2018 based on the Census of 2017.

 $^{^{\}rm 12}$ For further overall details for each of the BRDCEP district, see

http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/DistrictProfile/Profiles.htm . These profiles carry only limited and outdated gender-based information in terms of population and education; a deeper and systematic gender analysis is required for a more accurate baseline.

comprises of administrative 6 Divisions, 34 Districts and 572 Union Councils. There are 252 Union councils in the 9 districts covered by the BRDCEP.

The provisional findings of the 2017 Population Census confirm that Balochistan has the least population and highest sex ratio difference in the country with far less women than men. The 2017 census also enumerated 10,418 transpeople in Pakistan with 109 reported in Balochistan. The population of Balochistan is varied and divided broadly along two main ethnic divisions of Pakhtun (33%) and Baloch (61%) heritage. Both are culturally and historically at variance with regard to access to resources, relationship with the state, and with regard to gendered social relations. According to the Census, 20 Baloch majority districts have a population of 6,607,263 and 9 Pashtun majority districts have a population of 3,111,524 (ethnic dominance across BRDCEP districts indicated in Table 1 above).

The Pashtun tribes of Balochistan pride themselves on a greater sense of racial and ethnic purity compared to their Baloch-Brahui counterparts by claiming to be closer to the original kinship and lineage notion of their tribe. The fact that Pashtun-dominated districts are almost exclusively Pushto-speaking, suggests a greater degree of racial and ethnic exclusivity here. The gender imbalance for Pakistan is highest in Balochistan. Makran Division has the highest gender imbalance with 117 men for every 100 women, while Nasirabad Division has the lowest gender imbalance with 106 women for every 100 men.

Pakhtun communities traditionally are observed to follow strict gender segregation, while Baloch societies generally tend to be more 'secular' (politically-speaking), and observe mixed gender activities and societal norms. This variation is difficult to capture unless every programmatic district is visited and documented for deeper gendered analysis.

Table 2: Demographic Data of Balochistan 2017

| Administrative | House | Male | Female | Total | Sex | 1998- |
|----------------|------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|--------|---------|
| Unit | holds | | | population | Ratio | 2017 |
| | | | | | 2017 | Average |
| | | | | | | Annual |
| | | | | | | Growth |
| | | | | | | Rate |
| Pakistan | 32,205,111 | 106,449,322 | 101,314,780 | 207,774,520 | 105.07 | 2.40 |
| Balochistan | 1,775,937 | 6,483,653 | 5,860,646 | 12,344,40813 | 110.63 | 3.37 |

Source: Provisional Results, Population Census, Government of Pakistan 2017.14

The Baloch societies are divided between *sardari* (chiefdom) and non-*sardari*. The people of coastal Makran Division strongly identify themselves as being Baloch, yet clearly belong to different races. Coastal Makran, unlike central and eastern Balochistan, did not have *sardari* arrangements, and political allegiance to the tribal chief opened up the possibility of inclusion into the wider community.

¹³ The difference is the 109 transgender persons in Balochistan documented in the census.

¹⁴ District Wise Census Results - <u>Provisional Summary Results Of 6th Population And Housing Census-2017</u>, Pakistan Bureau Of Statistics.

In general, relations between the Baloch and the Pashtuns as ethnic groups are marked by mutual acceptance of differences and peaceful accommodation. Baloch *sardars* and Pashtun tribes place equal emphasis on racial and lineage purity but this is only partly responsible for the strength of their respective tribal bonds. Joint ownership and management of common property resources is a key economic dimension of tribal solidarity and rivalry. Dispute resolution is another "key dimension of collective action among extended patriarchies" (Gazdar 2007).

There have been conflicts, even violent, but the most common cause has been over an predominant competing nationalism with anxiety amongst the Baloch population due to the increase and influx of Pashtun settlers, who in turn feel like second-class citizens in Balochistan. However, there has not been outright civil or open conflict precisely because Baloch and Pashtun do not inhabit the same spaces. Of late, several observers cite that Islamic clericism is also articulated in ethnic terms.

Gazdar traces the history of politics in current Balochistan and finds that many of the current politicians in Balochistan started their careers as student leaders (Gazdar 2007). The current composition of the Provincial Assembly¹⁵ confirms this legacy since very few new entrants have come into the legislature in 2013. Gazdar argues that the ethos of the ethnic nationalist movement is more modernist than some lingering tribal legacy (Gazdar 2007). Coalition governments have been the norm in Balochistan partly because no single party is able to gain a majority or even a plurality in the two main ethnic regions – Baloch and Pashtun, respectively. Interestingly, ethnic difference does not prevent broad Baloch-Pashtun representative coalitions.

The lingering concern over 'security' in Balochistan is multi-varied with regard to the relationship between the State and citizens. Gazdar (2007) observes that, "The Levies system of local policing, like the Frontier Crime Regulation and legalised Sardari before it, is linked with tribal social organisation and creates scope for local rent-seeking behaviour. The replacement of the Levies with formal police (or the reclassification of "B Areas" into "A Areas") has provoked wide opposition including from within the provincial government." Added to this is the soft war that continues between Baloch insurgents and the Frontier Constabulary (FC) – a force that dates back to colonial times and is considered an oppressive form of state intervention into provincial political and economic freedoms.

The development of the Gwadar port and coastal division of Makran and, most notably, the China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC), promises to open up unprecedented economic opportunities in Balochistan. Social structures in Makran, Gwadar and Hub are relatively free of tribalism and informal systems of social organisation, resource ownership and dispute management are less robust than elsewhere in the province. This makes these potentially neutral urban spaces for the Baloch but also "causes anxiety over the ability of indigenous

 $^{^{15}}$ The parliament of Balochistan has 65 members, including 11 reserved seats for women and 3 for non-muslim minorities. Currently there are 13 females as members in the Parliament – 11 from the reserved seats, 1 from the non-muslim minorities and 1 that won a general seat.

communities in asserting and maintaining their entitlements to resources and future rents" (Gazdar 2007).

Gender disparity is stark across the province and is discussed below, according to various sectors. However, a series of recent pro-women legislation has been passed by the Balochistan Assembly, which includes the Domestic Violence Act 2014 ¹⁶; the Anti-Harassment at Workplace 2016 ¹⁷; the establishment of a Provincial Commission on the Status of Women Act 2017 ¹⁸; the People with Disability Act 2017 ¹⁹; the Elderly People Act 2017 ²⁰; the Child protection Act 2016 ²¹. The Prohibition of Early Marriage is under discussion with the Standing Committee and Women's Right to Inheritance and Anti-Acid Bills are also in the pipeline (with the support of UN Women)²².

2. Gender Norms and Culture of Balochistan

The most common gendered concern for the women of Balochistan, as found in the little available literature and confirmed by experts and government officials, is with regard to the alarmingly low rate of literacy for women (24%) and conversely, the disturbingly high rate of maternal mortality (700/100,000). Both indices contribute to Pakistan's standing as the second worst country as listed in the Global Gender Gap Report 2017 (143 out of 144 countries). Educated women in Balochistan are mostly found among Hazara and Pushtun ethnicities, however, their involvement in the skilled labour market is often limited to teaching. Mobility and gender norms make the provision of health services extremely challenging in Balochistan. Male doctors are not allowed to examine women and there is an acute shortage of female doctors who find it difficult to work in the remote areas due to housing shortage and cultural constraints including security for single women in some areas.

Tribal conventions generally do not allow property ownership for women. Entitlements to common property resources are also regulated and measured with reference to male family members. Even among highly egalitarian tribes where members have equal shares in common property resources, the privilege does not extend to women. Single women and widows remain economically dependent on extended male family members. This is "despite the fact that much of the economic value of common property resources is realized through the labour of women – in grazing animals, fetching water, gathering herbs and firewood" (Gazdar 2007).

Prescribed gendered divisions of space, labour, roles, and authority are key signifiers of tribal and ethnic norms. Male members of tribes, sub-tribes and families are accorded

¹⁶ http://www.pabalochistan.gov.pk/uploads/acts/2014/Act072014.pdf

¹⁷ http://www.pabalochistan.gov.pk/uploads/acts/2016/Act012016.pdf

¹⁸ http://pabalochistan.gov.pk/uploads/acts/2017/Act%20No%205%20women%20status.pdf

¹⁹ http://pabalochistan.gov.pk/uploads/acts/2017/Act%202%202017%20Disability.pdf

²⁰ http://balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_docman&task=doc_download&gid=7487&Itemid=677.

²¹ http://pabalochistan.gov.pk/uploads/acts/2016/Act072016.pdf

²² http://asiapacific.unwomen.org/en/countries/pakistan/programmes-pakistan/women-economc-empowerment

²³ The Global Gender Gap Report, World Economic Forum https://www.weforum.org/reports/the-global-gender-gap-report-2017.

sovereign status in informal terms – for example, it is thought inconceivable that a woman might become a chief, or take part in arbitration. Tribal and sub-tribal identities are perpetuated by endogamy within tribes. Women are the embodiment of honour for the family and the tribe and can bring disrespect, dishonour and social chastisement on their family and tribe if they deviate from the set norms. The Gender Focal Points of BRSP in the select BRDCEP districts testify to the lack of choice and agency afforded to women in any form of decision-making, including in choice of marriage and personal matters.

Marriage customs in tribal Balochistan revolve around negotiations between families and the practice of bride-price (*lub* or *valvar*). This cultural practice has its roots in the notion that the payment is a token of respect for the bride's parents on the part of the groom. These customs tend to commodify women. Only men from both sides are involved in such negotiations and women have little or no say in the matter. *Lub* tends to be higher for a woman who fulfills her gender expectations i.e. is beautiful and healthy and possesses good housekeeping qualities. A girl who is disabled, skinny, ill or mentally challenged has a lower *lub*. The *lub* belongs to the bride's father, except in Makran where the *lub* is the property of the bride (Marri 2005). BRSP staff note, however, that the practice of exchange marriage²⁴ is increasingly becoming less popular. There is increased exposure of Baloch societies to changes in broader social norms and forms of payment for marriage are being redefined. However, this does not mean that marriage is a free choice for women or any less traditional in purpose.

Women have low levels of influence in decision-making – not just in the public realm but even on domestic issues. In case of disputes, both within and outside the tribe, marriages can also take place amongst the dissenting parties to establish peace. In the Baloch custom of *nekh*, if one man kills another, women from the family of the accused are married into the family of the deceased. The number of women to be married for dispute settlement is clearly stipulated in the *jirga's* (male-headed tribunal) decision about resolution of the dispute, and are in addition to any monetary – cash or kind - settlements of the *khoonbaha* (blood money). The laws of different tribes stipulate different arrangements of *khoonbaha* and thus what is given in settlement – the number of women, amount of money, livestock, if any – also varies.

A woman married to settle a feud is often not treated well in her husband's home. There may be other problems in the future also, like finding suitable marriage partners for the married couple's children. These and other reasons have led to a decline in the practice of *nekh*. In the Marri tribe, the practice was abolished in the era of Nawab Doda Khan (Marri 2005). A similar practice of marrying females from one family into another for dispute resolution also exists amongst Pahstuns and is known as *swara*.

As embodiments of the honour of their family and tribe, Gazdar (2007) finds that "Women of all ages, but particularly young women, are expected to strictly guard themselves, stay within the protected environment of the home, and adhere to the moral code of the tribe. In

²⁴ This practice of endogamous marriage relies on agreements between families on reciprocal exchange of spouses between two groups/tribes.

case of failure in this, the punishments for the women are severe – public disgrace and death to reestablish her family's honour." A man or woman accused of being involved in extramarital or premarital sexual relations is called the *siyah* or *siyahkar*, and the punishment of death ordained by the tribal code for this offence is called *siyahkari*. Some tribes settled disputes of honour through monetary compensation to the husband, and allowed the woman to marry her lover. There was relatively more flexibility in the case of an unmarried girl (Gazdar 2007).

Against the backdrop of these overarching gender norms that define much of the Baloch tribal context, the following sectors have been identified for attention and analysed in order to enable a more inclusive methodology in the development of a gender-sensitive baseline and evaluation process for the BRDCEP.

3. Methodology

The Gender Analysis team used a mixed method approach that consisted of the following²⁵:

- a) a document or literature review based on relevant gender analyses, gender policies, project and activity reports on Baluchistan,
- b) 16 key informant interviews with technical and provincial official staff of various departments of the GoB and representatives of donor organisations in Quetta ,
- c) a focus group discussion with a total of 26 BRSP staff members,
- d) group interviews with 18 representatives of BRSP from 6 districts including Gender Focus Persons,
- e) 3 group interviews with the community members of Killa Abdullah ²⁶ (male and female),
- f) 1 group interview and 1 key interview with women Parliamentarians in Quetta,
- g) 2 interviews with human rights and women's rights activists working in/on Balochistan.

The eight thematic sectors selected for analysis include food insecurity, health, education, livelihood, poverty, water, democracy and governance, as well as cross-cutting themes. These sectors were selected because they reveal tangible disparities that result from unequal access to resources or uneven distribution, but more particularly, disclose the inequality in gender roles, relations and power dynamics in a community.

The GA team developed three sets of questionnaires and guiding points²⁷ for discussions for the four groups of stakeholders and experts who were interviewed for the Analysis. These stakeholder groups included (for list of names, see Annex 2);

- 1. GoB Officials, including Director Generals and Secretaries of the various Departments,
- 2. Staff and Gender Focus Persons from districts of the BRSP.

16

²⁵ Lists and transcripts in Annex 2

²⁶ UCs: Girdi Pinkki, Arambi, Villages: Wali Khan, Karwan,

²⁷ Annex 2

- 3. Community and UC members at Killa Abdullah district-level focus group discussions,
- 4. Experts, activists and members of Civil Society Organisations working in/on Balochistan.

For GoB officials, the questionnaire prepared aimed at inquiry into knowledge on governmental/donor gender policies, examples of best practices, budget allocation and to gain perspective on administrative and cultural obstacles that government departments/donor agencies face in community development. For the implementing partners, one set of questions focused more on gaining information regarding local gender norms and challenges that field staff face in mobilising and implementing community-based programmes. Another set probed into institutional level challenges regarding gender policies, integration, understanding and commitment amongst the staff toward achieving gender equality goals and within the organisation itself. The questionnaire prepared for community-based focus group discussions specifically targeted at yielding gender roles, relations, responsibilities and political behaviour and practices with a concerted focus on the eight sectors identified for this Analysis.

An overall limitation regarding data collection and in the literature review for this assignment is that government surveys carry disclaimers about figures for Balochistan. They caution that the security situation and military operations in the province have prevented surveyors from visiting districts to update data. Apart from quantitative data, there is a notable dearth of qualitative ethnographic, academic, sociological and even analytical work on Balochistan.

More specifically, there is very little domestic or international literature by way of academic studies or even consultancy reports conducted or available for Balochistan and even less so on women and gender relations. The literature collected for this Analysis depends on some of the more credible and acknowledged studies conducted by development workers/organisations in Pakistan, however, even these papers often date back 10 years.

Another key limitation in the collection of data for this Gender Analysis was due to the security risks regarding mobility and travel in and around Balochistan. The Gender Analysis team has only been able to visit one rural district of Killa Abdullah, and the urban centre of Quetta. It did, however, meet with a wide and gender-inclusive set of key stakeholders in both sites and held a FGD with representatives from the various districts, including the gender focal points in Quetta organised by BRSP.

4. Analysis and Findings by the Eight Sectors:

a. Food insecurity

Balochistan has the highest levels of food insecurity in the country, with most districts considered extremely food insecure. A study by the Centre for Research and Security Studies

and Action Aid^{28} on the impact of the devastating floods of 2011 found that 27 of 30^{29} districts of Balochistan had become food deficient; including 6 districts otherwise producing a wheat surplus. About 35% of livestock perished, and increased food prices resulted in reduced food intake by people, hoarding and manipulation by market players. At the time, 66% of food needs of the province were being met by Punjab and Sindh. The smuggling of food items to Afghanistan added to the precarious food security situation. Sudden shocks such as famine, drought, earthquakes or floods put lives and livelihoods in an already precarious context at very high risk and the gendered impact of this has not been specifically measured.

The World Food Programme (WFP) of Pakistan estimates that "four out of five households in Balochistan cannot afford a minimally nutritious diet." Women play a major role in maintaining dietary standards and food hygiene at the household level. In rural areas, this role becomes more important, where male members work in farming or off-farm activities, while female members stay at home. The high rate of illiteracy among women in Balochistan affects food absorption at the household level due to the tendency to rely on traditional methods and inability to gain information from other sources about the benefits of vitamin and nutritional needs of young children or their own. The lack of knowledge about nutritional requirements tends to handicap early learning amongst children and prolonged deprivation, including through pregnancy, often results in stunting and compromises immunity.

Table 3: Food-based Coping Mechanisms in Balochistan

100.0 90.0 79.9 80.0 70.0 65.1 57.9 60.0 50.0 42.1 40.0 28.8 30.0 20.0 12.2 10.0 .0 rely on less skip meals skip meals for Limit portion restrict entire days preferred and comsumption stocks held for size at meals less expensive by adult in the next order for small

Frequent use of food-based coping mechanisms

Source: WFP, Linking Agriculture to Nutrition, Food Security & Livelihoods, 2011

²⁸ "The State of Food Insecurity in Balochistan," Dawn, 5 May, 2011. http://www.dawn.com/2011/05/20/food-insecurity-increasing-in-balochistan.html

²⁹ The number of districts were increased to 32 in the delimitation exercise prior to the 2013 local government elections. Currently since August 2017 there are 34 districts

³⁰ Asim Khan (2017). "Initiative to Prevent Stunting Launched in Balochistan." *Dawn*, September 28th. https://www.dawn.com/news/1360595.

Malnutrition rates in Balochistan are alarmingly high. According to the UN World Food Programme, currently more than half of all children under five are stunted, have low growth for their age - and 16% of the population is malnourished. Anaemia affects 70% of children and three quarters of pregnant and breast-feeding women. The WFP estimates that malnutrition in Pakistan leads to an annual loss of 3% of GDP, or approximately US\$ 7.6 billion per year. Malnutrition undermines the physical and mental development of children, reduces their ability to learn well in school, and has a life-long impact on their health and productivity.

The Health Department of Balochistan has launched a new initiative in partnership with the Planning and Development Department, the SUN (Scaling Up Nutrition) Secretariat and provincial Nutrition Cell, in order to achieve better nutrition for children and women in Balochistan. The new initiative aims to break the inter-generational cycle of stunting and malnutrition across Pishin District by providing nutritional support to 20,000 pregnant and nursing women, and children under the age of five. This is supported by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). It intends to be implemented in 22 Union Councils of Pishin District and will engage more than 188 female health workers in providing WFP's ready-to-eat nutritious products along with key behaviour change messages to the target groups. Other collaborating partners include UNICEF, the World Health Organisation and the provincial Peoples Primary Healthcare Initiative, which will provide technical and implementation support.

Livestock and agriculture are separate departments and the Director Generals (Dr. Hussain Jaffar and Dr. Muhammed Tareen, respectively) of both departments in Quetta report that there is a lack of coordination between them despite there being mutual concerns, especially in regard to gender issues. While the main livestock is divided between sheep and camels, poultry farming is high in the rural areas and women are involved in nearly all forms of livestock rearing. The Directors insist that a disease-free Balochistan means a disease-free Pakistan. The department has distributed chicks to women widows using the BISP beneficiaries list. However, the Food and Agriculture Organisation (FAO) does not support the departments on vaccines (only 10%). The Department of Livestock did offer a two-year veterinary training for women at the Quetta Animal Science Institute but reports are that women do not willingly travel for such training.

Food needs are increasing and women need to be involved and trained on food banks and water conservation. There is no cottage industry for crops systematically set up in Balochistan. The FAO in Balochistan has collected data for its female agri -entrepreneurship programme with Ausaid assistance. It has focused on wool, sheep, poultry, seedlings, and dried fruits sectors and aims to provide seeds, feed, animals, birds and equipment such as hatching equipment and spinning wheels, through local sources and on a cost sharing basis with women. The FAO has also carried out an estimation of the potential for women's enterprise in the wool, sheep, dairy/ghee/kurut and dry fruits sectors and pointed out the constraints and opportunities and returns against investment in each. The only district for this programme that is overlapping with the BRDCEP target districts is Washuk. Egg, seeds, milk/egg production are enterprises that can be supported for women but lack of access to

markets is a major hindrance. The FAO has identified training needs and modules to overcome these and to enhance the value chain and extend the means of production to women. The identified activities may be useful for other districts too, including the establishment of a women's market.

The Pakistan Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) has recently appointed a gender expert who is still familiarising herself with the Authority's work and does not have access to relevant data regarding women's access to basic resources across the communities, as of vet. The Authority's responsibility regarding food security is unclear but, therefore, an opportunity. The Authority set up a Gender & Child Cell (GCC) in 2012 with the support of UN Women and with the aim of incorporating gender in disaster risk reduction (DRR) efforts in the province. The Gender Task Force (GTF) is functional in the province and provides support to different departments by advising the PDMA on formation of clusters of the affected villages and communities in case of emergencies. It also provides advisory support to these clusters on gender mainstreaming. They train and ensure that gender mainstreaming activities are added to all the programme activities. A Planning and Capacity Building Associate has also been designated by the PDMA Balochistan to facilitate clusters in gender mainstreaming in their projects. The PDMA has provided WATTAN cards³¹ to various communities but the data of beneficiaries was unavailable with the expert at the time of this report. There is no evaluation study available to examine the impact of these activities of the PDMA but this is one example of the various gender-related initiatives taken on by the GoB which are disparate and disconnected from the overall gender empowerment agenda.

The Authority is reportedly working on Vision 2018 to 2020, which includes gender indicators for all activities. But the expert reports that gender issues are neglected within the Authority itself, as people do not take working women seriously, which makes it difficult for women to make their voices heard and to actualise their work plans. Men in this department are not gender sensitive and often mock or trivialise women officials. The expert reports that the Authority is working on gender based public messaging in accordance with the sectors that the Authority is responsible for including; alerting communities about predicted disasters; providing facilities to the centre points; facilitating access to government shelters; coordinating with district level disaster management authorities. The PDMA requires gender sensitization, especially for male officials and particularly since this is the lead office that influences the training and general attitudes within the Gender Task Force and for the various clusters established by the Authority. It is commendable that the Gender Expert is aware and outspoken in bringing attention to this concern.

The Gender Cell within PDMA is a potential partner for BRDCEP to work with, particularly for collaborative work on food, nutritional and environmental preparedness and to mitigate the impact of droughts, famines, floods and other disasters from a gendered perspective.

 $^{^{31}}$ A government emergency scheme that identified those worst affected by the floods of 2010, on the basis of which urgent relief was provided to them. The scheme is also used by provincial governments to provide financial relief to communities affected by chronic food insecurity.

b. Health

The 2012-13 Pakistan Demographic Health Survey is the third of such surveys that have been conducted in Pakistan since 1991 and based on a nationally representative sample of around 13,000 households. Some broad comparative findings focusing on Balochistan have been tabulated below and include the correlation of health to literacy and education for women since these are found to hinder women's access to health information, and especially their attitudes towards pre and post-natal care.

Table 4: Health-Related Comparative Findings for Balochistan

| Pakistan | Balochistan |
|--|---|
| 9 out of 10 married women do not own a house or any land. | Same figure for Balochistan |
| 57% of women (ever-married women between the ages of 15-49 years) have never attended school while 29% of men have never attended school. 49% of women are literate, while 67% of the men are literate. | In Balochistan, 85% of women have never attended school (51% men) and just 7% have a secondary or higher education (18% men). Balochistan has 24% female and 56% male literacy rates. The figure is 15% for females and 48% for males in rural areas, while in urban areas it is 44% and 76% for females and males respectively. ³² |
| Infant mortality rates have dropped to 74 out of every 1000 live births. Maternal health care: 73% of women were provided with antenatal care (care during pregnancy) by a skilled provider, while 48% delivered in a health facility. Women with higher education are more likely to seek skilled providers. | Infant mortality rates of Balochistan are 97 out of every 1000 live births. Facility-based births are least common in Balochistan (16%). More than half of births occur at home. Home births are more common in rural areas (60%) than urban areas (32%). ³³ |
| Only 35% of women are using contraceptives (26% modern method and 9% traditional method), which is higher than previous years but a stagnant figure nonetheless. | Use of modern family planning methods varies by residence and region. Nearly one-third of married women in urban areas use modern methods, compared to 23% of women in rural areas. Modern contraceptive use ranges from a low of 16% among married women in Balochistan to a high of 44% in ICT Islamabad. |
| 36 women die every day in the country because of pregnancy. | These statistics become more worrisome when the disparity between the rich and the poor in different urban areas was |

³²https://tribune.com.pk/story/1419396/economic-survey-literacy-rate-pakistan-slips-2/.

21

³³ PDHS 2012-2013.

| High MMR of 276 per 100,000 live births and the under-five child mortality rate of around 89 deaths per 1000 live births during the last decade or so. | compared, such as in Balochistan where the MMR was over 700.34 |
|--|---|
| • The national fertility rate at 3.8 is still way off the 2.1 bench mark set in the MDGs. | The fertility rate of Balochistan is 4.2% |
| • Less than 20% of (ever married) women and 37% of men had knowledge that HIV prevention can be augmented by using condoms and limiting sex to one uninfected partner. | Only 42% of ever-married women and 69% of ever-married men have ever heard of AIDS. Knowledge of HIV prevention measures is much lower. ³⁵ |
| | HIV/AIDS-accepting attitude towards people with HIV is 18.9% in Balochistan. |
| | Percentage who have heard of HIV/AIDS is 17% in Balochistan (BMCS 2010) ³⁶ |
| Children's nutritional status shows | 35% of children under 5 years old are |
| that 45% of children are stunted; 30% are | underweight. More than 50% of children |
| underweight for their normal age. 11% are | under the age of 5 are stunted. |
| wasted (severe process of weight loss, | |
| which is often associated with acute | |
| starvation and/or severe disease). | |

Sourced primarily from the PDHS 2012-2013. Other sources are indicated in-text.

Bivariate analysis from a study in 2012 (S. A. Javed et al. 2012) shows that 81% women residing in Balochistan delivered babies at home. The findings cite the following reasons for delivering at home (A) Cost too high- 39.7%; (B) Facility too far-7.5%; (C) Not customary-17.3%; (D) Not necessary-23.8%; (E) Facility closed-11.7%. The dominant reason for home deliveries for Balochistan was found to be cultural norms. The 2012 study recommends that education of mothers and husbands should be improved so that practices and attitudes regarding reproductive rights and safe delivery care is also improved. It also found that where spousal discussion about birthing takes place, the likelihood of delivery at health facilities increases. The study recommends that cost-effective health facilities must be introduced and Mothers and Child Health Care centers should be increased so that people may have access to health care services and facilities in Pakistan. Finally, the study argues for advocacy and awareness campaigns to be run to raise awareness about the benefits of delivering babies at health facilities in terms of maternal and child health.

The Balochistan health department reports that it is facing multiple challenges including absentee doctors, lack of female doctors and fake medical supplies. The department finds it

³⁴https://www.dawn.com/news/1180278.

³⁵ PDHS 2012-2013.

³⁶Balochistan Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey 2010 and Planning and Development Department, Government of Balochistan, in collaboration with UNICEF, November, 2011.

extremely challenging to serve the scattered settlements across a massive province. The budgetary allocations are not adequate. The private sector is a dominant force for health seeking in Pakistan, including for reproductive health, but deliveries are still considered a "natural" process requiring minimal expense or medical attention. Private hospitals, clinics, and practitioners are by far the most common sources of care outside the home, particularly in the case of childhood illness, yet little is known about their practices, the costs families incur, or the outcomes of their care.

In addition to issues of availability, quality, and cost of services, several other important barriers limit the ability of women, in particular, and also of men, to access family planning services. These include women's overall limited independence and economic power to make important decisions, their limited mobility, and gaps in spousal communication, all of which constrain their use of family planning. Fear of contraceptive side effects is also a very important factor inhibiting both the use and continuation of certain methods. There are also widely held beliefs that family planning is morally wrong or unnatural. Among married women who do not intend to use family planning methods in the future, the most common reason is that fertility is "up to God."³⁷ This was found to be true in the response of women in village the Wali Khan in Killa Abdullah where women on average had 8 to 10 children and nearly all of the respondents were in polygamous marriages.

The challenge of outreach for health services is well-illustrated in the spread of the polio virus ³⁸ due to lack of access to a very high percent of children and, hence, missed vaccinations across Balochistan. Migration trends show that this virus is then carried to other parts of Pakistan, particularly Karachi city.

Table 5: Polio Fact Sheet

| Area | | Children recorded as unvaccinated | | | | | | |
|-------------|------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| | Children Vaccinated | Recorded "not available children" | Recorded "refused vaccination" | Total recorded missed children | | | | |
| Pakistan | 35854531 | 3875607 (11%) | 239490 (1%) | 4115097 (11%) | | | | |
| Balochistan | 2212597 | 153262 (7%) | 20631 (1%) | 173893 (8%) | | | | |

Source: Pakistan Polio Program Update Independent Monitoring Board (May 2017).

c. Education

The female literacy rate in Balochistan is 24%, the lowest amongst the five provinces. Over 55% of the districts are in the 'extremely low' female literacy group. No district is in the 'reasonably better' female literacy group.

³⁷ These findings are cited from the PAIMAN Annual Report 2005-6 and the FALAH Evaluation Report, Oct 2010.

³⁸ Pakistan is one of three countries in the world where poliomyelitis remains endemic.

Table 6: Poverty Indicator; Percentage Presence of Literate Woman in the Household for BRDCEP Districts

| District | Yes | No |
|----------------|-------|-------|
| Jhal Magsi | 41.64 | 60.83 |
| Kech (Turbat) | 0.00 | 46.06 |
| Khuzdar | 33.82 | 50.98 |
| Killa Abdullah | 30.96 | 42.61 |
| Pishin | 34.70 | 40.33 |
| Washuk | 50.23 | 58.76 |
| Zhob | 36.38 | 48.20 |

Source: Poverty Profile BISP and UNICEF, 2011.

According to the Pakistan Social and Living Measurement Survey (PSLM 2014-15) the average of population that has ever attended or been enrolled in school is summarised below;

Table 7: Average Percentage of Population Ever Attended School

| Balochistan | Urban | | | Rural | | | Total | | |
|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|
| | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total |
| | 74 | 43 | 59 | 55 | 17 | 38 | 60 | 25 | 44 |

Source: PSLM 2014-2015

The Gross Enrollment Ratio (GER) for primary schools (Age 6-10) at the national level has decreased to 91% in 2014-15 from 92% in 2012-13 and Punjab leads with 98% GER while Balochistan lags behind with the lowest ratio at 73% (PSLM 2014-15). Primary-level enrollment in government schools of Balochistan province shows that the urban centre of Quetta has one of the lowest enrollment levels for girls (PSLM 2014-15). This is confirmed by the District Officer of the Education Department in Quetta who points out that factors such as a change of 6 Secretaries for the Department under the current government and the absence of transportation for teachers means that an estimated 70% of schools do not have female teachers and about 100 schools in Quetta operate with a single teacher. The attacks on teachers from other provinces on the basis of ethnic politics in the past has impoverished the education sectors in the opinion of these officers. The District Officer for Education confirms there is no issue with the supply of text books and that the "cluster" system works well and the BEMIS data is accurate but the trade unions are a major obstacle for efficiency in schooling and resistant to the improvement in the quality of teachers.

³⁹ This references the grouping of schools for administrative and pedagogical purposes. Administratively, the school cluster acts as a focal point between central and local levels and provides a better framework for local decision-making such as sharing of staff and facilities and supervision of schools within the cluster. The main components of a school cluster system are functions of school clusters, organisation, management and finance.

Table 8: Percentage of Primary Level Enrollment in Government Schools, Balochistan.

| Balochistan | Urban | | | Rural | | | Total | | |
|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|
| | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total |
| Balochistan | 82 | 81 | 81 | 96 | 93 | 96 | 92 | 87 | 90 |
| Quetta | 69 | 60 | 66 | 98 | 80 | 90 | 80 | 69 | 75 |
| Pishin | 100 | 100 | 100 | 93 | 100 | 95 | 94 | 100 | 95 |
| Killa | 100 | 100 | 100 | 82 | 94 | 84 | 84 | 96 | 86 |
| Abdullah | | | | | | | | | |
| Jhal Magsi | 88 | 100 | 93 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 99 | 100 | 100 |
| Khuzdar | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| Tubat | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |
| Zhob | 100 | 94 | 97 | 96 | 87 | 94 | 98 | 91 | 95 |
| Washuk | | | | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |

Source : PSLM 2014-2015

According to the Annual Status of Education Report for 2016 (ASER, 2nd Aug. 2017), there is a continued overall difference between the national average and that of Balochistan with regard to the low enrollment rate of both genders across public and private schools. These rates do show a similar lack of gender parity across government and private schooling.

Table 9: Percentage, Enrollment by Gender & Type of School 2014, 2015 and 2016 (6-16 year olds)

| | Government | | | | | Private | | | | | | |
|-------------|------------|-------|------|-------|------|---------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|
| | 2014 | | 2015 | | 2016 | | 2014 | • | 2015 | | 2016 | |
| | Boys | Girls | Boys | Girls | Boys | Girls | Boys | Girls | Boys | Girls | Boys | Girls |
| National | 65 | 35 | 65 | 35 | 62 | 38 | 63 | 37 | 62 | 38 | 60 | 40 |
| Balochistan | 70 | 30 | 70 | 30 | 69 | 31` | 67 | 33 | 70 | 30 | 64 | 36 |

Source: ASER (2017).

The Pakistan Education for All Report (GOP, 2015) notes that the low levels of spending has led to a range of supply side weaknesses in the Pakistan education system including;

- Shortage of schools especially for girls and in remote and far-flung areas;
- Shortage and high absenteeism of teachers;
- A lack of qualified and trained teachers;
- Missing facilities such as water, toilets and boundary walls; and
- Weak supervision.

The qualitative research indicates that beneficiaries report supply side constraints to their access to education, particularly in the provision of education for girls. Alif Ailaan, a non-profit organisation working on education reported that 1.8 million out of 2.7 million children are without any kind of education in Balochistan (BEMIS School Census 2013-

2014). At least 66% of children, between the ages of 5 and 16 in Balochistan do not go to school and 70% of them are female. Females are deprived of education because of:

- patriarchal/tribal structures,
- lack of school availability,
- social and financial poverty of parents,
- lack of awareness among parent, distance of schools and settlement (especially rural areas),
- lack of mobility,
- fear regarding security conditions and harassment within and outside schools.

The phenomena of not enrolling a child in school or dropping out has multilayered consequences. Out-of-school children face deep-rooted structural inequalities and disparities. A UNICEF study in 2015⁴⁰ found that these are most commonly linked to;

- gender biases,
- income,
- poverty,
- child labour.
- inadequacies in the supply of schools and teachers especially in rural and remote areas.
- lack of infrastructure and school facilities especially for girls,
- deficiencies in the teaching-learning process,
- problems with the processes of devolution and decentralisation,
- incapacities in school management committees,
- weak coordination between the public, private and non-profit sectors,
- inadequate social skills.

The Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) (part of Balochistan Education Support Programme) is a World Bank-supported organisation that rebuilds and rehabilitates private schools under the 'public private partnership' process. It focuses on the enrollment of girls into schools (but not vocational centres). The National Commission on Human Development (NCHD) has also developed feeder schools with the support of the community. BEMIS (Balochistan Education Management Information System) is playing a diversified role in education development. They are supporting colleges, higher education institutions and vocational education enhancement. The system is supported by multiple donors and stakeholders for improving data collection and providing information support.

Given this background, there is clearly an opportunity for introducing vocational skill training for women. The challenge of illiteracy at community levels will need to be overcome

⁴⁰ Out-of-School Children in the Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh Provinces of Pakistan 2013." Global Initiative on Out-of-School Children, Report, UNICEF.

⁴¹ Situation Analysis for Balochistan Education Sector Plan (2015), Government of Balochistan.

through collaborative training with organisations such as the IDSP who have developed techniques and methods to provide skills for women who have had no formal education.

d. Livelihood

Gender disparity levels in Balochistan are the highest in comparison to the rest of the provinces. Pakistan's female labour participation rate (% of female population ages 15+) was 25% in 2017 whereas, participation of Balochistan's female labor force stands at 6-7%. While livestock is traditionally the purview of women in Naseerabad and Jacobabad, in upper Balochistan it is men who tend to the livestock. A study notes that in the Pushtun population, women do not undertake farm work in fields but are involved in post-harvest activities, whereas in Baloch areas, women are involved in the transplanting of rice and vegetables, weeding, harvesting and livestock husbandry.⁴²

The Food and Agriculture Organisation has developed a Group Capacity Model and their approach to gender empowerment is based on complementarity in partnership between men and women in households rather than competition. The FAO has organised their approach to women's economic enterprise in a manner where female groups make their own strategy about accessing markets. The market facilitators are graded according to their mobility and by allocating responsibility from the beginning of production to the shipment stage. The GoB Planning and Development Department (P&DD) is responsible for ensuring that distribution is equitable but they report the need for a mechanism that would respond to the needs of sustained income-support programmes. The (P&DD) cannot be expected to put in place mechanisms and a support structure for random and intermittent donor programmes.

On the other hand, donors report that there is no clarity as to which government department is to serve as the implementing agency of income-support programmes so it becomes difficult to afford technical advice on any project. FAO feels that a consultant needs to indicate the gaps in all of the current gender programmes that are being conducted by all the various donors across all districts; to map who is doing what, best practices, and to identify gaps. The FAO suggest that the various Rural Support Programmes need to collate their activities and an alliance is needed because often, 8 to 10 projects are very similar and running parallel and what may be more cost-effective and result-oriented is a chain of more diverse projects at any given time.

Women's mobility is extremely restricted with only 6% of Baloch women found in formal employment, however, unpaid work including household chores such as cleaning, washing maintaining, rearing and caring of dependent and livestock is the norm in rural and semi-urban households.

The women of Balochistan inherit a rich tradition of embroidery. The quality of the embroidery is excellent and is always in demand from within the province as well as from other parts of the country. The Directorate of Industries, Small Industries Wing (SIW), has a dual role. It provides skill development training in the art traditional handicrafts and it

⁴² Olaf Verheijen (1998). "Community Irrigation Systems in Balochistan," Report No R-49, International Irrigation Management Institute, Lahore.

invests in preserving, promoting and protecting the rich cultural heritage of the province. The Directorate reportedly enjoys considerable autonomy and the attempt is to provide market outlets to craftsmen and women in remote areas. The SIW has a "lady demonstrator" who collects final products from the home of craft men or women or they come to one of the centers which are located in different districts, deliver the final product and pay his/her wages. The centres take care of the final products and transport them to Quetta, where the product is finalised and these are transported to sales and display shops operated by the SIW.

The Director General of Social Welfare explains that while the Directorate is keen to encourage women entrepreneurs, the skill levels of rural woman are weak and training in crafts is an important part of the SIW. She confirms there is no Gender Policy that the Directorate follows and that women do not head projects and men are encouraged in leadership positions. The sexual harassment policy has not received much attention in the Directorate. The operation of small scale industries in the province is hampered due to inadequate and non-availability of funds in time. Existing industrial units are suffering from lack of working capital. In the absence of proper infrastructure like power supply, roads, insufficiency in power generations and inadequate communications, it is difficult for the industries to reach satisfactory levels.

A more coherent policy regarding women's enterprise at the community level is required for which donors and governments should form a specialised consortium. Veterinary training for women along scientific methods need to be developed more concertedly, and offered equitably across districts and communities. Economic enterprise schemes for women should be planned by this consortium in order to avoid repetition of projects. Enhanced and relevant training, as well as a targeted communication strategy to market the products made by women needs to be developed. Assistance can be provided by business schools, private sector businesses, and other entrepreneurial support offered by other donors including, the World Bank and the Open Society. The literature and material developed for these purposes should be interactive and developed keeping in mind the challenge of the higher rates of illiteracy in rural districts.

e. Povertv

Balochistan

Overall

0.5(1.3)

38.3 (100)

The BISP poverty ranking finds that Balochistan has the lowest rating in terms of overall "well-being".

Rating Good Fair Medium Poor Bad Puniab 23.6 (61.6) 5.6 (40.3) 13.4 (61.2) 12.1 (66.1) 1.6 (22.9) Sindh 10.1 (26.4) 4.9 (35.4) 3.7 (16.9) 3.6 (19.7) 0.7(10.0)4.2 (19.2) KPK 4.1(10.7)3.0(21.4)2.0(10.9)0.3(4.3)

0.4(2.9)

14.0 (100)

Table 10: Distribution of Population in Well-being Rating (%) Pakistan

Source: Haq and Zia (2012), Figures shown in parentheses are the provincial share in each category of well-being, cited in An Analysis of National Socio-Economic Registry, PIDE 2011.

0.6(2.7)

21.9 (100)

0.6(3.3)

18.3 (100)

4.4 (62.8)

7.0 (100)

All the districts in the BRDCEP are ranked poor and extremely poor, according to a study by the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE) below;

Table 11: District Ranking by Poverty Status

| District | Poverty Status by % | Ranking |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------------------|
| Balochistan | 44 | Very poor |
| Jhal Magsi | 57.99 Extremely poor | |
| Kech (Turbat) | 46.95 Very poor | |
| Khuzdar | 47.29 | Very poor |
| Killa Abdullah | 40.53 | Poor |
| Pishin | 38.51 | Poor |
| Washuk | 58.22 | Extremely poor district |
| Zhob | 46 | Very poor |

Source: Population of Pakistan: An Analysis of NSER 2010-11 Poverty Profile Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP), PIDE 2011.

Balochistan continues to perform more poorly than other provinces with regard to the BISP cash transfer, with beneficiaries in Balochistan receiving just PKR 12,387 or 69% of the expected transfer in the 12 months preceding the 2016 survey. Further, only 5% of women beneficiaries collect the cash themselves but 72% report that they retain control over the spending of this supplement (compared to 76% overall in Pakistan).

Table 12: Costs Associated With Collecting BISP Cash Transfers

| Punjab | Sindh | Khyber Pakhtunkhwa | Balochistan | Pakistan |
|--|-------|-----------------------|-------------|----------|
| 32 Time taken to travel to collection point per trip (minutes) | 34 | 31 | 45 | 33 |
| 79 Cost of travel to collection point per trip, including multiple trips (PKR) | 120 | 74 | 147 | 96 |

Source: BISP Final Impact Evaluation 2016, Oxford Policy Management.

The use of supplementary cash as received by BISP beneficiaries indicates some of the priority issues for women in the provinces, with food and health outstripping investment across the board. The lack of financial knowledge, skill or investment is clearly not a part of development initiatives either.

Table 13: Reported Use of the BISP Cash Transfer

| | Pakistan | Punjab | Sindh | KPK | Balochistan |
|---|----------|--------|-------|-----|-------------|
| % of households who reported at least some expenditure on | | | | | |
| Food | 80 | 76 | 83 | 83 | 73 |
| Education | 16 | 22 | 8 | 18 | 23 |
| Health | 55 | 46 | 62 | 60 | 67 |
| Clothing | 48 | 47 | 61 | 36 | 29 |
| Loan | 13 | 10 | 11 | 20 | 9 |
| Saving | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
| Investment | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Source: BISP Impact Evaluation Survey, OPM 2016

The BISP evaluations⁴³ have shown strong consistent evidence for increased agency and mobility for women and improved nutritional levels for girls. The findings also show that beneficiaries in provinces other than Balochistan have started investing some supplementary cash towards household livestock purchase. Beneficiaries report that at first they would binge spend the supplementary cash but now they report improvement in their houses, especially flooring, and quality of cooking fuel used. This suggests that potentially over time, the supplemental amounts of cash transfers in Balochistan may lead to increased saving behaviour and that preparatory training on managing finances and savings in anticipation of such an outcome would be useful for women recipients.

The cash transfer in itself has not shown significant impact on the enrollment of children into schools in other provinces. The *Waseela e Taleem* component of the BISP extends the condition that children must be enrolled for 70% of the school quarter to qualify for the additional cash. Mr. Naveed Akbar, reports that this aspect of the programme exists in six districts other than those identified for BRCDEP, and will expand to four more. So far, the impact of this programme may be measured by the observation that school retention for these districts is up at 90%. The main issue remains on the "supply" side and the government's inability to provide schooling, especially of some qualitative standard. Mr. Akbar reports that 100,000 children have been refused schooling and many have access to only one room schools. The *Waseela e Taleem* programme had to include private schools and it is observed that 10-15% of the beneficiaries' children attend private schools and the recipients use the extra cash transfer directly to pay school fees. A fresh survey is planned in which new variables will be included to assess the BISP and its appended programme.

The National Socio-Economic Registry (NSER) report based on BISP data (2010) estimates that Balochistan comprises of 90.29% of male-headed households while only 9.71% of households are headed by females. The data does not show significant difference in levels of poverty between such households, for example, in Jhal Magsi 58.34% male-headed household compare to 51.47% female-headed households in scores of poverty but in Kech,

⁴³ Cheema et al. *BISP Final Impact Evaluation 2017*, Oxford Policy Management. http://bisp.gov.pk/wpcontent/uploads/2017/02/BISP FinalImpactEvaluationReport FINAL-5.pdf.

the statistics are 44.88% and 50.45% respectively, while in Pishin these are 38.23% and a higher 44.59%. This is a good example of a gendered profiling of heads of household in relation to poverty and enables more targeted planning for credit schemes that may be introduced under the BRDCEP.

f. Water

Balochistan is an arid zone, which already has a lower percentage of rainfall and due to frequent droughts, people are compelled to either migrate or to rely on available water sources that are not hygienically clean in most rural areas. All respondents for this Analysis highlighted the urgency of the water issue as being the single biggest concern. The overall anxiety is that the entire city of Quetta would have to be relocated in the not too distant future if alternative water sources were not provided. Organisations that have been working on the refugee influx over the past decade note that the inadequacy of water imperils lives and people's survival for the host population as well as for refugees, which negatively impacts food security and accelerates poverty. They point out that traditional water conservation and usage systems, 'karez' have collapsed. These were underground sloping tunnels conveying water from below water table to ground surface. Karezes were mainly situated in northern and central districts of Khuzdar, Kalat, Loralai, Chaman, Qilla Saifullah and Pishin. Totaling nearly 800 in 1990, many since have become non-functional.⁴⁴

The most vital sub-sectors of water use are, a) people; b) livestock; c) wild life; and d) agriculture. Water resources of Balochistan can be broadly classified into two categories based on the availability of water;

- 1. Indus basin irrigation system,
- 2. Outside the Indus basin system.

Balochistan has 14 dams among which prominent are, Burj Aziz Khan Dam, Mirani Dam, Hingol Dam. It is observed that, "The water table is declining continuously in the province. Studies suggest that the deficit in Quetta sub-basin is about 21,000 AF per year and that the aquifer storage will be exhausted in 20 years. The groundwater is depleting every year, in some places even with one meter per year, especially in the Pishin-Lora Basin. Zhob and Nari river basins are not available for further groundwater development" (Haider 2010).

Access to safe drinking water and the disposal of waste water are connected. According to the Public Health Department, only 10% of households have access to proper disposal of waste water, and 5% of Balochistan's populations have facilities and services that properly dispose of solid waste. Water-borne diseases are caused by the use of contaminated water which is the cause of many types of diarrheal diseases including, Cholera, swelling of intestines, Typhoid fever, and Hepatitis E. The Public Health Department estimates that 65% of rural women are suffering from infectious diseases due to the use of contaminated water. Women are responsible for fetching water from outside of their homes for domestic use in about 60% households in rural areas of Balochistan, and are the key stakeholders in water usage and management. The involvement of women in livestock rearing and crop handling

⁴⁴ Olaf Verheijen (1998). "Community Irrigation Systems in Balochistan," Report No R-49, International Irrigation Management Institute, Lahore.

involves water usage and in a majority of cases women fetch water for livestock kept within households too.

The tables below reveal that despite the fact that women are traditionally responsible for water collection and usage in the domestic realm, they do not feature as workers in the industry of managing these resources in the formal sector. The concept of knowledge and skills is not considered transferrable. BRDCEP should explore the transference of such skills in a manner where women are made responsible for water and sanitation outside of their homes and for the larger community and districts as part of the effort to improve gender inclusivity and to break the current restrictions that relegate them to just domestic chores and roles. The table below highlights the existing gap in women's employment in this sector and makes a case for extending the transference of such skills as part of BRDCEP efforts.

Table 14: Percentage Distribution of Employed Persons by Key Industry Division

| Department | Balochistan | | | Urban | | | Rural | | |
|--------------|-------------|------|--------|-------|------|--------|-------|------|--------|
| | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female |
| Electricity, | 1.2 | 1.2 | 0 | .084 | .84 | 0 | .35 | .35 | 0 |
| Gas and | | | | | | | | | |
| Water | | | | | | | | | |

Source; UNDP 2011.

Table 15: Water and Sanitation in Balochistan BRDCEP Districts

| District | Water and Sanitation | | | | | | | |
|----------------|----------------------|------------|--------------|--------------|-----------------|--|--|--|
| | Using | Improved | Water | Purification | Public latrines | | | |
| | improved | sanitation | Schemes | Plants | | | | |
| | drinking | | (Functional) | Functional | | | | |
| Jhal Magsi | 24 % | 14% | 12 | 2 | 2 | | | |
| Kech (Turbat) | 89% | 91% | 41 | 0 | 416 | | | |
| Khuzdar | 74% | 70% | 135 | 28 | 40 | | | |
| Killa Abdullah | 99% | 96% | 31 | 13 | 2 | | | |
| Pishin | 90% | 52% | 73 | 20 | | | | |
| Washuk | 82% | 67% | 44 | 2 | 62 | | | |
| Zhob | 70% | 62% | 60 | 11 | 2 | | | |

Source: MICS Balochistan, UNICEF 2010

UNICEF has been working with different NGOs to promote WASH awareness programmes including, the Society for Social Development (SSD), Taraqee Foundation and with Water Environment and Sanitation Society (WESS) in School and Community WASH programmes. The Public Health Engineering Department is implementing a "Clean Drinking Water for All" programme that aims to install water purification plants in every Union Council and some Tehsils. There is no indication if there are gender components within this programme.

One of BRSP's aims is to provide clean drinking water and sanitation facilities to the communities it works in. BRSP is implementing different projects in partnership with the

Health and Education departments for rehabilitating the drinking water supply schemes, implementing community infrastructure schemes and improving school WATSAN facilities. BRSP has implemented numerous Drinking Water Supply Schemes (DWSS) and sanitation schemes in different regions of the district. BRSP accounts for the improvement of several thousand male and female beneficiaries through these programmes. The BRDCEP activities should look to further enhance women's roles and go beyond simply being recipients. The programme efforts should envision leadership roles for women in this sector.

g. Democracy and governance

Electoral politics is marked by a mix of traditional leadership and ideological affiliation in Balochistan and is competitive because it is made up of mixture of rival patron-client political factions interacting with ideological positions (Gazdar 2007). The current composition of the Balochistan legislature suggests that political competition does not imply that there is no fragmentation. The best evidence of this is reflected in the distribution of ministerial portfolios or cabinet rank positions.

In the last General Elections of 2013, a total of 1.39 million votes were polled in Balochistan and, while the northern Pushtun areas witnessed hot contests, the Baloch areas were marred by boycott from Baloch nationalists—and separatist elements whereby voters and candidates were threatened to stay away from the polls. A total of 284 candidates competed for the 14 seats – the independents constituting the largest group with 136 candidates.

Table 16: District Wise Registered Voters in Pakistan (2017)

| District | Male | Female | Total |
|----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Balochistan | 2,137,098 | 1,565,342 | 3,702,440 |
| Jhal Magsi | 29,621 | 21,328 | 50,949 |
| Kech (Turbat) | 109,251 | 86,582 | 195,833 |
| Khuzdar | 111,376 | 80,281 | 191,657 |
| Killa Abdullah | 125,114 | 72,982 | 198,096 |
| Pishin | 125,667 | 92,204 | 217,871 |
| Washuk | 23,957 | 20,868 | 44,825 |
| Zhob | 63,316 | 45,874 | 109,190 |

Source: Election Commission of Pakistan.

Balochistan has held the lowest rate of women's representation in governance and their participation in political spaces has been insignificant. Women make up 46% of Balochistan's population while their representation in the Provincial Assembly is 20%. In 2013, eight major political parties did not nominate any female candidates for the general election. Only PML-N awarded party tickets to women during the last general and local bodies (LB) elections. Out of 1,450 contestants, all those elected were men. There are 13 women lawmakers in the incumbent Provincial Assembly of Balochistan. A woman lawmaker represents nearly 358,292 women in the Assembly whereas each male lawmaker represents

105,186 men.⁴⁵Zubaida Jalal Khan is a prominent name in politics and has served as the Federal Minister of Education (2002-2007) and she points out that there is no strong political women's movement in Balochistan.⁴⁶ In 2015, Rahila Hameed Durrani, of PML-N was unanimously elected as the first-ever female deputy speaker of the Balochistan Assembly.

Table 17: Nature of Barriers in Women's Voting

| Danniana | Fre | Frequency of highlighted Barriers | | | | | | | |
|--------------------|-------------|-----------------------------------|-----|-----|--------|-------|--|--|--|
| Barriers | Balochistan | FATA | ICT | KP | Punjab | Sindh | | | |
| Cultural Barriers | 12 | 19 | | 379 | 25 | 5 | | | |
| Systemic Barriers | 22 | 24 | | 591 | 25 | 17 | | | |
| Religious Barriers | 3 | 5 | | 19 | 1 | 1 | | | |
| Other Barriers | 21 | 35 | 2 | 629 | 28 | 16 | | | |

Source: STAEP Progress Report, FAFEN 2013

According to the Secretary for Local Government and Rural Development (LGRD) in Ouetta. currently all seats at council levels, including reserved seats, are occupied. Women who are serving in the Union Councils reportedly submit proposals for sewing machines and solar panels, while men tend to request funds for roads, sewerage and street lights. In some districts like Barkhan, Baloch women have no voice in public matters. In Quetta and Makran Division, the LGRD officials report that women are vocal and bring their complaints to the LGRD Secretary themselves. In Makran, a woman has won her seat as a direct candidate, confirming the political differences across ethnic Balochistan observed in the introduction. Training at the local government level should encourage more creative possibilities and projects that break gender stereotypes and for which women submit proposals and which aim to reduce the burden of domestic chores. Energy and water are two 'masculine' sectors even though women's work is directly dependent on these sources. More women need to be encouraged to develop skills and knowledge and be involved in infrastructural projects. Data on union council proceedings is available but only in terms of staff employed in each development scheme and whether a project has been completed or not. There is no qualitative data on the impact of development schemes at council levels. At the moment, only municipal functions have been devolved. Respondents for this Analysis agree that Members of the Provincial Assembly (MPA) are not keen on any transformative reform – just gradual ones. One UC chairperson from Barkan reports that the budget for LGRD often does not get passed by Councils and the GoB does not provide them with too many facilities. All respondents for this Analysis recommended that the Musalihat e Anjuman (Dispute Resolution Councils) should be reintroduced by the Provincial Assembly since these enabled local level decision-making and quick resolutions that were acceptable to communities. There were also recommendations that MPA development funds should be redirected (at least, a higher proportion) to UC levels. Qualitative data at UC level needs to be collected,

⁴⁵ "Performance of Women Legislators," Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN) report on Performance of Balochistan Assembly's Women Legislators (June 2013 to February 2017).

⁴⁶ Interview in Quetta, 4th Dec 2017.

documented and analysed to assess the specific involvement and opportunities for women's empowerment within local government across the districts.

There is comparatively lower resistance to women's voting in Balochistan despite the overall limitations of patriarchal attitudes. The larger challenges to women's political participation begin after the casting of votes when women are not permitted to be in public offices or represent communities, tribes or take on leadership roles. Literacy and levels of education have direct co-relations with not just family planning, reproductive health but even with local level political decision-making and advancement. Notes Bari, "women [councilors] who were working at the district and tehsil level who had relatively higher level of education, political exposure and economic background, were more effective in performing their political roles and responsibilities" (Bari, 2010). Overall, studies show that this co-relation translated into differences in councilor experience and effectiveness such that, where women councilors were least literate (Balochistan and Sindh), they were unable to tap into or engage effectively with the Local Government structures whereas, in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and Punjab, the levels of education played a vital role for the councilor's involvement and effectiveness.

Table 18: Reasons for Low Turnout of Women Voters in Balochistan, 2013

| Reasons of Low Turnout 🌑 🚳 | | | | | |
|---|---------------------------------------|-------|--|--|--|
| Issues | No of Polling Stations with Issues | % | | | |
| Family/tribal or caste coercion | 413 | 73.5% | | | |
| Unregistered women | 253 | 45.0% | | | |
| Unawareness of Vote casting procedure | 207 | 36.8% | | | |
| Distance and accessibility | 204 | 36.3% | | | |
| General security situation | 201 | 35.8% | | | |
| Unfavorable environment of polling station | 191 | 34.0% | | | |
| Agreement among all political parties | 139 | 24.7% | | | |
| Disbelief in democracy and democratic system/political indifference | 98 | 17.4% | | | |
| Lack of education | 31 | 5.5% | | | |
| Specific threat to voters particularly women voters | 31 | 5.5% | | | |
| Persuasion by religious leaders | 30 | 5.3% | | | |
| General ban on the mobility of women in area | 25 | 4.4% | | | |
| Use of Unfair Means | 13 | 2.3% | | | |
| No work for women welfare | 12 | 2.1% | | | |
| Democratic boycott | 9 | 1.6% | | | |
| Time constraints | 9 | 1.6% | | | |
| Misallocation of women voters | 7 | 1.2% | | | |
| Displacement and migration | 2 | 0.4% | | | |
| Unavailability of male members of family to accompany to polling area | 2 | 0.4% | | | |

Source: FAFEN, Reasons for Women Not Voting in 2013 elections in Balochistan.

Women's participation in formal political leadership roles needs to be encouraged through political training that connects the benefits of their inclusion in political decision-making.

Examples from other provinces and of women Parliamentarians and leaders in Balochistan should be included in such training. Visits by these politicians across constituencies will serve as a good exercise to illustrate the importance and possibility of women's political empowerment.

h. Cross-cutting themes

1. Baseline Findings for Balochistan (2012)

The Aurat Foundation National Baseline Study for Gender Equity Program (2012) classifies the pressure on women into frequent pregnancies due to the husband's wish to have more male children, as a form of sexual violence. In this attitudinal survey, 19% of women respondents (24% male) in Balochistan were of the opinion that women should not be given equal rights and opportunities, with a majority (62%) of respondents simply arguing that 'women are not equal to men' and other arguments offered that 'women are weaker than men' or 'norms and traditions do not allow' or that, 'women are less knowledgeable than men', 'women are less capable' and, 'women make emotionally driven decisions'. The baseline documents that for Balochistan, 65% females and 39% males believed that women should be involved in financial decision-making.

On the right to choice in marriage in Balochistan, 25% female respondents and 38% male responded in the negative. Similarly, on the issue of women's right to divorce, only 39% female and 31% male were in favour of this. While 83% females and 66% males agreed that a female should be given dowry, a far lower response was in favour of women's right to decide the bride price as part of the marriage contract (30% female and 20% male respondents). This is in keeping with the Baloch tradition of marital economic transactions which are less about women's rights and more about male-defined monetary exchange.

More than 50% of both males and females respondents at the national level agreed that girls should participate in regional, national and international sporting events but interestingly, in Balochistan, 60% females polled favoured participation with just 29% of men agreeing to this proposal. This interest should be encouraged as part of community development for women. Currently, the provincial budget for sport and recreation is one of the lowest and half that of religious affairs and does not feature women's sport within it.

According to this Aurat Foundation baseline survey, not a very high percentage of male or female respondents were opposed to the idea of women being Heads of State. Nationally, only 34% male and 17% female respondents said that women should not be the Heads of State and in Balochistan, 17% female and 20% male give a negative response in this regard. Balochistan has one of the highest rates of casting votes in the country and correspondingly, in this baseline survey, 93% women and 91% male reported having exercised their right to vote and that barriers are low to this end (the caveat being that most of the population boycott national elections). Some 82% female and 65% male in Balochistan were aware of women's right to inheritance but only 32% female and 45% male acknowledge that this is being exercised in any practical manner.

According to the baseline, in theory, a large percentage of women respondents in contrast to men agreed that women should have access to the various institutions of justice such as police stations, lawyer, and court, informal systems of justice, feudal lords, human rights organisations and media. However, in pragmatic terms, very few actually exercised this right

and even less admitted that they would actually move the courts for dispute resolution. This interesting gap between need and practice reflects the failure of public institutions and services as women-friendly. Women officials as respondents in this Gender Analysis confirm this distrust and discrimination as well as verbal and physical intimidation and harassment as common detriments in public sector institutions.

Although there is a low and decreasing acceptance of customary forms of punishments for women accused of sexual transgressions in other provinces, in Balochistan, justifications for such social control of women's behaviour is comparatively higher, with 19% female and 27% male respondents agreeing that punishment for honor crimes is a justified custom and 32% female and 21% male respondents considering *Wanni* or exchange marriage for settling disputes as a justified custom. The baseline also shows the highest incidence of sexual violence reported by respondents in Balochistan (6%) but only 1/6% are said to have reported these crimes.

2. Violence Against Women

The PDHS 2012-2013 finds that the experience of physical violence by women increases with the number of living children (21% of women with no children report having ever experienced physical violence, but 38% among women with five or more children). The experience of physical violence since age 15 generally shows a decrease with educational attainment, from 37% among women with no education to 13% among women with a higher education. All these associated factors intensify the risks of violence against women in the context of Balochistan where birth-rates are higher and literacy rates lowest in the country.

In a study on the impact of violence on women's lives and their access to state shelters, it was found that women approach state institutions only rarely and that too, as a last resort when all proverbial bridges have been burnt (Zia et al. 2011). This is confirmed in the PDHS 2012-13 in the chapter on domestic violence and the reluctance of victims to approach state institutions or offices. Even the men would not approach the courts, the police or government officials if there was a possibility of resolving issues within the community, mostly through informal adjudication/legal systems such as the *Jirga*.

Where state is absent, people find alternative means of governance. The two major processes across rural Pakistan are the *jirga/faislo/panchayat* for administrative governance, and second, marriages for social governance. A study on rural women's disconnect from the state shows that, in order to approach the state, women have to give up on the informal social protection systems that familial- and community-based membership offers them (Brohi 2009). Since these issues are perceived as domestic and private concerns, preventive intervention in communities proves to be difficult and programmes geared towards women's empowerment can prove to be challenging.

The BRDCEP should develop a gender audit of violence against women as part of its baseline and monitoring and evaluation exercises to map the various levels of gender based violence that is prevalent in the target districts. Information on laws for the protection and rights of women should be part of training and information dissemination.

3. Persecution of Minorities

Over the past decade, the Shia Hazara community in Balochistan has been systematically targeted and murdered in gun attacks and bombings including suicide attacks. This community faces the "double jeopardy" of being recognisable through their distinct ethnic features and for belonging to a religious minority sect. In Quetta, there are an estimated half a million Hazaras and the second biggest concentration is in Mach. Between 1999-2013 at least 1,200 Hazaras have been killed in large scale, en route to pilgrimage sites and in direct targeted attacks (HRCP 2013).

The Hazara Democratic Party is a secular political party found in 2003. The founder, Hussain Ali was killed in a terrorist attack in 2008. Members point out that the Hazaras are a liberal community where women do not observe purdah/veiling and many women work. Many women were enrolled in Balochistan University and even as faculty members but currently there are neither. Those who can, seek asylum overseas. 47 Recently, a young woman has taken the unusual step of opening a restaurant in Hazara town in Quetta that is run for and by women only. This is a courageous entrepreneurial step in the traditionally male-dominant public sector. She runs an organisation by the name of HuratyyaNiswa and her cause is worthy of support while she would be an invaluable source and role-model for women's enterprise and development.⁴⁸

The Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP 2013) reports that there has been a substantial migration of religious minorities out of the province due to intimidation, violence and intolerance. Theft, kidnapping, forced conversion and abduction for ransom is common amongst vulnerable minority communities. Although, disappearances of dissidents has caught the attention of human rights organisations in Pakistan for many years, this practice has come under regular scrutiny of activists since 2007 and has taken a brutal turn since 2010. Voice for Baloch Missing Persons is a group that works for the recovery, and with the families, of those who have forcibly disappeared.

4. Terrorist Attacks in Recent Years

The Sardar Bahaddur Khan Women's University bus was bombed in 2013, killing students and injuring many. The suicide bombings of the Bolan Medical Complex also took a heavy toll on the province. The police note that the majority of the suicide bombers have been young men exploited by terrorist organisations. The presence of paramilitary forces, such as the Frontier Constabulary (FC), is a source of deep anxiety and oppression for citizens and there is considerable grievance and suspicion that these forces exploit cross-border smuggling and resource usurpation in the province.

https://tribune.com.pk/story/1534555/1-a-restaurant-in-hazara-town-is-for-women-by-women/.

⁴⁷ Qaiser Butt (2014) "Losing Ground: 30,000 Hazaras Fled Balochistan in Five Years," Express Tribune, April 12. https://tribune.com.pk/story/694559/losing-ground-30000-hazaras-fled-balochistan-in-five-years/. ⁴⁸ Hafsa Sarfaraz (2017) "A Restaurant in Quettas Hazara Town is By Women, For Women," Express Tribune, Nov 13.

5. Civil Society Organisations Working on Gender Issues

There is little or no evidence of cases seeking recourse for domestic violence from either the police or courts and the more precarious cases are almost always dealt with in informal tribunals or *jirgas*. Some organisations such as, SEHAR, CPD and We The Humans are working on human rights issues. The Ministry of Human Rights admits that its ascribed role is to monitor, supervise and collect data only. In the recent Turbat killings,⁴⁹ the department was asked to collect information but in routine matters there is no data on how many disabled persons or home-based workers reside in Balochistan. The concept of human rights is narrow and relies on press information rather than receiving complaints or investigating cases. Occasionally, events on violence against women include the Ministry of Human Rights but otherwise, its role remains rather vague and under-developed. The Ministry reports that it has no district focal points and no connection to the issue of enforced disappearances which is considered to be Balochistan's main human rights challenge. According to the Ministry, First Information Reports of crimes are rarely registered in the province, indicating the privatisation of dispute resolution within tribes or communities.

Since 1998, the Institute for Development Studies and Practices in Quetta has offered courses in development leadership to women through a coded educational programme that is based and prepared around the districts that learners belong to. Apart from leadership, the IDSP works on maternal mortality, human rights advocacy and literacy for change and has invaluable resources for community level training and pedagogy which can benefit projects based across Balochistan.

5. Case-study of Village Wali Shah, Killa Abdullah

The Gender Analysis team conducted a field visit to Kill Abdullah which qualifies as the district with the lowest score on the Multivariate Poverty Index (Planning Commission, UNDP, Oxford Policy and Human Development Initiative (2016), "Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan"). The case-study below outlines the findings from the Focus Groups Discussions held with women in the village of Wali Shah. These reveal the correlation between gender, poverty, lack of empowerment (reproductive and decision-making) and challenges to women's mobility in rural Balochistan. The findings also suggest that there is some opportunity for BRDCEP to work with a younger generation of women in these villages provided health and education facilities are improved to afford time and well-being. A separate FGD held with male community support organisers disclosed that men are willing to involve women in development schemes but tend to blame them for not being educated or knowledgeable enough to participate on par with men from the communities.

A Pushto speaking community. There are seven households in this hamlet. Women use donkeys for drawing water out of tube-wells, which is two hours of travel time on average. There is no electricity in the village but solar panel installations allow for some lighting. No TV or electronic media connectivity.

⁴⁹ Muhammad Zafar (2017) "Five Men From Punjab Found Dead in Kech, *Express Tribune*, Nov 15th. https://tribune.com.pk/story/1559105/1-15-bullet-riddled-bodies-found-turbat/.

BRSP has a social organiser within the community and there is a school for boys and girls in the village. The various UCs have managed to get 5 functional schools in the district.

All the older women are illiterate. Some younger ones who were born in Karachi have some literacy skills and more awareness.

Livestock is used for domestic use only. The main economic activity is done by the men as field labourers.

The nearest Basic Health Unit (BHU) is half an hour away and there are no midwives that service the village. Both women (and later men in their FGD) report at least one maternal death per household in the district. Participants report that they have no awareness or exposure to family planning methodology or about reproductive rights. Most deliveries take place within the home and vaccinations are done by government officials who visit the village routinely.

The majority of the women in the village are in polygamous marriages and many of them have borne eight children on average. Participants expressed discontentment with the polygamous arrangement but report that they have no say in the matter. Although, the women report they are both supported by the husband, he has a separate room and is served by both wives. Respondents say since men have two wives, they do not despair if one should die.

The annual income of men per household is Rs. 20-25,000. Men control the income and household purchases. Some women do some poultry work and sell eggs through a middleman. The money they earn through any activity, including handmade stringed belts, are savings towards daughters' marriages. Men own property but women do not.

Women's main activities focus on childcare, housework, livestock care, fetching water. Decision-makers are the male heads of the household. Most of the women report that they have no status and are not consulted on any decisions. One woman reports that she does have some authority.

All women have CNICs through a National Database Registration Authority (NADRA) mobile van facility that issued these to them. About six or seven women in the district receive the BISP fund – one recipient is from this village. She reports that the BISP amount is hers and she does not pool it in the household expenses but keeps it for herself.

Women say they vote for Achakzai because he is their elder and with hope that he will introduce development for their village.

Men have mobile phones but women are not allowed to own these. Some women report that they secretly own one and use these to communicate with their parents or siblings. They purchase a balance for their phones from nearby shops or their brothers transfer

amounts via mobile networks directly on their phones. They hide these from their husbands and communicate in discretion.

Participants report domestic violence as routine especially triggered when men come home tired and irate or if there is lack of water in the house. Women's dispute are resolved internally for they report that if men get involved, things become worse and there is tension within the wider community. For larger disputes (not often women related) a *iiraa* of elders makes decisions.

Only one of the women participant reports that she has been to Quetta city – others cite there is no form of leisure activity envisioned in their lives.

The women's priority demands include, supply of gas, electricity, schools and hospitals (especially clinics) and some market access for their handicraft skills. They sew their children's clothes and all energies are spent on household chores.

There are several opportunities to experiment with creative and non-traditional gender empowerment strategies in villages such as, Wali Shah. Following a time-survey that maps women's work and allocated roles, women must be included in any micro hydro and/or power related projects and trained to be solar engineers and provided skills in renewable energy initiatives. This relieves women's time burden and has shown success in rural India. Other initiatives for improving women's livelihood have been planned by BRSP and these should be pursued along the broader findings and recommendations suggested in this Analysis.

6. Analysis of the GoB Gender Policy Action Plan (2016-2019)

This section offers some brief and overall observations on the Gender Policy Action Plan (2016) for the Government of Balochistan. This was developed in 2013 through a consultative process that included several stakeholders and the technical assistance of several organisations including UN Women, which works closely with the Women's Development Department. The Policy is largely inspired by the previous large scale Gender Reform Action Plan and while several respondents for this Analysis felt that the consultations have been hurried and inconsistent, the final policy document is impressive in its attention to detail, identified goals and specified benchmarks. It is however, very ambitious. The Gender Policy Action Plan identifies eight broad goals, each of which include training, establishments of desks and gender cells in at least four governmental departments, the building of hostel facilities, shelters, expansion of economic opportunities, vocational and home-based training, apart from a range of other objectives and most of which are meant to be achieved within the time frame of 2018. Respondents from UN Women and parliamentarians interviewed⁵¹ for this Analysis suggest this is a timely moment to revisit

⁵⁰ Bhowmick, N. (2011). The women of India's Barefoot College bring light to remote villages. The Guardian. Retrieved from http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2011/jun/24/india-barefoot-college-solar-power-training
⁵¹ Based on interviews held with Rehana Khilji of UN Women, Parliamentarian, Yasmin Lehri and Zubaida Jalal (Board member of BRSP).

the Gender Policy Action Plan since all policies require alignment with the SDGs. However, respondents point out the following challenges in this regard;

- first, there has been little progress on the fairly ambitious policy. Policy progress in the WDD has been stagnant because too many officials still consider women's issues to be secondary and the women's ministry is not a priority on the Chief Minister's list of urgent concerns,
- further, the WDD reportedly has no outreach in the various districts. It has recently asked for the notification of Gender Cells in the districts but the main outreach has remained limited to establishing women's shelters in two districts of Sibi and Khuzdar. Much of the progress depends on strong leadership and a committed Secretary and as one respondent put it, "It is better to have no minister rather than a weak or disinterested one,"
- a third concern is that the human resources required to meet policy ends are not adequate for undertaking many of the tasks. For example, there are no women in the Monitoring and Evaluation department and this makes simple tasks such as access to the state women's shelters (*Dar ul Amans* only accessible to women) impossible. Therefore, a monitoring exercise cannot be conducted.

The advice of these stakeholders is that the WDD should be considered on par with other departments and a Director General should assist the Secretary. All the respondents for this Analysis opined that the Department should be led by a woman. Very recently, a few skilled women have been recruited in the department and capacity building is essential for this staff. It was also recommended that the Department of Social Welfare and Women's Development Department work closely and that the appointment of the Balochistan Commission on the Status of Women will be very useful. While this is imminent, the experts caution on the importance of clarity on the role and mandate of each entity so as to avoid overlaps or repetition in projects and responsibility.

The respondents also suggest that the Planning and Development Department needs a Gender Unit within it and a gender expert working with the Chief Economist. Gender programming is often included in projects but it is not institutionalised. These experts argue that the GoB needs to reclaim the projects as soon as donors exit, otherwise all the effort and training is lost. In their opinion, the LGRD level training is weak and the practice of putting men into positions of Gender Focal Points often doesn't sit well because these men feel it is a soft position or a sign of being undervalued within government. Jalal feels small tasks like fixing the post office in Kech are important because they are symbolic of the government's writ and the absence of repair and preservation invites anti-social behaviour and lawlessness.

The Directors of Social Welfare and the Women's Development Department feel their departments should be a merged. According to the GoB Finance Department information, the WDD has one of the lowest budgetary allocations for 2016-17 but it also documents no expenditure in the budgetary year. The department receives considerable support and guidance from UN Women but needs strong, independent and sustained guidance to be effective and to progress on the Gender Policy Action Plan.

The WDD is working on some immediate projects to consolidate its infrastructure as well as programmatic outreach. The Department needs considerable support and guidance at this time. The recommendations below include suggestions for institutional and programmatic strengthening.

7. Analysis of Implementing Partner's Gender Policy

In a Focus Group Discussion, all present members of BRSP shared their insight regarding weaknesses and strengths in the gender mainstreaming and equality efforts within BRSP and the communities/implementing partners with whom they work.

The challenges they identified included the following;

- 1. Despite possible opportunities to promote women's rights, 'culture' has become almost an excuse to exclude active mobilisation of women's rights issues into programmes,
- 2. Hiring women in the field for leading programmes is a difficult task but varies across districts and depends on the commitment of mobilisers,
- 3. UC discrepancies are so diverse that a uniform programmatic approach is impossible and results regarding gender can vary unpredictably,
- 4. Women entrepreneurs are dependent on men to access markets,
- 5. Sometimes training on enterprise is given to men under the above pragmatic recognition but there should be a correction in this practice,
- 6. Regular meetings within BRSP are not held on gender issues,
- 7. Evaluation officers are unable to monitor all programmes for gender outcomes. The dependency is on the Gender Focal Point,
- 8. Departments responsible for programmes and Monitoring and Evaluation are separated but need strengthening in order to assess and bridge gaps on gender objectives,
- 9. Although BRSP has a Gender Coordinator and Gender Focus Persons in districts, there is a need for Equal Opportunity Officers across the various arms of the organisation. (A Gender Coordinator is responsible for facilitating organisational change at the structural level with regard to the culture of gender equality; Equal Opportunity Officers would focus on equality within the organisation's personnel. Human Resources, and Monitoring and Evaluation departments would benefit from ensuring the gender parity in hiring of staff and equal opportunity officers in each department would be responsible rather than one gender coordinator checking on each project for the maintenance of gender parity).

The areas identified for improving overall gender mainstreaming within BRSP included;

- 1. The gender advisor needs to ensure that gender considerations shape all aspects of project interventions from design, solicitation, hiring, budgeting to monitoring and evaluation.
- 2. A gender profile of every target district is needed and based on this the deeper investigative questions should include;
- a. How can the programme by-pass the literacy requirement?
- b. Can financial ownership to women afford them some mobility?
- c. Can new sectoral approaches be introduced rather than the same traditional ones?

- d. A strong gender sensitisation programme targeted at men is required. How can it be tailor-made?
- e. What are the specific opportunities and challenges for each Gender Focal Point?
- 3. A draft of the Project Implementation Manual has been prepared for the BRDCEP, and the consultant has identified areas for gender mainstreaming and equality in its design and content (see appendices). The final version should be scrutinised once again.

8. Recommendations from this Gender Analysis

Overall and governmental:

- 1. A comprehensive Gender Profile of all districts of Balochistan by a third party would be tremendously beneficial for government, donors and NGOs alike. This should be conducted in partnership with local organisations to ensure security measures are in place. This need not be expansive but could use existing tools and data and methods applied by other programmatic interventions such as those conducted by Alif Ailaan on education, the ASER reports, the data collected by Fair and Free Election, the BISP on poverty. The questionnaire and design of the Gender Profiling would stress on qualitative data rather than repeating the quantitative details that already exist.
- 2. There is a dearth of research on the province overall and several studies need to be commissioned in an organised and academic manner. These should be equally devoted to women's and marginalised people's lives.
- 3. The GoB would benefit from monthly departmental meetings devoted to gender issues across their portfolios. The WDD could host these as part of its mandate to ensure gender is a cross-cutting theme. The Chief Minister and leadership of the province should be invited to be part of these to ensure the issue is taken seriously down the hierarchy.
- 4. The GoB requires several gender experts in key positions and in the departments related to the sectors identified in this Analysis. The Planning and Development Department needs a Gender Unit within it and a gender expert working with the Chief Economist. A series of seminars bringing in experts from the country (chairs of Commissions on Women but also independent experts) could assist in advising how to overcome bureaucratic hurdles towards filling in vacancies, evaluating these and managing the financing of the plans in the Gender Action Policy in a more concerted manner.
- 5. Women in Balochistan are rarely visible in public enterprise. In order to create spaces for, and encourage women entrepreneurs to enter into public activities, symbolism and actual policies are important. Initiatives such as the Hazara Women's Restaurant in Quetta need support but rather than direct financial aid, it would be useful to support activities like cooking competitions and shows on TV hosted by the restaurant chefs or on site, since such morning shows are very popular viewing for women in Pakistan. This would lend broader goodwill and promote the visibility of women's work and women's enterprise in Balochistan. Products made and sold by women in the target BRDCEP districts could be sold from the restaurant. In this way, such a project will not be limiting itself to reinforcing a stereotype of women cooking

but will have some status attached to the enterprise. USAID has taken such initiatives in Sindh where women produce block-printed crafts and these are advertised through TV shows to encourage sales of Sindhi women's crafts in urban centres. Bakeries and spin-offs at district levels in Balochistan can be encouraged and taught through a culinary school. While this may not directly involve rural communities, any encouragement of women's autonomy in non-traditional enterprises in urban centres will reinforce the symbolism of women's productive presence in public spaces and is likely to provide credibility to the notion of women's economic activities in other parts of the province.

- 6. This Analysis finds that sporting activities are popular in Balochistan and women show interest in sports. Physical training camps should be set up and visits by the Pakistan Women's Cricket team and individual sportswomen made as part of a series of activities to raise awareness and encourage women to participate.
- 7. Violence and discrimination and methods to overcome these along with a short history of the women's movement of Pakistan should be inbuilt in all designs of community development programmes. A gender audit of violence across BRDCEP districts should be carried out. Also, the array of protective laws and policies and methods of accessing the state should be demystified in educational and information-related material developed for the BRDCEP.

Gender research and training methods:

- 8. Detailed data, research and expertise in gender-related fields are sparse or missing for Balochistan. A Research Colloquium for Balochistan with academics, researchers and experts in select fields and identified themes would be timely and useful.
- 9. It would be useful to animate the various gender policies that exist on paper into interactive web-based slide sessions that are punctuated with quizzes which could be mandatory training for governmental and non-governmental staff. This could expand the idea of gender beyond the sexual harassment law as this is the only one that currently involves training modules.
- 10. This Analysis finds that women in leadership position (such as the Deputy Speaker of the Assembly) make a difference in strengthening gender-based policies and in passing laws. There should be political mobilisation for the passing of the pending laws but also assistance at district levels to ensure that awareness is disseminated on these. The BRDCEP training modules should include all the recent gender laws and policies passed at the provincial level so that district-level awareness and methods of recourse are understood widely,
- 11. Union Council training sessions for women should include meetings with women Parliamentarians to encourage dialogue and to learn across the various tiers of governance.
- 12. Collection of qualitative information regarding gender disparity and needs should be part of Union Council data. At the moment only municipal project related activities are accounted for, but there is a need to collect the demands and needs of women and socially excluded populations at council levels.

Mainstreaming gender at community level:

- 13. All training for strengthening capacities for local government authorities and community development organisations must ensure that separate toilets and rest areas, separate public transport for women are provided and that timetables should meet women's needs and be child-friendly.
- 14. The restitution of the *Musalihat e Anjuman* (dispute resolution councils) is being considered by the GoB and this is an opportunity to ensure that women's voices are clearly and strongly represented in these bodies and the proceedings are monitored.
- 15. Currently, district level initiatives do involve the various departments in meetings, but a cohesive plan for reducing gender disparities is often not part of these planning meetings. The emphasis on gender inclusion (understood as including women) should be shifted to a focus on reduction of gender disparities as a goal or benchmark. The indicators associated with a reduction in the disparity between men and women, girls and boys are important and all projects should build these into their design carefully.
- 16. Given the low levels of literacy among women, a module that offers nutritional literacy should be developed for community women based on local experiences and dietary conditions. These should be pictorial and relevant to the district.
- 17. The design of all programmes should be preceded by a district profile which assesses the potential for women's economic activities based on crops, availability of resources and access to markets. A survey of women's work (their responsibilities and how they use their time), decision-making, and development across the districts, especially of agricultural and livestock-related work, can serve as a valuable baseline for all future programming.
- 18. The establishment of women's weekly/monthly markets in districts should be planned with the involvement of women in communities site, access route, products and security concerns should be included in such planning. Transportation needs must be accounted in the design of all projects.
- 19. Tailor-made training for women on savings, financial planning and budgeting should be built in to any entrepreneurial scheme.
- 20. School buildings in the select districts (e.g., Wali Khan Village in Killa Abdullah) may double-up to serve as clinics after school hours or on a monthly basis. BHUs are urgently required in all districts.
- 21. Imaginative and creative online training may be considered and designed for health, finances, disaster- and water management, WASH and union council services. Small-scale initiatives such as, 'Engage Pakistan' based in Lahore prepare several animated videos and training material aimed at educating citizens and are well-versed with audience needs (see engagepakistan.com and https://m.facebook.com/story.php?story.fbid=529127170778026&id=408642079493203&rdr for examples). The guidelines for such educational material may be selected from the above analysis including, countering myths about contraceptives; how to save and spend income; livestock veterinary training/animal husbandry; vaccinations for children; preparing for disasters. IDSP material could be animated for educational purposes relevant to Balochistan.

- 22. Training material should include information about the spectrum of ethnically diverse women in Balochistan as a way to introduce and familiarise community members who are limited in mobility and not exposed to the citizenry of their province or indeed, of Pakistan a cultural exchange programme of sorts.
- 23. Fusion crafts that blend traditional craftsmanship with modern products for which there may be a wider market, such as those developed in Chitral under the brand "Polly and Me" should be explored for Balochistan. Marketing and branding experts should be involved in planning and training towards this.

9. Conclusion of the Gender Analysis

The pre-existing conditions outlined in the Analysis above, with a focus on eight sectors reveal some of the challenges that will impact community-level intervention and provide opportunities for gender equality at the same time. Improved and gender inclusive access to food security, health and educational facilities requires more creative outreach methods that need to be explored via technological start-ups, as are being experimented in other provinces. Any improvement for women across these sectors will require a strong gender component within the GoB and for the BRDCEP to develop close working relations with the Women's Development Department. Other donor and governmental projects are looking to increase women's productivity within the traditional sectors of livestock and crafts. However, political education and women's involvement in WASH projects or small enterprises are less developed and potentially more creative opportunities for the BRDCEP to pursue, particularly in developing women's leadership roles on these issues.

The creation of women-friendly markets in each of the local districts rather than farremoved Quetta is also an important consideration for women's engagement with markets. Women's overall mobility should be an objective of any policy or programme. Further, women's leadership in Union Councils, training on saving schemes, financial management, encouragement of role-models and developing consciousness on gender and ethnic issues require the assistance of local and national rights-based organisations. Regular colloquiums should be held in Quetta where gender experts and researchers from across the country are invited and a dialogue series is initiated between government officials, civil society organisations and community members. The purpose would be for a cross-exchange of information, learning and reflection on obstacles, and strategising on ways to expedite women's empowerment across communities in Balochistan.

The recommendations provided in light of this Analysis address suggestions for strengthening gender concerns within governmental and BRSP policies on community development. The suggestions focus on improvement in policy, mainstreaming gender at planning and design stages and emphasis on the need to map districts in order to develop gender profiles. The recommendations also call for more creative planning for gender inclusivity by drawing women into community leadership roles and in non-traditional sectors.

PART TWO: Gender Mainstreaming Strategy for BRDCEP

1. Purposes and Development of a Gender Mainstreaming Strategy

If gender equality is the goal of a programme then gender mainstreaming is the strategy to achieve this goal. The goal for gender equality should be branded in a manner that is easily understood and becomes a common aspiration for BRDCEP members (e.g. 'Empowered Women is an Empowered Balochistan'; 'Balochistan's Rural Women Rising').

Gender mainstreaming means that the perceptions, experience, knowledge and interests of women and men equally should influence policy-making, planning and decision-making. Mainstreaming should situate gender equality issues at the centre of all BRDCEP analyses and policy decisions, medium-term plans, programme budgets, and institutional structures and processes. This requires explicit, systematic attention to relevant gender perspectives in all areas of the work of the BRDCEP Implementing Partners.

Gender mainstreaming is essential for securing human rights and social justice for women and men, but also guarantees gender inclusivity and the integration of gender perspectives in development. This leads to the effective achievement of other social and economic goals. Mainstreaming can reveal a need for changes in goals, strategies and actions to ensure that both women and men can influence, participate in and benefit from development processes. This may lead to changes in organisations – structures, procedures and cultures – to create organisational environments which are conducive to the promotion of gender equality.

Gender mainstreaming is underpinned by six main principles:

- Policy Dialogue;
- Advocacy;
- Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation;
- Sex-Disaggregated Data;
- Gender Parity; and
- Tools and Training.

The broad expected policy and advocacy results with regard to gender mainstreaming include:

- Measurable improvement in gender equality and equity at the national level;
- Gender-sensitive policies driving BRDCEP and those of the Implementing Partners
- Sex-disaggregated data for analysis at district levels;
- Development of effective monitoring systems for gender equality;
- Gender-sensitive communications and advocacy;
- Awareness of gender mainstreaming strategies and goals within BRSP and staff of BRDCEP;
- Inclusion of gender in agenda, programmes and activities;
- Development of communications strategies that raise awareness of gender gaps.

2. Recommendations for Gender Mainstreaming in BRDCEP

Based on the Gender Analysis for BRDCEP, the Indicative Logframe has been revised to ensure gender equality remains an integral and core part of the overall programme and all activities. The purpose is to mainstream gender within the expected policy and advocacy results and meets the goals of BRDCEP for community-level empowerment. The inclusions in the Logframe are guided by these following principles:

- Mainstreaming gender in planning and financing frameworks must be approached systematically.
 It must be incorporated as a standard step in all economic policy planning and evaluation, and needs to be addressed both as a stand-alone goal and as an issue cutting across all other parts of the agenda.
- The gender equality goals of BRDCEP should be tailored to the local situation in each district to have the greatest chance of success but still be connected to provincial gender policies and national laws on women and human rights.
- Consulting women as well as men is essential during the planning phase, such as in the selection of the location of a clinic, school, the building of latrine facilities, to public transportation schemes. This can ensure that the benefits from said projects will be more widespread and equitable. Failure to do this can undermine other programmes aimed at women's empowerment. For example, without access to safe transportation few women will be able to take advantage of vocational training programs.
- A useful analysis tool to utilise is the women's safety audit. It is a participatory research tool that allows women to engage with local government authorities to prevent and respond to sexual harassment and other forms of gender-based violence in public spaces.
- A qualitative baseline should assess actors who oppose and support change and progress for women. Enlisting men as agents of change for and champions of gender equality is an important component at organisational and community levels. The GM strategy should emphasise the following;
 - benefits of gender equality for all individual men,
 - the importance of equal sharing of domestic responsibilities, such as "father work" and men's positive roles in raising and caring for their children,
 - the need to teach boys about gender-equitable relations and human rights, communications, negotiation, and care-giving skills.
- Gender mainstreaming strategies need to be constantly aware of underlying socio-cultural factors that may be skewing programme results in ways for which sex-disaggregated data alone cannot account or explain.
- Strategies must go beyond simply trying to increase women's labour force participation rates. This is crucial so that expanded opportunities in the labour market do not simply result in an added burden and further time poverty on the part of women.

The Logframe below is the BRSP Logframe. The general format of all the BRDCEP Component 1 Logframes follow approximately the same format, which is also the format of the Programme Logframe and the TA project Logframe. The proposed additions regarding gender are indicated in yellow.

| Intervention logic | Indicators | Baselines (incl. reference year) | Targets (incl. reference year) | Sources and means of verification | Assumptions |
|---|---|--|---|--|--|
| To support the Government of Balochistan in reducing the negative impact of economic deprivation, poverty and social inequality, environmental degradation and climate change, and to turn this into opportunities to build and empower resilient communities participating actively in identifying and implementing socio-economic development activities on a sustainable basis in partnership with local | Reduction in the national and Balochistan poverty levels as defined by the Government of Pakistan An increase in the country's Human Development Index (HDI) score % of population, segregated by gender, in the targeted areas with improved incomes; % of population, segregated by gender, in the targeted areas graduating from lowest to upper population of the property segregated (PSC) hand. | 2017: To be determined at baseline definition | 2022: at least 25% of the targeted poor household see an improvement in their incomes; at least 50% of the beneficiaries are women. 2022: at least 50% increase in women's incomes and reduction in gender disparity in incomes | Third-party socio- economic baseline, mid- term and end-line surveys, Women enumerators part of survey team Programme mid-term and final evaluations; Progress reports and monitoring data inclusive of gender-based evaluations; | No security risks arise due to law and order situation; Project Funding and support of Government is continued throughout the project period; No natural calamities occur; |
| authorities. To reduce gender gaps and disparities and increase participation of women and socially excluded groups in community practises, livelihood and social justice. | poverty scorecard (PSC) band levels; % of population, segregated by gender, with improved access to basic social services in targeted areas; | | 2022: at least 40% of the households graduate from the lowest to upper poverty score card band levels (0-11 score); 50% of these are women 2022: at least 50% of the | Comparison of pre and post intervention poverty scorecard data of the targeted households with a focus on women's poverty status; Comparison of baseline | |
| | Sustainable reduction in gender inequalities in targeted areas resulted from the implementation of gender-sensitive interventions; A policy framework, accompanied by PFM reform process, for community-led development, is adopted and operationalised by the Government of Balochistan; | 2017: none | households of the targeted areas report improved access to basic social services; 50 % of these are women with a focus on improved mobility too. 2022: at least 50% of members of CIs and beneficiaries of socio-economic interventions are women; | and end-line statistics that include gender disaggregated findings; GoP and GoB Statistics, and GoB Budget documents and GoB Gender Action Policy Balochistan PEFA | |
| SO 1: To empower citizens and communities and provide them | % of community organisations (men, women and mix) meeting the | 2017: To be determined at | 2018-19: policy framework for community-led development adapted, and PFM reform process initiated based on the 2016 PEFA; 2022: 70% community organisations (men, women and | Third-party socio- economic baseline, mid- | No security risks arise due to law and order situation; |

| with means enabling them to implement community-driven socio-economic development interventions, an increased voice and capability to influence public policy decision making through active engagement with local authorities for quality, inclusive, and equitable service delivery, and civic-oversight | minimum acceptable thresholds on the Institutional Maturity Index; Extent of change in citizen's perception of their involvement in local governance processes; Extent of change in citizen's perception of the quality and access to services; Number and percentage of women and men who attend participatory | baseline definition 2017: no baseline 2017: no baseline | mix) meet the minimum acceptable thresholds on the Institutional Maturity Index; 2022: 50% improvement in the citizens' perception of their involvement in local governance processes; 2022: 40% increase in the targeted population (70% of the poor and women) reporting improved access to basic social services (including separate toilets and rest areas, separate public transport, timetables to meet women's and children's needs, priority seating, child- | term and end-line surveys that include women enumerators; Programme mid-term and final evaluations; Progress reports and monitoring data that measure Comparison of pre and post intervention poverty scorecard data of the targeted households; GoP and GoB Statistics; | All Union councils remain accessible for programme implementation; No difficulty of access to project area due to harsh geographic /climatic conditions; No natural calamities occur Government is supportive of the programme & accepts participative development approaches; Citizens remain willing to become members of representative bodies |
|--|--|---|--|--|--|
| | Number of women involved in decision-making and changes made due to their interventions/suggestions; Evidence of increase in women's voice, agency and participation in UC deliberations and budget allocations | | 2022: community-local authorities interaction covered by a policy framework; 2022: 50% attendees are women and evidence of consultation is documented 2022: 50% increase in women's participation in UC decisions, proposals and budget allocation | Qualitative data on women's consultations and contributions to proceedings. | community institutions; Dispute resolution mechanisms are in place and inclusive of protection for women |
| SO 2: To foster an enabling environment for strengthening the capacities of local authorities to manage and involve communities in the statutory processes of the local | A Policy Framework for community-driven participative local development is adopted and operationalised; Statutory local public sector | 2017: none 2017: none | 2018-19: Policy framework for community-led development adopted and operationalised; Joint public sector local development plans developed in | GoB notifications and budget documents Government, TA, and IP progress reports; Third-party baseline, mid- | GoB remains supportive of the community-driven local development initiatives; GoB fully owns and leads PFM Reform process |

| public sector planning, financing and implementation process | planning, financing, and implementation is jointly undertaken by the local authorities and targeted communities; Extent of change in citizen's (female, male and transgender) perception of their involvement in local governance processes; Extent of change in citizen's perception of the quality and access to services; | 2017: none 2017: none | participation of communities and local authorities; 2022: 50% improvement in the citizens' perception of their involvement in local governance processes; 2022: 40% increase in the targeted population (70% of the poor) reporting improved access to basic social services; | term and endline surveys; Programme mid-term and final evaluations; Progress reports and monitoring data; | Long-term GoB engagement for PFM reform; |
|---|--|---|---|---|--|
| ER 1: Establishment and empowerment of a three-tiered participative system of federated Community Organisations (COs) at community, village and UC levels capable of development needs identification & prioritisation, development planning, resource mobilisation, and execution, and operation & maintenance of community infrastructures. | % of population, segregated by gender, in the targeted areas brought into organised fold through formation of COs-VOs-LSOs (three-tiered) echelons; % of community organisations (men, women and mix) meeting the minimum acceptable thresholds on the Institutional Maturity Index; % of community organisations having developed VDPs and UCDPs, and resource mobilisation strategies, in partnership with local authorities; % of community organisations having established O&M mechanisms for community managed infrastructure sub-projects; % increase in the targeted population, segregated by gender, | 2017: no baseline 2017: no baseline 2017: no baseline 2017: no baseline | 1 1 | term and end-line surveys, programme mid-term and | No security risks arise due to law and order situation; No difficulty of access to project area due to harsh geographic /climatic conditions; No natural calamities occur Government is supportive of the programme & accepts participative development approaches; Citizens remain willing to become members of representative bodies Local government remains willing to engage with these community institutions; |

| | reporting improved access to basic social services; | 2017: no baseline | to basic social services; | | |
|---|--|--|---|--|---|
| ER 2: Increased capacity of citizens, communities, and marginalised groups, particularly women, to assert their rights and hold local | % of community organisations (men, women and mix) meeting the minimum acceptable thresholds on the Institutional Maturity Index; | 2017: To be determined at baseline definition | 2022: 70% community organisations (men, women and mix) meet the minimum acceptable thresholds on the Institutional Maturity Index; | Third-party baseline, mid- term and end-line surveys, programme mid-term and final evaluations; | Citizens remain willing to become members of representative bodies; Local government remains |
| authorities accountable by engaging them in joint participatory development planning and execution for a | Extent of change in citizen's perception of the quality and access to services and infrastructure; | 2017: none | | Progress reports and monitoring data; Comparison of pre and | willing to engage with these community institutions; No natural calamities occur; |
| more relevant and efficient public service delivery. | Extent of change in citizen's perception of their involvement in local governance processes; Percentage of female and male office-bearers on various committees | 2017: none | access to services received; 2022: 50% population, segregated by gender, express satisfaction with their involvement in local governance processes; | post intervention poverty score card data of the targeted households; GoP and GoB Statistics; Comparison of baseline and end-line statistics; | |
| | Number of village and UC development plans developed in partnership with local authorities; | 2017: To be determined at inception phase | 2022: 100% community organisations institutions (VOs and LSOs) have developed VDPs and UCDPs in partnership with local authorities; | | |
| | Number of community-LA joint accountability forums held; | 2017: none | 2022: 112 community-LA accountability forums held. | | |
| | % increase in quantum of resources mobilised from other sources than the government for projects prioritised in development planning; | 2017: none | 2022: At least 10% of the development plans resources mobilised from other sources other than the government investments; | | |
| | Number of women trained in any/all of the above The inclusion of material on gender sensitisation and emphasis on goals | | 2022: 70% of women supported to become aware of their economic, labor, and human rights | | |
| | for women's empowerment in capacity building planning and training | | 2020: 50% women empowered to play an | | |

| | Establishment of women-friendly local markets in districts. Increased support by men for women's economic and human rights | | increased decision-making role in their households and communities 2020: 70% women empowered to play a greater role in the management of local markets _a 2020: 70% men support women's economic and human rights. | | |
|--|---|--|--|--|---|
| ER 3: Improved access of communities, particularly women and marginalised groups, to quality public services and benefit from climate-resilient community infrastructures and productive assets planned implemented and maintained jointly with local authorities. | % increase in population, segregated by gender, accessing basic social services at community, village, UC and district levels; % of community organisations having functional CPIs; % CPIs compliant with environmental and climate resilience standards; Extent of change in citizen's | 2017: To be determined at baseline definition | 2022: 40% increase in population, segregated by gender, (at least 70% poor) accessing basic social and public services at community, village, UC and district levels; 2022: 90% of the 211 CPIs are functional and maintained by the community organisations jointly with local authorities; 2022: 100% of the CPIs completed in accordance with | Third-party baseline, mid- term and end-line surveys, programme mid-term and final evaluations; Progress reports and monitoring data; Comparison of pre and post intervention poverty score card data of the targeted households; GoP and GoB Statistics; Comparison of baseline | Citizens remain willing to become members of representative bodies; No natural calamities occur; |
| | perception of the quality and access to services and infrastructure; Increased fuel, water, and food security for poor women and men Increased capacity of poor women and men to adapt and respond to environmental changes Increased school attendance by girls Evidence of change in school | 2017: none | the environmental and climate resilient standards; 2022: 50% population, segregated by gender, express satisfaction with their involvement in local governance processes; 2022: 50% women benefit from training on climate change At least 50% increase for all the | FAO, WFP and other donor reports Involvement of PDMA in these activities Reports by other donors across the relevant sectors | |

| [| . 1 1 1 1 1 1 | . 1 1 1 | | |
|-------|--|-------------------|--------------------------|--|
| at | tendance or achievement by girls ue to time saved collecting water | indicators listed | | |
| ا ا | ue to time saved confecting water | | | |
| NT. | fumber and percentage of | | | |
| | ouseholds in the target area with | | | |
| | ccess to improved water source | | | |
| | ceess to improved water source | | | |
| N. | Sumber of households with an | | | |
| | mproved sanitation facility | | | |
| | • | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | Vomen's and men's reports of | | | |
| | ow they use water facilities | | | |
| | domestic, agricultural, <mark>home</mark> | | | |
| ga | ardening, enterprises) | | | |
| _ | | | | |
| | iews of women and men on | | | |
| | hanges in the gender division of | | | |
| la la | lbour on water supply and | | | |
| | <mark>anitation, and reasons for</mark> | | | |
| ch | <mark>hanges</mark> | | | |
| _ | | | Coordination and | |
| | educed safety risks for women | | inclusion of Lady Health | |
| ar | nd girls from collecting water, | | Workers outreach | |
| ba | athing, laundry, and toileting | | programme | |
| NT. | umber of health outreach | | | |
| | ctivities per year in target | | | |
| | istricts, and the percentage | | | |
| | pecifically targeted at women | | | |
| | nd men | | | |
| l di | in inch | | | |
| Dz | ercentage of health facilities | | | |
| | dequately stocked with medical | | | |
| | upplies and equipment to treat | | | |
| | ommunicable diseases and | | | |
| | specially reproductive health | | | |
| | roblems and information and | | | |
| | ccess to family planning | | | |
| | | | | |
| Pa | atient satisfaction with the | | | |

| | quality of health care, including the availability and attitudes of health staff, by sex, location (rural or urban), and socioeconomic group | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|--|
| | Proportion of women with access to maternal health services within 1 hour's walk or travel | | | | |
| | Proportion of pregnant women who had prenatal and postnatal care from trained staff, and the proportion of newborn children provided with neonatal and infant health care | | | | |
| | Percentage of males and females with correct knowledge of HIV prevention and transmission (adults and children), and family planning methods | | | | |
| | Number and percentage of females and males using improved hygiene practices, and the number and percentage with knowledge of improved hygiene practices (WASH) | | | | |
| | Number of women and girls receiving disaster management preparedness training | | | | |
| ER 4: Increased number of poor community members, particularly women and marginalised such as Persons with Disabilities (PWDs), | from income-generating grants and assets transfer as productive | 2017: To be determined during the inception phase | 2022: at least 25% increase in the average income of targeted HHs who received Income Generating Grants; | Third-party baseline, mid- term and end-line surveys, programme mid-term and final evaluations; | Citizens remain willing to remain members of representative bodies and targeted households involved actively in income |
| minorities, and socially excluded groups are engaged in income-generating activities. | % of women reporting an increase in HHs income and changes in women's control over income (their own earnings and other family | | 2022: 50% women reporting at least 25% increase in HHs income; (50% women beneficiaries) and increased capacity in decision-making | Progress reports and monitoring data; Comparison of pre- and post-intervention poverty | generation activities; No natural calamities occur; |

| income) | | over investment, expenditure | score card data of the | |
|---|------------|--|---|--|
| % of population in the targeted areas graduating from lowest to upper poverty score card (PSC) band levels; % women reporting improved life skills, economic empowerment, enhanced mobility, and leadership/management skills; Number and percentage increase of women in production and small business Strengthened rural women's organisations and networks Percentage increase in the number of women engaged in viable and profitable micro and small enterprises, including evidence of increased incomes from these enterprises livestock, equipment for production, storage, processing. | 2017: none | and savings. 2022: at least 40% of the household graduate from the lowest to upper poverty score (0-11 scores) card band levels; 2022: 50% women beneficiaries reporting improved life skills, economic empowerment, enhanced mobility, and leadership/ management skills; 2022: 50% increased employment of women in both the formal and informal sectors 2022: 50% women supported to access employment outside the agriculture sector. 2022: 50% increase in women engaged in micro enterprise and savings, loans, insurance, remittances. | targeted households; Comparison of baseline and end-line statistics; implementation and communication and visibility strategies | |
| Number and percentage of poor women and men with increased access to markets as buyers and sellers Number and percentage of poor women and men with increased | | 2022: 50% of poor women and men with increased access to markets 2022: 50% increased ownership of assets by poor women. | | |
| ownership of productive assets Changes in mobility and access to markets and transactions by and for | | 2022: Women friendly markets in 70% of select districts | Cross-reference and compare with BISP | |

| | women marketers/businesswomen within districts Changes in saving behaviour | | | scorecards | |
|--|---|---|---|--|---|
| ER 5: Experiences on the ground are assessed and disseminated in order to inspire the design of the building blocks of a Local Development Policy framework. | Annual convention of the LSOs (national and provincial) and RSPs | 2017: none 2017: none 2017: To be determined during the inception phase 2017: To be determined during the inception phase 2017: To be determined during the inception phase | 2017: Action Research framework developed by RSPN for BRDCEP; 2017-2022: Annual thematic/sectoral studies; Gender Mapping of all the districts. 2017-2021: 3 regional learning visits; women's groups will be separate and additional. 2017-2021: One national and one provincial event held each year. These will be separately organised for and on gender concerns. | Action research framework and research reports, policy briefs, etc.; TA and IP progress reports and monitoring data; GoB notifications and budget documents; Event reports; | Research capacity remains intact and adequate participation by research participants; Law and order situation remains conducive for field work; Information dissemination leads to influence policies and practices; GoB remains supportive of the community-driven local development initiatives; Effective donor support for social mobilisation and RSPN programme maintained; |
| ER 6: Gender inequalities reduced through ensuring implementation of the recommendations from the gender mainstreaming strategy to be developed by the EU TA with support from the RSPs. | Gender analysis and gender mainstreaming strategy produced by the EU Technical Assistance services; Gender mainstreaming strategy aligned with the BRDCEP implementation strategies to | 2017: none 2017: none | 2017-18: Gender mainstreaming strategy produced by the EU-TA and implemented by BRSP; Revised organisational | EU TA Gender Analysis Report and Gender Mainstreaming Strategy; Revised organisational HR/Gender polices of BRSP; | EU engages TA services in parallel to contracting BRSP, NRSP and RSPN; GoB remains supportive of the community-driven local development initiatives; |

| | address gender inequalities; Sustainable reduction in gender inequalities in targeted areas resulted from the implementation of gender-sensitive interventions; Regular monitoring and evaluation by a gender specialist Gender mapping of the districts | 2017: none | HR/Gender polices of BRSP; 2022: at least 50% of members of CIs and beneficiaries of socio-economic interventions are women; | Progress reports and monitoring data; Periodic gender assessment and reviews; Mid-term and final evaluation of the programme; Gender Mapping of all Districts completed | The fostered CIs adopts gender mainstreaming strategy and implements activities as per its agreed framework; |
|---|--|-----------------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | A Gender Responsive Budget prepared | |
| | Capacity building of Gender Focus Persons Research on various sectors with a focus on gender relations Enabling environment for women to access and even create local markets/bazaars for selling and | | | Questionnaires prepared for Gender Focus Persons are completed and analysed. Research studies are compiled | |
| | purchasing goods | | | A marketing and savings tool-kit prepared with case- studies of women-friendly marketing. | |
| ER 7: Cross-cutting themes envisaged in the Balochistan Rural Development & Community Empowerment (BRDCEP) Programme mainstreamed, addressed, and effectively reported. | Community Awareness Toolkit (CAT) and operational guidelines developed by RSPN, adopted and rolled-out at community-level by BRSP; Number of government officials, BRSP's staff and CRPs trained on Community Awareness Toolkit (CAT) and operational guidelines; | 2017: none 2017: none | 2022: 70% of the organised CI members sensitised on CAT by CRPs with facilitation of officials from the local authorities/line departments; 2017: 122 government officials, management and professional staff of BRSP, and 633 CRPs trained on CAT; | CAT and operational guidelines manual and toolkit inclusive of gender concerns; Progress reports and monitoring data VDP, UCDP, DDP and ADPs; | The fostered CIs participates in CAT awareness sessions by RSP/CRP and communities accesses to local public services on cross-cutting themes; GoB remains supportive of the community-driven local development initiatives; |
| | Cross-cutting themes mainstreamed into VDPs, UCDPs and district development plans and integrated | 2017: none | 2019-20: 100% VDPs, UCDPs and district development plans encompass cross-cutting themes; | GoB notifications and budget documents; | |

| | in to the provincial ADPs with support of RSPN and TA; | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|--|---|
| ER 8: Improved capacity of elected members, local government authorities' staff, and officials of the line departments to involve communities in planning, coresourcing and managing local development activities. | Number of government officials / elected government representatives trained on participatory community development approaches; Number of elected representatives (gender disaggregated) trained on local government finance, budget and accounts, planning and development, and bylaws and business rules under BGLA 2010. | 2017: none 2017: To be determined during the inception phase | 2022: 200 government officials and 2,500 elected representatives trained on CDD; 2022: 2,500 elected representatives trained on BGL Act 2010; | Progress reports and monitoring data; Event reports; | GoB remains supportive of the community driven local development initiatives; |
| | Number of officials, representatives and local authorities trained on Gender Responsive Budgeting. Support, coordination and strengthening of programmes within the WDD and Social Welfare Dept. | | 2022: 70% trained on GRB 2022: Annual national colloquiums held on strengthening gender-based community development for Balochistan. | | |

3. Gender Mainstreaming in Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) is an indispensable part of gender mainstreaming programs, and gender-sensitive M&E tools must be developed along with more generic results-based tools. Indicators must be specific, measurable, accurate, relevant, and time-bound (SMART). A mix of qualitative and quantitative indicators is recommended and inserted in the BRDCEP Logframe so that a more complete picture of the changes occurring may emerge as the programme progresses.

Gender expertise in survey design as well as the gender of the survey enumerators has been recommended in the Gender Analysis as an important inclusion in the gender mainstreaming strategy. Ensuring that female enumerators are part of the team has been shown to improve disclosure of sensitive events and thus contributes to a more complete understanding of the impacts of the program.

The M&E regime must ensure that negative or unexpected changes are also tracked. For example, backlash to women's economic empowerment may take the form of an increase in domestic violence. It is important to realise that negative results are not necessarily indicative of programme failure, but rather evidence of successes that are prompting resistance from those feeling comparatively disadvantaged by the change to the status quo.

4 Gender Responsive Budgeting

GRB seeks to incorporate a gender equality perspective into the budgetary process, and restructure revenues and expenditures to strengthen gender equality and women's empowerment, and ensure an efficient allocation of resources based on identified needs. It helps prevent gender equality considerations from being overlooked in budgets. The Gender Responsive Budget should be developed and included in the programme design and shared with the GoB. An expert should be hired for this purpose.

5 Checklists for Gender Mainstreaming

The three 'checklists' below include recommended questions that would enable staff and management to assess and ensure that gender inclusivity is incorporated at all stages from design to the evaluation of all programmes. The inclusion of these lists would facilitate gender-mainstreaming requirements.

1. Incorporating Gender in the BRDCEP Design:

- 1. Are gender concerns included in the problem statement?
- 2. Are activity descriptions with gender disparities mentioned and is there at least 1 activity with an expected result of reducing gender inequality?

- 3. Does the Monitoring and Evaluation plan mention that data should be sex-disaggregated?
- 4. Does the Monitoring and Evaluation plan include gender-sensitive indicators and sex-disaggregated data included in relation to some expected results or throughout the M&E plan?
- 5. Are gender-related obstacles to accomplishing project objectives included in the design?
- 6. Are recommendations for ways to reduce gender gaps included?
- 7. Are there recommendations for ways to address GBV and/or enhance female participation and leadership?

2. Monitoring and Impact Assessment for BRDCEP:

- 1. Is the gender working plan updated on a regular basis?
- 2. Who is responsible for monitoring gender mainstreaming in the planned activities?
- 3. Are monitoring and evaluation exercises conducted on time?
- 4. Are negative and positive results documented equally?
- 5. Are evaluations conducted by a knowledgeable specialist?
- 6. Are their clear indicators provided in these exercises?
- 7. Is the gender mainstreaming strategy reviewed at regular intervals and adapted if necessary?

6 Self-Assessment Questions on Gender Mainstreaming for BRDCEP Staff

1. Gender Focal Persons:

- 1. Where would you place your confidence level in terms of having the necessary knowledge and competencies to achieve the expected Gender Mainstreaming results? 1-5 (1 lowest and 5 highest)
- 2. How would you rate the guidance you receive for mainstreaming gender? 1-5.
- 3. How would you rate the sufficiency of the training received to support you in implementing GM in your program? 1-5.
- 4. Has mentoring and coaching enabled you to mainstream gender in the design and implementation of Programs? Explain.
- 5. What are some of the unspoken assumptions that guide your decisions and choices about GM in BRDCEP?
- 6. Provide 2 examples of work processes or policies that work against Gender Mainstreaming.
- 7. Indicate two main results you have achieved, or contributions you have made, in relation to mainstreaming gender. List two main challenges you face in effectively mainstreaming gender.
- 8. How would you rate the institutional culture of BRSP in relation to its sensitivity to gender issues? 1-5
- 9. What do you require from BRSP to do your work more effectively?

2. Field and Office Staff:

Gender Integration in Your Work

- 1. Could you please describe the extent to which, if at all, gender considerations have been a part of your work during your time at BRSP/BRDCEP?
- 2. Could you estimate the number of gender-related activities you've worked on during the last three months? And give a brief description of each?
- 2.a. Could you estimate the percentage of time you've spent on those?
- 3. Does your community/department have a gender focal point? If no, has it ever had one?
- 3.a. Follow-up: Has it been helpful to work with your gender focal point?
- 3.b. Follow-up: Why do you think that is [whether yes or no]? Could you give an example?
- 4. Could you give us a few examples of what makes it difficult for you to integrate gender considerations in your work?
- 5. What would be the number one recommendation you would make to BRSP to make your job easier related to gender integration?

Monitoring and Evaluation

- 7. During your time at BRSP, have you worked on a project that had a monitoring/evaluation?
- 7.a. Follow-up: To what extent, if at all, did the monitoring/evaluation include gender considerations? Could you provide a specific example?
- 8. If present, were the sex-disaggregated data and gender considerations followed through from the beginning of the project to the evaluation report? If not, why do you think that was the case? (for staff involved in evaluations)

Gender-related Capacity Building

- 9. Have you had any opportunities for gender-related training and learning since joining BRSP/BRDCEP? Can you provide examples?
- 10. Have you had any sector-specific gender training elsewhere?

Literature Review

See Annex 1

Useful Films as Resources

Sharmeen Obaid Chinoy - <u>Humaira: The Dream Catcher</u>

Humaira: The Dream Catcher celebrates the achievements of Humaira Bachal, an activist from Karachi who fights for girl's education. Working out of Muwach Goth, Humaira has single headedly educated over 1200 students at the nominal fee of 1 rupee per day. The film serves as a tribute to her personal struggles and shares her vision for the future of her organisation, The Dream Foundation Trust.

Oxfam - Empowerment through inclusion: Women in decision making

The Raising Her Voice programme established 50 Women Leaders Groups (WLGs) in 30 districts across Pakistan, with a total membership of 1,700 women activists, living and working in their communities. The aims of the WLGs are: to promote activism within their communities; to defend and promote individual and collective women's rights; to represent marginalised women; and to raise women's collective voice at local and district levels, as well as, with AF's support, at the provincial and national level.

Sadia Shepard - <u>The Other Half of Tomo</u>rrow

'The other half of Tomorrow' is a portrait of contemporary Pakistan as seen through the perspectives of Pakistani women working to change their country. A series of seven linked chapters, the film introduces us to the disparate contexts that make up a complex culture—from a women's rights' workshop in a village in rural Punjab, to an underground dance academy in Karachi, lady health worker, a Christian woman Parliamentarian, to the playing fields of the Pakistan Women's Cricket Team.

References

1. Abid Qaiyum Suleri and Sahib Haq (2009), "Food Insecurity in Pakistan, A study by SDC, SDPI and WFP. Pakistan.

http://documents.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/ena/wfp225636.pdf.

- 2. Afiya S. Zia, S. Akbar Zaidi, Shafi Ahmad (2011). *The Importance of Retaining and Supporting Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Women's Centres;* A Study Undertaken for the National Commission of the Status of Women.
- 3. An Analysis of National Socio-Economic Registry, PIDE 2011. http://bisp.gov.pk/analysis-of-nser-2010-11/
- 4. Balochistan Budget White Paper 2016-2017. http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com-docman&task=cat-view&gid=14748 http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com-docman&task=cat-view&gid=14748 http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com-docman&task=cat-view&gid=14748 http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?
- 5. "Balochistan Development Issues and Prospects," Multidonor Trust Fund, World Bank, Islamabad, Undated.

https://www.pakistanmdtf.org/images/stories/project-documents/BalochistanDevIssuesandProspects.pdf

- 6. "Balochistan Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey 2010," Planning and Development Department, Government of Balochistan, in collaboration with UNICEF (November 2011). http://www.childinfo.org/files/MICS4_Balochistan_2010_FinalReport.pdf
- 7. BEMIS School Census 2013-2014. http://shaigle.com/bemis/bemis-balochistan-school-information.htm
- 8. "Development Profile of Killa Abdullah," Situation Analysis & Baseline Surveys For Poverty Reduction through Rural Development in KPK, FATA & Balochistan, AASA Consulting, 2015.

http://ppr.org.pk/PDF/District%20Profile%20Killa%20Abdullah.pdf

9. District Development, Profile 2011, Government of Balochistan, Planning & Development Department, Government of Balochistan in Collaboration with UNICEF, July 18, 2011.

http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/DistrictProfile/DDP%20Final%202012/killaabdullah/K-Abdullah.pdf

- 10. Election Commission of Pakistan, https://ecp.gov.pk/frmGenericPage.aspx?PageID=3047 October 2017.
- 11. Haris Gazdar (2007) "Balochistan Economic Report; Background Paper on Social Structures and Migration," Collective for Social Science Research, Karachi. http://www.researchcollective.org/Documents/Balochistan Economic Report.pdf

12. HRCP (2013) "Balochistan; Giving The People A Chance," Report of a Fact-finding Mission by Human Rights Commission of Pakistan.

http://www.hrcp-web.org/hrcpweb/wpcontent/pdf/Balochistan%20Report%20New%20Final.pdf

13. Iftikhar Cheema, Farhat, Maham, Hunt, Simon, Javeed, Sarah, Keck, Katharina, and O'Leary, Sean. *BISP Final Impact Evaluation 2017*, Oxford Policy Management. http://bisp.gov.pk/wpcontent/uploads/2017/02/BISP FinalImpactEvaluationReport FINAL-5.pdf.

14. "National Assembly Election Results 2013," Analysis Report by Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN).

http://fafen.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/National-Assembly-Election-Result-Analysis-Final-January-29-2014-low-size.pdf?x53217

15. "National Baseline Study for Gender Equity Program (2012)." GEP, Aurat Foundation. http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf docs/pnaec207.pdf
http://af.org.pk/gep_2/Advertisements/National%20Baseline%20Study/FINAL%20National%20baseline%20study.pdf

- 16. Nazish Brohi (2009) "Circumventing the State: Rereading the disconnect between state institutions and rural women," unpublished study, SDPI.
- 17. Pakistan Health Demographic Survey (PDHS) 2012-2013. National Institute for Population Studies, Pakistan and ICF International. https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR290/FR290.pdf
- 18. Pakistan Social and Living Measurement Survey (PSLM) 2014-15. Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Government of Pakistan.

http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/pslm/publications/PSLM_2014-15_National-Provincial-District_report.pdf

19. "Performance of Women Legislators," Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN) report on Performance of Balochistan Assembly's Women Legislators (June 2013 to February 2017).

 $\frac{http://fafen.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/FAFEN-Balochistan-Assembly-Women-Legislators-Report-2017.pdf}{}$

20. Report on the Status of Millennium Development Goals, Balochistan, 2011. United Nations

http://www.pk.undp.org/content/dam/pakistan/docs/MDGs/UNDP-PK-MDG-BalochistanReport-2011.pdf

21. S. M. Marri (2005). Baloch Samaaj main Aurat ka Magaam. Quetta: Seva Publications.

- 22. Sajid Amin Javed, Muhammad Danish Anjum, Waqas Imran, Azad Haider, Ayesha Shiraz, Farzana Shaheen and Muhammad Iftikhar ul Husnain (2012), "Correlates of preferences for home or hospital confinement in Pakistan: evidence from a national survey." BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth 2013, 13:137. http://www.biomedcentral.com/1471-2393/13/137.
- 23. Sarwar Bari (2010) "An Unfinished Struggle: The Tale of the Women Councilors' Network." Monograph. Pattan: Islamabad. https://pattan.org/v2/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/wcn_book_opt.pdf
- 25. "Stories of BISP," Government of Pakistan 2017. http://bisp.gov.pk/stories-of-bisp/
- 26. Syed Fazl-e-Haider (2010). "Water Potential of Balochistan," Pakistan Water Gateway Resources, Investigation and Development. http://waterinfo.net.pk/?q=node/77
- 27. Tahira S. Khan (2006) *Beyond Honour: A Historical Materialist Explanation of Honour Related Violence*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- 28. The Global Polio Eradication Initiative and Government of Pakistan, April 21, 2017 http://polioeradication.org/

ANNEX I – Literature Review

Contents

| List of Acronyms | |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| List of Tables | |
| Introduction | |
| Education | |
| Health | 80 |
| Democratic Governance | 87 |
| Economic growth and Empowerment | 90 |
| Energy | |
| Water | |
| Cross cutting themes | 102 |
| List of Reference | |

List of Acronyms

| ADB | Asian Development Bank |
|---------|--|
| AF | Aurat Foundation |
| AJK | Azad Jammu and Kashmir |
| B.Ed | Bachelor of Education |
| BACP | Balochistan AIDS Control Programme |
| BACT | Balochistan Academy for College Teacher |
| BEF | Balochistan Education Foundation |
| BEEF | Balochistan Education Endowment Fund |
| BEMIS | Balochistan Education Management Information System |
| BHU | Basic Health Unit |
| BISP | Banazir Income Support Programme |
| BLGA | Baluchistan Local Government Act 2010 |
| ВМС | Bolan Medical College Teaching Hospital |
| BPSC | Balochistan Public Service Commission |
| BRDCEP | Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Programme |
| BRSP | Balochistan Rural Support Programme |
| ВТВВ | Balochistan Textbook Board |
| BUITEMS | Balochistan University of Information Technology Engineering and Management Sciences |
| CIP | Community Implementation Partner |
| CNIC | Computerized National Identity Card |
| CPEC | China Pakistan Economic Corridor |
| DDR | Disaster Risk Reduction |
| DWSS | Drinking Water Supply Schemes |
| ECCE | Early Childhood Care and Education |
| EFA | Education for All |
| EFP | Environmental Focal Person |
| ESR | Education Sector Reform |
| FAFEN | Free and Fair Election Network |
| FAO | Food and Agriculture Organisation |
| FC | Frontier Constabulary |
| FGD | Focused Group Discussion |
| FSW | Female Sex Workers |
| GEP | Gender Equity Program |
| GGG | Global Gender Gap |
| GB | Gilgit Baltistan |
| GCC | Gender and Child Cell |

| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
|-------|--|
| GER | Gross Enrolment Ratio |
| GFP | Gender Focus Person/Point |
| GOB | Government of Balochistan |
| GPAP | Gender Policy Action Plan |
| GTF | Gender Task Force |
| НЕ | Higher Education |
| НЕС | Higher Education Commission |
| ICT | The Islamabad Capital Territory |
| IDSP | Institute for Development of Studies and Practices |
| ILO | International Labour Organisation |
| IMR | Infant Mortality Rate |
| JUI | Jamiat Ulema-e Islam |
| КРК | Khyber Pakhtunkhwa |
| LB | Local Bodies |
| LFM | Logic Framework Matrices |
| LGRD | Local Government and Rural Development |
| MCH | Maternal and Child Health |
| MICS | Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey |
| M & E | Monitoring and Evaluation |
| MDG | Millennium Development Goals |
| MMR | Pakistan Maternal Mortality Rate |
| MNA | Member National Assembly |
| MPA | Member Provincial Assembly |
| MPI | Multidimensional Poverty Index |
| NADRA | National Database and Registration Authority |
| NCHD | National Commission on Human Development |
| NEP | National Education Policy |
| NER | Net Enrolment Rate |
| NFBE | Non formal Basic Education |
| NFC | National Finance Commission Award |
| NGO | Non-Government Organisation |
| NP | National Party |
| NMR | Neonatal Mortality Rate |
| OPM | Oxford Policy Management |
| PDHS | Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey |
| PDMA | Provincial Disaster Management Authority |
| PHED | Public Health Engineering Department |
| PKMAP | Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party |

| PMDC | Pakistan Mineral Development Corporation |
|--------|--|
| PML-N | Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz) |
| PPIU | Policy, Planning and Implementation Unit |
| PPP | Public Private Partnership |
| PSLM | Pakistan Social and Living Measurement |
| RHC | Rural Health Centre |
| SEHER | Society for Empowering Human Resources |
| SIW | Small Industries Wing |
| SUN | Scaling Up Nutrition |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNESCO | United Nation Education Scientific Cultural Organisation |
| UNICEF | United Nation International Children Fund |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| USAID | United States Agency for International Development |
| VAW | Violence Against Woman |
| WATSAN | Water Sanitation |
| WB | World Bank |
| WDD | Women's Development Department |
| WESS | Water, Environment and Sanitation Society |
| WFP | World Food Programme |
| WHO | World Health Organisation |

List of Tables

| List of Table | |
|---------------|---|
| Table 1 | PSLM 2014-15 average of population that has ever attended/enrolled in school |
| Table 2 | Primary level enrolment in government schools a percentage of total province & district (urban rural total enrolment) (2014-15) |
| Table 3 | Percentage, Enrolment by Gender & Type of School 2014, 2015 and 2016 (6-16 year olds) |
| Table 4 | Pro-male gaps in enrolment (6-16 years), by school type |
| Table 5 | Detail of Government College in the province |
| Table 6 | Demographic Data of Balochistan as per census of Pakistan 2017 |
| Table 7 | MNCH FACT TABLE |
| Table 8 | District Wise Health Facilities In Balochistan, 2015 |
| Table 9 | DISTRICT-WISE B.H.U, M.C.H AND T.B CLINICS |
| Table 10 | District-wise Doctors, Nurses in Balochistan |
| Table 11 | District-Wise Paramedics in Balochistan 2014-15 |
| Table 12 | Polio Fact sheet |
| Table 13 | District Wise Registered Voters in Pakistan (as on 12.10.2017) |
| Table 14 | Multidimensional Poverty by Province/Region UNDP 2016 |
| Table 15 | Percentage Distributions of Earners by Employment Status 2015-2016 |
| Table 16 | District Ranking by Poverty Status |
| Table 17 | Poverty indicator (Presence of Literate Woman in the Household) |
| Table 18 | Percent Distribution of Households by Fuel Used for Lighting |
| Table 19 | Organization working on Solar Energy projects |
| Table 20 | Percentage Distribution of Employed Persons by Key Industry Division |
| Table 21 | Water and Sanitation |
| Table 22 | Overview of situation of VAW in Balochistan |
| Table 23 | Fatalities in Balochistan: 2011-2017 |
| | |

Introduction

A discordant centre-province relation, waning economic development and splitting internal tendencies have marred the steady progress of Balochistan Province since independence. Balochistan is home to contradictory extremes. The region is the largest among the four provinces and occupies more than 40 percent of the country's total landmass with the least number of population in the country⁵².

Balochistan is 347,190 km2 with a total population of 12,344,408 and Population density is 36/km2. Quetta is the Provincial capital and it is densely populated. Balochistan has 34 districts and 572 Union Councils.

This literature review focuses on 7 thematic areas that directly and indirectly relate to development in Balochistan.

- 1. Education
- 2. Health
- 3. Democratic governance
- 4. Economic growth and empowerment
- 5. Energy /renewable resources
- 6. Water

7. Cross cutting themes

⁵² In-depth Interview with Ahmed Saleem, 2017, Annex 2

Education

The education sector faces multiple challenges such as low number of schools for district populations, absentee teachers and children dropping out at primary levels. Female education has suffered and lags behind because of patriarchal values. According to the Pakistan Social and Living Measurements Survey (PSLM 2014-15), a critical challenge faced by education sector in Balochistan is that 10,000 out of 22,000 settlements, have a semifunctional school. Among these 10,000 schools many do not have proper building, children sit on floors or without a class room in open grounds. Sometimes due to hard weather conditions children quit attending school and this adds to the dropout rate. Another issue is that usually these schools are at a far distance from one settlement to another. This can create barriers for female education. Usually male children can move freely from one settlement to another but female's mobility is restricted and discouraged. The PSLM identified that Balochistan has approximately 13,000 government-run schools, out of which 2,500 are for girls.

Table No 1: PSLM 2014-15 average of population that has ever attended/enrolled in school

| Balochistan | Urban | | | Rural | | | Total | | |
|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|
| | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total |
| Balochistan | 74 | 43 | 59 | 55 | 17 | 38 | 60 | 25 | 44 |

The Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) for primary schools (Age 6-10) at National level has decreased to 91% in 2014-15 from 92% in 2012-13. Punjab 98% recorded the highest GER and Balochistan with 73% recorded the lowest among the four provinces⁵³.

Table No: 2 Primary level enrolment in government schools as a percentage of total province & district (urban rural total enrolment) (2014-15)⁵⁴

⁵³ PSLM, 2015, p. 20

⁵⁴ PSLM, 2015, p. 67

| Balochistan | Urban | | | Rural | | | Total | Total | | |
|-------------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|--|
| | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | |
| Balochistan | 82 | 81 | 81 | 96 | 93 | 96 | 92 | 87 | 90 | |
| Quetta | 69 | 60 | 66 | 98 | 80 | 90 | 80 | 69 | 75 | |
| Pishin | 100 | 100 | 100 | 93 | 100 | 95 | 94 | 100 | 95 | |
| Killa | 100 | 100 | 100 | 82 | 94 | 84 | 84 | 96 | 86 | |
| Abdullah | | | | | | | | | | |
| Loralai | 100 | 62 | 79 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 84 | 97 | |
| Jhal Magsi | 88 | 100 | 93 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 99 | 100 | 100 | |
| Khuzdar | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | |
| Tubat | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | |
| Zhob | 100 | 94 | 97 | 96 | 87 | 94 | 98 | 91 | 95 | |
| Washuk | | | | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | |

The Annual Status of Education Report (ASER, 2016) demonstrates the drop in enrolments across both government and private schools in Balochistan⁵⁵.

Table No. 3: Percentage, Enrolment by Gender & Type of School 2014, 2015 and 2016 $(6-16 \text{ year olds})^{56}$

| | Government | | | | | Priva | rate | | | | | |
|------------|------------|------|-----------|------|------|-------|------|------|------|------|-----|------|
| | 2014 | | 2015 2016 | | 2014 | | 2015 | | 2016 | | | |
| | Boys | Girl | Boy | Girl | Boy | Girl | Boy | Girl | Boy | Girl | Boy | Girl |
| National | 65 | 35 | 65 | 35 | 62 | 38 | 63 | 37 | 62 | 38 | 60 | 40 |
| Balochista | 70 | 30 | 70 | 30 | 69 | 31 | 67 | 33 | 70 | 30 | 64 | 36 |
| n | | | | | | | | | | | | |

In Balochistan dropout rates are much higher than enrollment rates. $40\,\%$ of Children do not complete their primary education. In rural areas it can climb as high as 80% where children drop out of school after primary level. Gender disparities, the pro-male gap in education and

⁵⁵ ASER, 2016, p.11

⁵⁶ ASER, 2016, p.7-120

poor quality of teaching in the classroom contributes to a high drop-out rate after primary level⁵⁷.

Table No: 4: Pro-male gaps in enrolment (6-16 years), by school type⁵⁸ ().

| | Pro male g | aps in Gover | nment | Pro-male gaps in Private | | | | |
|-------------|-------------|-----------------------|-------|--------------------------|-----------------------|------|--|--|
| | school acce | ess | | school access | | | | |
| | (% boys en | rolled in G | | (% boys enrolled in P | | | | |
| | school - % | girls | | school - % girls | | | | |
| | enrolled in | enrolled in G school) | | | enrolled in P school) | | | |
| | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | | |
| National | 30% | 30% | 24% | 26% | 24% | 20% | | |
| Balochistan | 40% | 40% | 38% | 34% | 40% | 28% | | |

Alif Ailaan, a non-profit organization working in the education sector in Balochistan reported 1.8 million out of 2.7 million children are without any kind of education in Balochistan in the Province. Mosharaf Zaidi, team Leader of Alif Ailaan, said that at least 66% of children, between the ages of 5 and 16, in Balochistan, do not go to school⁵⁹.

The common practice of not sending a child to school or not enrolling a child in school or children dropping out have multilayered aspects. According to United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund, 24 million children between the age of 5 and 16 years are still out of school. According to the UNICEF study from 2015 ⁶⁰ "these practices are most commonly linked to "gender biases, poverty, child labor, inadequacies in the supply of schools and teachers especially in rural, lack of infrastructure and school facilities especially for girls, deficiencies in the teaching–learning process, problems with the processes of devolution and decentralization, incapacities of school management committees, weak coordination between public, private and nonprofit sectors, and inadequate budget allocations and resource distribution".

⁵⁷ PSLM, 2015, p. 7-120

⁵⁸ PSLM, 2015, p. 7-120

 $^{^{59}}$ In-depth Interview with Musharraf Zaidi, 21/11/2017

⁶⁰ United Nation International Children Fund (UNICEF) 2015, Islamabad, *Progress Report 2013-2015*

The 18th Constitutional Amendment legislated by the Parliament during April 2010 made education sector the responsibility of the Provincial Government. Based on this vision Balochistan Provincial Budget 2017- 2018 allocated Rs 45.79bn for education sector. This is an 18% increase as compared to the previous budget allocation. Due to this increase the Balochistan Education Endowment Fund received an increase of Rs 6-8bn. The Chief Minister has announced 14,000 scholarships starting from middle high school to university level educational. The Chief Minister also announced the opening of 725 new primary schools, the upgrading of 500 schools upgrading to middle level and 500 middle schools to higher level⁶¹.

According to UNICEF Pakistan Country Report Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh⁶², after the amendment provincial Governments tried to increase children's enrollment in government schools. Female child education was given priority by introducing a stipend and cash transfer programs focusing on girls only. This effort proved futile because of fund discrepancies at the administrative level in school. UNICEF and World Bank still believe in increasing enrollment of girls by giving them stipend or cash transfer promote female enrollments.

The Education Sector Plan (ESP) 2013-2018 of Balochistan Province, developed by Policy Planning and Implementation Unit (PPIU), Education Department, Government of Balochistan, is an example of current planning direction in education. The ESP highlights the gray areas' of education sector. The Balochistan Education sector is inviting different stakeholders including donors, bilateral organization, educational institutions, NGOs and civil society organizations to contribute to improving the quality of educational institutions.

Table No: 5 Detail of Government Colleges in the Province⁶³

| Туре | Intermediate | Degree | Total |
|--------|--------------|--------|-------|
| Male | 44 | 31 | 75 |
| Female | 24 | 17 | 41 |
| | | Total | 116 |

⁶¹ Government of Balochistan, 2017, http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/

⁶² UNICEF Pakistan Annual Report 2013

⁶³ BEMIS 2012 http://emis.gob.pk/

According to the Balochistan Education Sector Plan, (2015) the Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) is providing support to private schools under a Public Private Partnership' process. BEF has announced 197 Fellowship schools with the assistance of private sector and subsidizes another 500 schools that meet the criteria. The BEF has also developed community schools in areas with no schools. At present about 632 such schools function in the province. In addition to BEF the National Commission on Human Development (NCHD) also developed feeder schools with the support of the community.

BEMIS⁶⁴ (Balochistan Education Management Information System) is playing a diversified role in education development. BEMIS provides technical support to colleges, higher education and vocation education enhancement. BEMIS has been maintaining updated data of teachers and schools on their website since 2014 in partnership with the following stakeholders:

- Bureau of Curriculum and Extension Centre Balochistan, Quetta
- Provincial Institution for teacher Education
- Balochistan Textbook Board
- Balochistan Board of Intermediate And Secondary Education
- Balochistan Education and Assessment Commission (BEAC)
- Balochistan Education Endowment Fund(BEEF)
- Directorate of Education
- Directorate of Collages
- UNHRC
- UNICEF
- WORLD BANK
- USAID

_

⁶⁴ http://emis.gob.pk/

Health

Table No 6: Demographic Data of Balochistan as per census of Pakistan 2017

| Administrative | House hold | Male | Female | Total | SEX | 1998- |
|----------------|------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------|---------|
| Unit | | | | population | RATIO | 2017 |
| | | | | | 2017 | Average |
| | | | | | | Annual |
| | | | | | | Growth |
| | | | | | | Rate |
| Pakistan | 32,205,111 | 106,449,322 | 101,314,780 | 207,774,520 | 105.07 | 2.40 |
| Balochistan | 1,775,937 | 6,483,653 | 5,860,646 | 12,344,408 | 110.63 | 3.37 |

According to the Pakistan Economic Survey (2016-17) the national maternal mortality rate is 170 per 100,000 live births. Balochistan has the highest maternal mortality rate. According to Government of Pakistan Statistics Division, Bureau of Statistics (2016) the maternal mortality rate was 600 to 700 per 100,000 live births in 2016.

According to Pakistan Health Demographic Survey (PHDS) 2012-13 Report, "when it comes to maternal and infant mortality, the national Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) was around 272 per 100,000 live births., In Balochistan that rate is 785 per 100,000 live births. It is evident from the records that MMR rate has decreased in Pakistan, but the figures remains same for Balochistan.

According to Director General Public Health Department, Mr. Hayat, Health department conditions in Balochistan are substandard due to poor health facilities, untrained paramedical staff, lack of female doctors and female health workers. The Balochistan Health Departments face multiple challenges including absentee Doctors and fake medical supplies. After 2010 Provincial autonomy, the Health department has not been able to meet the health needs of the provincial population. The Health Department blames the geography of Balochistan province and low budgetary allocations. According to Pakistan Health

Demographic Survey⁶⁵ Report Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) was 74 out of 1000 deaths and in Balochistan it is 97 out of 1,000.

Table No 7: Maternal, Newborn and Child Health MNCH FACTS⁶⁶

Pakistan Balochistan 1. Maternal Mortality Rate 272/100,000 live 1. $MMR = 600 \text{ to} 785/100\ 000 \text{ Live births}$ births 2. NMR = 72/1000 Live births 2. Neonatal Mortality rate 54/1000 live births 3. CMR = 111/1000 Live births(5 years 3. Child Mortality rate 89/1000 live births (5 of age) years of age) 4. Total Fertility Rate 4.2 children per 4. Total Fertility Rate 3.8 children per woman woman 5. Population growth rate 1.8% 5. Population growth rate 2.7%

Table No 8: Development Statistics of Balochistan 2015-2016, Health Facilities in Balochistan⁶⁷

| District | HEA | HEALTH FACILITIES | | | | | | | |
|---------------|-----------|-------------------|----------|------|-----|------|--|--|--|
| | Hospitals | | Dispensa | | RHC | | | | |
| | | | ries | | | | | | |
| | no | Beds | no | Beds | no | Beds | | | |
| Balochistan | 49 | 414 | 540 | - | 102 | 1044 | | | |
| | | 6 | | | | | | | |
| Jhal Magsi | 1 | 22 | 16 | - | 3 | 54 | | | |
| Kech (Turbat) | 2 | 121 | 42 | - | 11 | 98 | | | |
| Khuzdar | 1 | 90 | 29 | - | 6 | 100 | | | |

⁶⁵ PHDS,2013 p.7

⁶⁶ PHDS,2013 p.7

⁶⁷ Pp. 197-199

| Killa Abdullah | 1 | 54 | 9 | - | 6 | 60 |
|----------------|---|-----|----|---|----|----|
| Loralai | 2 | 256 | 47 | - | 3 | 20 |
| Pishin | 2 | 55 | 10 | - | 10 | 50 |
| Washuk | 1 | 24 | 12 | - | 2 | 20 |
| Zhob | 1 | 104 | 12 | - | 4 | 34 |

Table No 9: Development Statistics of Balochistan 2015-2016, District Basic Health Units, Maternal Child Health Care Centers, and Tuberculosis Clinics⁶⁸

| District | HEALTH FAC | HEALTH FACILITIES | | | | | | | |
|----------------|------------|-------------------|-------------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | B.H.U | M.C.H | T.B. CLINIC | | | | | | |
| Balochistan | 642 | 91 | 23 | | | | | | |
| Jhal Magsi | 11 | 2 | 0 | | | | | | |
| Kech (Turbat) | 38 | 4 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Khuzdar | 44 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Killa Abdullah | 39 | 2 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Loralai | 37 | 4 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Pishin | 32 | 4 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Washuk | 22 | 1 | 0 | | | | | | |
| Zhob | 23 | 2 | 1 | | | | | | |

Table No 10: Development Statistics of Balochistan 2015-2016, District Doctors, and Nurses in Balochistan⁶⁹

| District | Doctor | `S | | Nurses | | | |
|-------------|--------|--------|-------|--------|--------|-------|--|
| | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | |
| Balochistan | 1740 | 491 | 2231 | 85 | 709 | 790 | |
| Jhal Magsi | 45 | 10 | 55 | 1 | 5 | 6 | |
| Kech/Turbat | 40 | 9 | 49 | 2 | 18 | 20 | |
| Khuzdar | 35 | 7 | 42 | 3 | 15 | 18 | |

⁶⁸ p. 200 ⁶⁹ P. 201 to 202

| Killa | 55 | 13 | 68 | 3 | 10 | 13 |
|----------|----|----|-----|---|----|----|
| Abdullah | | | | | | |
| Loralai | 77 | 18 | 95 | 1 | 35 | 36 |
| Pishin | 90 | 17 | 107 | 1 | 10 | 11 |
| Washuk | 10 | 1 | 11 | 1 | 4 | 5 |
| Zhob | 42 | 7 | 49 | 2 | 9 | 11 |

Table No 11: Development Statistics of Balochistan 2015-2016, DISTRICT PARAMEDICS IN BALOCHISTAN⁷⁰

| District | Pharmacist | Drug | Health | L.H.V | Dias/Mid |
|-------------|------------|-----------|-----------|-------|----------|
| | | Inspector | Education | | Wives |
| | | | Officer | | |
| | | | | | |
| Balochistan | 440 | 72 | 17 | 829 | 1674 |
| Jhal Magsi | 10 | 1 | 0 | 13 | 34 |
| Kech (Turba | 17 | 3 | 1 | 42 | 127 |
| t) | | | | | |
| Khuzdar | 21 | 2 | 2 | 39 | 82 |
| Killa | 17 | 4 | 0 | 25 | 51 |
| Abdullah | | | | | |
| Loralai | 12 | 3 | 1 | 40 | 83 |
| Pishin | 19 | 2 | 0 | 51 | 70 |
| Washuk | 6 | 1 | 0 | 21 | 35 |
| Zhob | 14 | 2 | 1 | 36 | 55 |

There are six major hospitals in Quetta including Civil Hospital, Provincial Sandeman Hospital, and Bolan Medical College Teaching Hospital (BMC). According to Health Department Records (2015), there are 1447 government health

-

⁷⁰ P. 203

facilities with approximately 5,190 beds providing a ratio of one bed per 1556 people and 1 doctor for every 3500 patients approximately⁷¹.

Use of Modern Methods of Family Planning Pakistan

According to Demographic and Health Survey, Key Findings report (2013) nearly one-third of married women in urban areas use modern methods of family planning, as compared to 23% of women in rural areas. According to the same report, in Balochistan use of modern methods for Family planning is 16% of total married women aged between 15 -49 years.

Child Home Births (delivery at home)

According to Pakistan Health Demographic Survey (PHDS) (2012-13), 60 % of births in rural areas are home-based and 80% occur with the help of a family elder, female relatives or neighbor without the assistance of midwifes or any trained person. Facility-based births are only 16% in Balochistan. Home births are more common in rural areas (60%) than urban areas (32%).

Birth Registration

Balochistan has lowest birth registration rates, UNICEF worked with Department of Local Government and Rural Development and National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA) to promote birth registration in 10 districts. According to UNICEF ⁷² birth registration rate in Pakistan is 34% out of total Births in the year of 2014 to 2015 and Balochistan it is only 8%

Budget

The Government of Balochistan budget for fiscal year 2017-18 has a total outlay of Rs. 328 billion out of which Rs 18 billion has been allocated for Health sector. This is a five percent increase as compared to 2016 – 2017 budget.

Malnutrition

According to the National Nutrition Health Survey 2011 (NNHS 2011) (UNICEF 2012), malnutrition is a major health issue in Balochistan, women are facing the worst of this situation. According to NNH 2011, malnutrition is caused by not having access to healthy food. In Balochistan poverty, drought and unemployment are major factors limiting access

⁷¹ In-depth Interview M. Hayat, Quetta, 4th Dec 2017 Director General Public Health Department

⁷² United Nation International Children Fund (UNICEF) 2015, Islamabad, *Progress Report 2013-2015 Results for children in Pakistan Birth Registration*, p. 12

to healthy food. The survey found malnutrition to be most severe in Balochistan. According to the NNHS2011, 80 % of Balochistan Rural women are suffering from malnutrition.

Health Programmes for Females

1. Balochistan Nutrition Program for Mothers & Children, Government of Balochistan, 2015

The Government of Balochistan Health is implementing "Balochistan Nutrition Project for Mothers and Children" supported by World Bank to improve the nutrition services in the Province, especially the rural areas. This program is implemented in seven districts namely Kharan, Panjgur, Noshki, Kohlu, Sibi, Zhob and Killa Saifullah at the community and health facility level⁷³.

2. Balochistan AIDS control program

- 1. Balochistan AIDS Control Program (BACP, 2017), was first established in 1994 conceptualized and run by World Bank. After success of phase 1 it was extended with the help of Planning Commission Pakistan and Global Fund (GF). Balochistan AIDS Control program focuses on preventive measures and medicinal cure of the disease at community and health facilities level. it focuses high risk groups i.e. Male Sex Workers (MSWs), Female Sex Workers (FSWs), drug addicts, Trans Genders (TGs), prisoners and truck drivers. They have been successfully practicing HIV care and support, blood safety, STI management, capacity building of Healthcare Providers.
- 2. They also work with key policy makers by use of advocacy, communication and coordination and they involve stake holders like International and local NGOs, religious leaders, media personnel and educationists⁷⁴.

3. Provincial TB Control Program Balochistan

The Program started in 1998 in Mastung as pilot project with the help of World Health Organization, now it is working in 22 district. This program has collaborations with USAID, DFID, JICA, CIDA and it is providing Free of cost diagnosis and treatment through a network of 1,257 TB care facilities⁷⁵.

⁷³ http://bnpmc.gob.pk, December 2017

⁷⁴ http://www.bacp.gob.pk/, December 2017

⁷⁵ https://www.ntp.gov.pk/cmsPage.php?pageID=25, December 2017

4. Anti-polio campaign

The Anti-polio campaign is a tripartite partnership between GoB, GAVI and UNICEF. This program is very successful in Balochistan, UNICEF is enhancing the Programme on Immunization (EPI) for reduction in preventable diseases. This partnership has empowered frontline polio workers to ensure that no child is missed during antipolio campaigns⁷⁶.

Table no 12: The Global Polio Eradication Initiative, 2017 Polio Fact sheet⁷⁷

| area | | Children recorded as unvaccinated | | | | |
|-------------|------------|-----------------------------------|--------------|----------|--|--|
| | Children | Recorded | Recorded | Total | | |
| | Vaccinated | "not | "refused | recorded | | |
| | | available | vaccination" | missed | | |
| | | children" | | children | | |
| Pakistan | 35854531 | 3875607 | 239490 | 4115097 | | |
| | | (11%) | (1%) | (11%) | | |
| Balochistan | 2212597 | 153262 | 20631 (1%) | 173893 | | |
| | | (7%) | | (8%) | | |

⁷⁶ http://www.endpolio.com.pk/, December 2017

⁷⁷ http://polioeradication.org/, January 2018

Democratic Governance

According to Free and Fair Election Network FAFAN Analytical report on election 2013, "votes polled in Balochistan, in 2002 were almost 1.17 million. With a significant increase of over 16%, the votes polled exceeded 1.36 million in 2008. In 2013, there was just a marginal increase in the votes polled as it exceeded 1.39 million".

Table No 13: Election Commission of Pakistan, District Registered Voters in Pakistan (as on 12.10.2017)

| District | Male | Female | Total |
|----------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Balochistan | 2,137,098 | 1,565,342 | 3,702,440 |
| Jhal Magsi | 29,621 | 21,328 | 50,949 |
| Kech (Turbat) | 109,251 | 86,582 | 195,833 |
| Khuzdar | 111,376 | 80,281 | 191,657 |
| Killa Abdullah | 125,114 | 72,982 | 198,096 |
| Loralai | | | |
| Pishin | 125,667 | 92,204 | 217,871 |
| Washuk | 23,957 | 20,868 | 44,825 |
| Zhob | 63,316 | 45,874 | 109,190 |

Local Governance

Balochistan Government dissolved its previous system in January 2010, and the Balochistan Local Government Act 2010 (BLGA) was passed by the Provincial Assembly and signed into law by the Governor on 11 May 2010. Although the legislation was in place, the provincial government did not take concrete steps to implement the local government legislation until 2013, when provinces came under pressure from the Supreme Court. In September 2013, the Balochistan Government framed rules for conducting elections. Balochistan was the first of the four provinces to successfully hold local government elections under the new framework on 7 December 2013.⁷⁸

-

⁷⁸ IFES-PK Factsheet 2013

Election 2013 and Balochistan election atmosphere in the province painted a dichotomy along two major ethnic groups–Pushtuns in the North and Balochs in the central and Southern parts. The Pushtun areas witnessed hot contests whereas elections in the Baloch areas were marred by boycott from Baloch nationalists–barring some–and separatist elements that upped the ante by threatening both voters and candidates to stay away from the polls⁷⁹.

For the 2013 elections, a total of 284 candidates competed for the 14 seats—the independents constituting the largest group with 136 candidates. Among the parties, Jamiat Ulema-e Islam led with fielding candidates from all constituencies followed by PPPP's 12. The two were followed by PML-N (11 candidates), BNP (10), NP (9), JUI-N (9) and PKMAP (8). Smaller and regional parties fielded another 75 candidates taking the tally to 284^{80} .

Party Trends

2013 Results

The party fortunes in the province reflect a fragmented and divided electorate denying any party a simple majority in seats won. The results, however, has the JUI and independents sharing the largest number of seats–4 each–followed by PKMAP securing 3 of the 14 seats. NP, PML-N and BNP account for the three other seats. Apart from two seats which had a party winning for the second time since 2002, the rest of the constituencies returned winners that won for the first time from their current party or independent platform⁸¹.

Winners' Status

There were four predominantly rural constituencies where 15-20% increase in the turnout was recorded while in another two predominantly rural and one predominantly urban constituency, there was an outstanding increase of over 20%

Woman and Democratic Governance

To create progress and open mindedness women's political empowerment is very important and women need to be in governance to make women's voice visible in policy making. In Pakistan majority of political female figures are wives, daughters, or sisters of

⁷⁹ FAFEN 2013, p.1053

⁸⁰http://www.fafen.org/site/v6/media/fafen_analysis/Election%20Results%20Report/Balochistan/Balochistan%20complete.pdf

⁸¹ FAFEN 2013, p. 1055

political families. This is the case in Balochistan but the ratio of even these woman is extremely low.

TDEA-FAFEN representative, Shehzad Anwer, presented the findings of the report on the performance of women legislators. According to the report, women make up 46% of Balochistan's population while their representation in the Provincial Assembly is 20%. There are 13 women lawmakers in the incumbent Provincial Assembly of Balochistan. A woman lawmaker represents nearly 358,292 women in the Assembly whereas each male lawmaker represents 105,186 men⁸².

Zubaida Jalal Khan contested in general elections held in 2002 from Balochistan under PML (Q) platform, she came in national prominence and public fame as a leading woman Minister and she served as an education Minster in the term November 2002 – November 2007.

In 2013 election eight political parties including Pakistan Muslim League (PML-N), Pakistan Tehreek-i-Insaf (PTI), Pakistan Peoples' Party (PPP), Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PkMAP), Jamiat Ulema-i-Islam Fazl (JUI-F), National Party (NP), Balochistan National Party (BNP) and Awami National Party (ANP), did not encourage female leadership roles from their platforms in Balochistan.

PML-N issued tickets to women during the last general and local bodies (LB) elections. It is reported fact that result of 1,450 contestants in 2013 was all male. In 2015 Rahila Hameed Durrani, of PMLN was unanimously elected as the first-ever female speaker of the Balochistan Assembly⁸³.

⁸² FAFEN 2017, p. 2

⁸³ Hizbullah Khan, Balochistan, May 23, 2017, little space for women lawmakers in Balochistan, The Express Tribune

Economic growth and Empowerment

According to UNDP⁸⁴, regional comparison of multidimensional poverty estimates for the MPI, H and A suggests that among Pakistan's provinces, multidimensional poverty is highest in Balochistan and lowest in Punjab. The proportion of people identified as multidimensional poor in urban areas is significantly lower than in rural areas – 9.4 percent and 54.6 percent, respectively. Also, in all four provinces, poverty in rural areas is significantly higher than in urban centers. Amongst regions, FATA appears to be experiencing highest levels of multidimensional poverty in terms of index value and incidence, followed by Gilgit Baltistan (GB) and Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK). The intensity of derivation is similar across the three regions.

Table No14: Multidimensional Poverty by Province/Region⁸⁵

| Region | | MPI | Incidence (H) | Intensity (A) |
|-------------|---------|-------|---------------|---------------|
| Balochistan | Overall | 0.394 | 71.2% | 55.3% |
| | Rural | 0.482 | 84.6% | 57.0% |
| | Urban | 0.172 | 37.7% | 45.7% |

Table No 15: Percentage Distributions of Earners by Employment Status 2015-201686 (Bureau of Statistics, 2016)

| | Rural | Urban |
|--------------------------|-------|-------|
| Employer | 2.01 | .36 |
| Self Employed | 17.72 | 26.72 |
| Contribution family work | 7.78 | 25.30 |
| Employee | 69.08 | 46.32 |
| Not economically Active | 3.41 | 1.30 |

The process of economic development in Balochistan is slow mainly because of the low population density, small size of markets and lack of basic amenities and absence of

⁸⁴ Multidimensional Poverty Index 2016, p. 2

⁸⁵ Multidimensional Poverty Index 2016, p. 2

⁸⁶ Bureau of Statistics, 2016

industrial infrastructure. Due to unstable political scenario economic development of Balochistan has always been a challenge. To strengthen economic structure of any region peace and stability is needed to attract Investor. Balochistan poverty levels are high as up to 35% of population lives below poverty line⁸⁷.

Table No 16: BISP/UNICEF District Ranking by Poverty Status 201188

| District | Poverty | Ranking |
|----------------|-------------|-----------|
| | Status by % | |
| Balochistan | 44 | Very poor |
| Jhal Magsi | 57.99 | Extremely |
| | | poor |
| | | district |
| Kech (Turbat) | 46.95 | Very poor |
| Khuzdar | 47.29 | Very poor |
| Killa Abdullah | | |
| Loralai | 38,56 | poor |
| Pishin | 38.51 | poor |
| Washuk | 58.22 | Extremely |
| | | poor |
| | | district |
| Zhob | 46 | Very poor |

Other factors hindering trade in Balochistan are low labor efficiency or lack of trained human resource, immobility, limited specialization in occupations, lack of awareness regarding trade and economic ignorance.

Poverty in Balochistan has enforced gender disparity levels to higher ranks as compare to rest of provinces. According to World Bank Official figures released in March 2017 the

⁸⁷ In-depth Interview: Sara Atta, Provincial Disaster Management Authority 2017, Annex 2

⁸⁸ http://bisp.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Poverty-Profile-1.pdf

national Labor force participation rate, female (ages 15+) is 25% in 2017 which was 14% in 1990 where as participation of Balochistan's female labor force stands at 6 to $7\%^{89}$

According to a USAID report on women's economic empowerment⁹⁰ Balochistan is the least developed province of Pakistan. Besides a higher incidence of poverty than other provinces, Balochistan also exhibits a higher level of gender disparity due to lack of education and conservative social norms. According to the Labor Force Survey 2010-11⁹¹, Balochistan's female labor force participation was at six percent. This is much lower than the national average of 15 percent or that of Punjab at 20 percent. Most women lack mobility and are largely homebound. Even women who are involved in agricultural activities serve as unpaid family workers and their ownership of important assets or land appears to be extremely limited. While homebound, the women of Balochistan inherit a rich tradition of embroidery. The quality of the embroidery is borne out by its demand from within the province as well as from other parts of the country.

Table No 17: Poverty indicator, Presence of Literate Woman in the Household92

| District | Yes | No |
|----------------|-------|-------|
| Jhal Magsi | 41.64 | 60.83 |
| Kech (Turbat) | 0.00 | 46.06 |
| Khuzdar | 33.82 | 50.98 |
| Killa Abdullah | 30.96 | 42.61 |
| Loralai | 32.44 | 40.79 |
| Pishin | 34.70 | 40.33 |
| Washuk | 50.23 | 58.76 |
| Zhob | 36.38 | 48.20 |

⁸⁹ https://data.worldbank.org/country/pakistan?view=chart%202017

⁹⁰ USAID report on women's economic empowerment, 2012, p. 7 https://www.fhi360.org/resource/usaid-womens-economic-empowerment-and-equality-assessment-report

⁹¹ http://www.pbs.gov.pk/content/labour-force-survey-2010-11

⁹² http://bisp.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Poverty-Profile-1.pdf

Ownership of Assets

According to Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey⁹³ 9 out of 10 married women do not own a house or land. Only 11% of women out of total population of Balochistan own a house, either alone or jointly and only 4% own land.

China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC).

The 3000 Km long CPEC routes that will link Gwadar, Balochistan with Xinjiang region in China, and this route will have a number of joining point at horizontal level throughout Pakistan. These points will connect the rest of the country with CPEC main routes. It is forecasted that CPEC will provide economic opportunities for local people in Pakistan but it will be very beneficial especially to Balochistan. CPEC is expected to result in improvemenst in living status of people particularly in rural areas. Rapid Infrastructure growth plus investment opportunity and small Industrial revolution is envision along CPEC routes⁹⁴.

USAID

USAID conducted "The Women's Economic Empowerment: Balochistan" project from 2009 to 2011 in Districts of Quetta, Mastung, Killa Saifullah, Loralai and Zhob. The project Objective were to improve conditions for broad-based economic growth. It also contributes focus on increased income generation opportunities, and gender equity.

This project was carried out in partnership with Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Mennonite Economic Development Associates (MEDA) and Water, Environment and Sanitation Society (WESS).

⁹³ P D H S, 2013, p. 13

⁹⁴ In-depth Interview Ms. Saira Atta, Director, the Directorate of Industries, Small Industries Wing, 4/12/2017

Energy

Economic development depends on the type of energy source and the usage of energy sources, like oil, natural gas, coal, renewable energy and hydro power. Pakistan is facing continual energy crisis for the last 12 years. The energy sector in Balochistan faces the same challenges of inadequate planning and infrastructure within the energy sector departments and communities. In Balochistan energy needs for heating and cooking purposes are fulfilled through biomass like firewood, animal and agricultural waste. Balochistan is hub of natural gas, but due to inadequate planning and unequal resource distribution among provinces, supply networks in Balochistan are limited. Only 3% gas consumers in Balochistan have access to this facility⁹⁵.

According to the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics PSLSM Survey of 2016, the housing units using electricity as source for lighting remains stagnant at 93 percent during the period 2014-15 and 2012-13. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa with 96 percent has the highest percentage of households using electricity as a main source for lighting while Balochistan with 81 percent has the lowest percentage. For cooking purposes gas remains a major source as fuel for cooking with 41 percent in 2014-15 as compared to 38 percent in 2012-13. Among provinces Sindh has the highest percentage of households i.e. 56 percent using gas as main fuel for cooking in 2014-15 as compared to 53 percent in 2012-13 and Balochistan has the lowest percentage with 25 percent in 2014-15 as compared to 23 percent in 2012-13.

Table no 18: PSLSM Survey Percent Distribution of Households by Fuel Used for Lighting⁹⁶

| PROVINCE & | FUEL USED FOR LIGHTING | | | | | |
|-------------|------------------------|---------|---------|-------|--------|--|
| DISTRICT | | | | | | |
| | ELECTRICITY | GAS/OIL | WOOD | OTHER | TOTAL | |
| | | | &CANDLE | | | |
| Balochistan | 80.73 | 15.12 | 2.64 | 1.51 | 100.00 | |

⁹⁵ FGD: CO BRDCEP District, 2017

⁹⁶ PSLSM p. 410-412

| urban | 97. 59 | 1.93 | 0.18 | 0.30 | 100.00 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|--------|--|
| Rural | 43.27 | 55.94 | 0 | 0.79 | 100.00 | |
| Jhal Magsi | 73.36 | 25.39 | 1.03 | 0.22 | 100.00 | |
| urban | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| Rural | 72.20 | 26.49 | 1.07 | 0.23 | 100.00 | |
| Loralai | 70.45 | 27.35 | 0 | 2.20 | 100.00 | |
| urban | 100.00 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | |
| Rural | 65.31 | 32.10 | 0 | 2.59 | 100.00 | |
| Kech (Turbat) | - | - | - | - | - | |
| urban | - | - | - | - | - | |
| Rural | - | - | - | - | - | |
| Khuzdar | 72.88 | 23.56 | 2.22 | 1.35 | 100.00 | |
| urban | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| Rural | 60.38 | 34.41 | 3.24 | 1.97 | 100.00 | |
| Killa Abdullah | 88.40 | 11.27 | 0.07 | 0.25 | 100.00 | |
| urban | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| Rural | 87.02 | 12.61 | 0.08 | 0.29 | 100.00 | |
| Pishin | 93.36 | 6.47 | 0.17 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| urban | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| Rural | 92.81 | 7.01 | 0.18 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| Washuk | 55.46 | 30.37 | 3.87 | 10.30 | 100.00 | |
| urban | - | - | - | - | 100.00 | |
| Rural | 55.46 | 30.37 | 3.87 | 10.30 | 100.00 | |
| Zhob | 89.03 | 10.97 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| urban | 100 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |
| Rural | 85.31 | 14.69 | 0 | 0 | 100.00 | |

The PSLSM tables below show that 80% population in Balochistan have access to electricity, however, they face frequent electrical outages sometimes lasting 8 hours in a day. In

Balochistan people are switching to solar power especially in rural areas as they can make use of this energy to improve their living conditions. According to Quetta electric Supply Company QESCO 2017, Balochistan minimum electricity need is around 1700 MW whereas only 600 MW watts are supplied⁹⁷.

Solar Power and World Bank

According to the Alternative Energy Development Board (AEDB), Balochistan is ideal for solar power generation. The AEDB envisioned energy supply to a greater part of Balochistan via solar energy but due to a lack of funding this vision never became a reality⁹⁸.

According to official website of WB, March 2017 The World bank has signed an agreement with Government of Pakistan to finance Balochistan biggest solar power projects from its Green Fund in an effort to combat energy crisis in Balochistan. Highlight of this project will be thirty thousand (30 000) tube wells charged by solar power⁹⁹.

Table No19: Organization working on Solar Energy projects 100

| Sr.no | | Working |
|-------|---------------------------------|------------|
| | | since Year |
| 1. | Water, Environment & Sanitation | 2012 |
| 2. | ARC (International Pakistan) | 2012 |
| 3. | IUCN world conservation union | 2011 |
| 4. | Save the children | 2013 |
| 5. | Concern worldwide | 2012 |
| 6. | SEHER (society for empowering | 2014 |
| | human resources | |
| 7. | BRSP(Balochistan rural support | 2013 |
| | Program) | |
| 8. | UN habitat | 2011 |

⁹⁷ http://www.gesco.com.pk/, 2017

⁹⁸ http://www.aedb.org/, 2017

⁹⁹ http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/pakistan

¹⁰⁰ Data Collected from the home pages of mentioned organizations

| 9. | IDSP Pakistan | 2014 |
|-----|-------------------------------|------|
| 10. | Taraqee foundation | 2014 |
| 11. | IUCN world conservation union | 2012 |

Wind power

Commercially exploitable wind resources exist in many parts of the Pakistan, especially in southern Sindh and coastal Balochistan, with monthly average wind speeds exceeding 7-8 m/s at some sites along the Keti Bandar Gharo corridor.

Apart from natural gas, Balochistan possesses a considerable potential for the development of alternative sources of energy, principally wind and solar. Balochistan's wind resource potential was estimated to be more than 20,000 MW, or roughly equal to the total installed generating capacity of Pakistan in 2011^{101} .

Coal and mining

Provincial Governments have granted more than 1,100 coal mining concessions to public and private sector companies, which carry out exploration and mining operations in the licensed/leased area. Two federally controlled organizations; Pakistan Mineral Development Corporation (PMDC) and Lakhra Coal Development Company [joint venture of PMDC, WAPDA & Government of Sindh] are engaged in extraction of coal in Sindh and Balochistan Provinces, producing about 558,000 tons and 235,000 tons of coal per annum (for 2015-16), respectively¹⁰².

_

 $^{^{101}}$ Government of Pakistan Islamabad, March 2007 Policy for Development of Renewable Energy for Power Generation Employing Small Hydro, Wind, and Solar Technologies

¹⁰² Finance Department, Islamabad, June 2017, Pakistan *Economic Survey 2016-17*, Government of Pakistan, chapter: Energy

Water

844 million people are living without access to safe water and Pakistan is no exception. Pakistan is facing a significant water crisis¹⁰³.

Balochistan has been under drought conditions since 2014 causing a major water crisis. Climate change, over-exploitation of groundwater and deforestation has added to the water $crisis^{104}$

"Balochistan is prone to drought with 60–70 percent of the rural population directly or indirectly vulnerable to its effects. Severe episodes were recorded in 1967–69, 1971, 1973–75, 1994, 1998–2002 and 2009–15. In 2012, the Ministry of Finance estimated that drought caused a loss of Rs 25 billion to the national exchequer. It led to increased food prices which, in turn, caused widespread malnutrition" ¹⁰⁵.

Karezes is a traditional system of tapping groundwater for irrigation and it has been practiced in Balochistan for centuries. The system is unique, as it needs no energy to pump groundwater it flows under gravity rules. Over the years, this system has come under great stress and the reasons are drought, decrease of water table and lack of ground water and another reason is installation of large number of deep tube wells .These tube wells have caused lowering of water table 106.

Balochistan is an arid zone which has a low percentage of rainfall. Drought has compelled people to either migrate or to rely on available water source and usually these sources are not hygienically clean in most of rural areas. The most vital sub-sectors of water use are: a) people; b) livestock; c) wild life and d) agriculture

Water resources of Balochistan can be broadly classified into two categories based on availability of water. These are:

- 1 Indus basin irrigation system;
- 2. outside the Indus basin system

¹⁰³ https://water.org/our-impact/water-crisis/, 2017

¹⁰⁴ In-depth Interview with Ghulam Rasool Jamal, Director, Environmental Protection Agency

¹⁰⁵ United Nation Development program , UNDP, Quetta Sep 15, 2015, *Drought risk management in Balochistan*, Balochistan University,

http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/presscenter/articles/2015/09/15/undp-participates-in-an-investigation-of-the-causes-of-drought-in-balochistan.html)

¹⁰⁶ Focus Group Discussion with Females, Girdi Pinkki, Qilla Abdullah, 2017

Balochistan has 14 dams among which prominent are Burj Aziz Khan Dam, Mirani Dam, Hingol Dam.

Fall of water Table in Balochistan

According to Haider¹⁰⁷ the water table is declining continuously in the Province. Studies suggest that deficit in Quetta sub-basin is about 21,000 AF per year and that the aquifer storage will be exhausted in 20 years. The groundwater is depleting every year, in some places at one meter per year, especially in the Pishin-Lora Basin. The Zhob and Nari river basins are not available for further groundwater development.

Water borne Diseases

Disposal of waste water is one of the key areas that can lead to water contamination and diseases if not done correctly. According to Public Health Department Balochistan in 2017 only 10% house- holds have access to proper disposal of waste water and 5% of Balochistan's populations have facilities and services available for proper disposal of solid waste.

Water borne Diseases are caused by the use of contaminated water. Contaminated water can cause many types of diarrheal diseases. according to the Balochistan Public Health Department 65 % of Rural Woman are suffering from infectious Diseases due to use of Contaminated water 108.

Women and water

In Balochistan, women are responsible for fetching water from a watercourse that is usually outside of their homes. Women use water for domestic purposes. In rural households of Balochistan almost 60% of women fetch water from a water source. Women are key stakeholders in water usage using water for domestic purposes, livestock rearing and crop handling¹⁰⁹.

¹⁰⁷ Syed Fazl-e-Haider, February 05, 2007, Irrigation schemes for Balochistan, Daily DAWN

¹⁰⁸ Interview with Director General Health Department, M. Hayat, 04/12/17

¹⁰⁹ Focus Group Discussion with Females, Girdi Pinkki, Qilla Abdullah, 2017

Table No. 20: According to Millennium Development Goals, 2011 Percentage Distribution of Employed Persons by Key Industry Division¹¹⁰

| Department | Balochistan | | Urban | | Rural | | | | |
|----------------------------|-------------|------|--------|-------|-------|--------|-------|------|--------|
| | Tota l | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female | Total | Male | Female |
| Electricity, Gas and Water | 1.2 | 1.2 | 0 | .084 | .84 | 0 | .35 | .35 | 0 |

Table No 21: According to District Profile: Water and Sanitation¹¹¹

| District | Water and Sanitation | | | | | |
|----------------|----------------------|------------|--------------|-------------|-----------------|--|
| | Using | Improved | Water | Purificatio | Public latrines | |
| | improve | sanitation | Schemes | n Plants | | |
| | d | | (Functional) | Functional | | |
| | drinking | | | | | |
| Jhal Magsi | 24 % | 14% | 12 | 2 | 2 | |
| Kech (Turbat) | 89% | 91% | 41 | 0 | 416 | |
| Khuzdar | 74% | 70% | 135 | 28 | 40 | |
| Killa Abdullah | 99% | 96% | 31 | 13 | 2 | |
| Loralai | 63% | 58% | 66 | 20 | 4 | |
| Pishin | 90% | 52% | 73 | 20 | | |
| Washuk | 82% | 67% | 44 | 2 | 62 | |
| Zhob | 70% | 62% | 60 | 11 | 2 | |

UNICEF Work on Water

UNICEF been working with different NGOs to promote WASH awareness program. The Society for Social Development (SSD) is working on improving the quality of life for low

¹¹⁰ United Nations Development Programme UNDP, 2011, Report *on the Status of Millennium Development Goals Balochistan*, Government of Balochistan, page No: 18

¹¹¹ http://www.ndma.gov.pk/Publications/Development%20Profile%20District%20Loralai.pdf

income inhabitants of Quetta. The Taraqee Foundation established in 1994 worked on WASH programs with UNICEF collaboration to develop School WASH program in Balochistan. Water Environment and Sanitation Society goal is to improve living standard of rural parts in Balochistan, they work on improvement of delivery social services like safe water, health and sanitation. UNICEF is supporting WESS for School and Community Wash programs¹¹². PHED (Public Health Engineering Department, 2010) is implementing "Clean Drinking Water for All" program that aims to install water purification plant in every Union council including some Tehsils of different district.

BRSP WATSAN Project

BRSP, WATSAN project is contributing in poverty alleviation by improving the status of drinking water and sanitation facilities at community level. BRSP aims to provide clean drinking water and sanitation facilities to the communities of Balochistan. Through WATSAN component, BRSP is implementing different projects with partnership of PHED and Education Department for rehabilitating the drinking water supply schemes, implementing community infrastructure schemes and school WATSAN facilities. This initiative also covers the improvement of post flood WASH facilities. BRSP has implemented numerous Drinking Water Supply Schemes (DWSS) and sanitation scheme though different projects in different regions of the Province. As of June 2014, the organization implemented 1,010 DWSS, 207 large and medium Drinking Water Supply Schemes (DWSS), 803 Small water supply schemes. 791,838 individuals (Female 380,082 & Male 411,756) now have access to improved drinking water facilities. 271 schools/ Madrasas WASH facilities have been provided or rehabilitated in different areas of Balochistan benefiting 46,411 individuals (621 Teachers & 45,790 Students)¹¹³.

-

¹¹² https://: www.unicef.org/pakistan/partners-1788html, 28th Dec 2017

¹¹³ https://www.brsp.org.pk/unicef.php, October 2017

Cross cutting themes

Balochistan has 30.3% of all Afghan refugees in Pakistan. The majority of Afghan refugees in Balochistan live near the border area. The border areas provide sanctuaries to terrorists and militant organizations.

According to Global Gender Gap report published by World Economic Forum ranked Pakistan at 143 among 144 countries. Pakistan was declared second-worst in the world for gender disparity for the second consecutive year¹¹⁴.

Women's rights

Discrimination of women rights are closely interconnected with poverty, lack of employment and commercial activities. Balochistan has strong patriarchal structures. Women are not allowed to make decisions, they do not have rights of mobility or to make a choices in selection of their marriage partner or ask for property inheritance and they are not allowed to make decision for their kid¹¹⁵.

Women of Balochistan are not encourage to participate in public campaigns such as election campaign work, which is very popular other provinces. Where women take the initiative to participate in voicing female issues they are usually discouraged by their families¹¹⁶.

Balochistan has the lowest literacy rate, female literacy rates stands at 25% this is seen as an example of gender discrimination¹¹⁷.

Despite the fact Balochistan has bestowed with abundance of natural resources the Province is lacking in infrastructure development. Balochi nationals are struggling to make center realize the imbalance in the use of Balochistan natural resources. Over US\$1 trillion worth of natural resources have been discovered in Balochistan including, gold, copper, black pearls, oil, semi-precious stones, coal, chromite and natural gas. These resources if used properly can bring about a dynamic change in the economy of Pakistan.

Balochistan women suffer from political and cultural constraints. Balochistan Women have the lowest literacy rate, high maternal mortality rate in Pakistan. Lack of employment

¹¹⁴ World Economic Forum, Geneva Switzerland, 2 November 2017, the Global Gender Gap Report 2017, Page no: 10

¹¹⁵ In-depth Interview Ms. Saira Atta, Director, the Directorate of Industries, Small Industries Wing, 4/12/2017

¹¹⁶ In-depth Interview Ms. Saira Atta, Director, the Directorate of Industries, Small Industries Wing, 4/12/2017

¹¹⁷ PSLM 2015, P.111

opportunities and lack of encouragement of women to develop work place competencies worsens the gender disparity gap. Lack of awareness of their rights and unavailability of resources deprive women of basic rights. The deep rooted patriarchal, orthodox beliefs system, lack of personal rights and tribal values hinder women becoming empowered¹¹⁸. According to Pakistan's first Women's Economic Empowerment Index, Punjab performed best (0.52) followed by Sindh (0.38), KP (0.35) and Balochistan stood at (0.26). The national figure was at 0.39 against a score of one. Pakistan's first Women's Economic Empowerment Index, 2017, P.139).

Table No 22: Aurat Foundation Overview of situation of VAW in Balochistan¹¹⁹

| Offences | No | | |
|----------------------|---------------------------------|--|--|
| No. of cases | 6 | | |
| Kidnapping/abduction | | | |
| Murder | 46 | | |
| Rape/gang rape | 4 | | |
| Suicide | 21 | | |
| Honor' killing | 77 | | |
| Domestic violence | 30 | | |
| Sexual assault | 0 | | |
| Acid throwing | 5 | | |
| Burning | 0 | | |
| Miscellaneous | 1 (miscellaneous cases Hurt & | | |
| | body injury 0 Threat to life 1) | | |
| Total | 190 | | |

Aurat Foundation

118 Interview Mohammad Zakir Nasir, Department of Women Development, Balochistan, 2017

¹¹⁹ Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation 2014 Violence against women in Pakistan a qualitative review of reported incidents January – December 2014, p.59

Aurat Foundation works throughout Pakistan, and one of the few NGOs to operate in Balochistan. Aurat have developed a grass root network of community based organizations in Balochistan, their projects include:

- 1. Gender Equity Program GEP (2010-2017) (USAID),
- 2. Leverage in social transformation of elected nominees LISTEN (July 2013- June 2017),
- 3. Social Mobilization Waseela-e-Taleem BISP (2012-2016).

Aurat launched a 16-day Programme against gender-based violence to create awareness in Balochistan society and mobilize people. The 16-day campaign begin from 25 November 2017, International Day for Elimination of Violence against Women, and continued till Human Rights Day December 10, 2017¹²⁰.

Hazara conflict

The Hazara, who are Shias and are distinguishable due to their features, have been a target for terrorist forces who want to eliminate them for political and religious-ideological reasons.

Members of the Hazara community reside in large numbers in Quetta. In the last decade or so, as part of a hate campaigns against the Shia sect by Islamist militant groups, the Shia Hazara have been murdered in targeted gun attacks and bombings, including suicide attacks. The majority of Hazara are Shia. In Quetta alone, there are around half a million Hazara, with the second biggest concentration in the province in the suburb of Mach. From 1999 onwards, at least 1,200 Hazara had been killed in targeted attacks. The Hazara Democratic Party (HDP), a secular political party founded in 2003, has been working for the betterment of the Hazara people in Balochistan. The party lost its founder, Hussain Ali Yousafi, to a terror attack by extremist militants in 2008 and has suffered numerous casualties in repeated terror attacks in Balochistan¹²¹.

¹²¹ Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, Lahore, June 22-25, *2013Balochistan giving the people a chance, 2013,* HRCP fact-finding mission P. 27

¹²⁰ https://www.af.org.pk/index.php, 2017

"Shia Muslims of various ethnic backgrounds make up at least 20% of the total population of Pakistan. The Hazara ethnic minority has been facing discrimination in Balochistan Province for a long time, and violence perpetrated against the community has risen sharply in recent years. Since year 2000, over 2000 Shia Hazara community members, including many women and children, have been killed or injured in Quetta. Most of them have been the victims of terrorist attacks by Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and Sipah-e-Sahaba Pakistan, which is a Sunni Muslim militant organization affiliated with Al-Qaeda and Taliban¹²²

Terrorism

According to The Diplomat News, "Since 2016, ISIS has been very active in Pakistan, and specifically in Balochistan. There have been five major attacks in Balochistan claimed by ISIS, including the latest one on the church. The other four involved Shah Noorani, the Quetta Police Academy, the Civil Hospital, and the Pir Rakhel Shah Shrine in Jhal Magsi, in which almost 220 were killed and some 450 were wounded. Despite the fact the Islamic militant organization has been taking responsibility for the attacks, Pakistani authorities have rejected the presence of ISIS in the country.

Table No 23: South Asian Terrorism portal: Fatalities in Balochistan: 2011-2017

| Years | Civilians | SFs | Terrorists | Total |
|-------|-----------|-----|------------|-------|
| 2011 | 542 | 122 | 47 | 711 |
| 2012 | 690 | 178 | 86 | 954 |
| 2013 | 718 | 137 | 105 | 960 |
| 2014 | 347 | 83 | 223 | 653 |
| 2015 | 247 | 90 | 298 | 635 |
| 2016 | 251 | 153 | 229 | 633 |
| 2017 | 183 | 77 | 83 | 343 |
| Total | 2978 | 840 | 1071 | 4889 |

Gender Differences

According to Aurat Foundation National baseline study for Gender Equity Program 2012

¹²² https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Human rights violations in Balochistan, 2017

"It is generally admitted that Gender based Violence (GBV) begins at home, and from the very beginning inequalities start to become visible between male and female siblings. GBV has been defined as prostitution; physical beating of women by men, and women forcibly confined at home and not allowed to step out of the house. In Balochistan women are said to be forced into frequent pregnancies – seen as a form of sexual violence – due to the husband's wish to have more male offspring".

Equal Rights

Among females, 25 % and 19 % respondents in KP and Balochistan respectively held the opinion that women should not be given equal rights and opportunities. Interestingly on probing 'why not', a majority (62 %) of simply argued that 'women are not equal to men' and therefore should not have equal rights. The other arguments given in favor of unequal rights include; 'women are weaker than men', 'norms and traditions do not allow' 'women are less knowledgeable than men' women are less capable', and 'women make emotionally driven decisions'.

1. Right to select the partner in marriage

As for the right to choose a partner for marriage, Nationally 25% female respondent and 38% male respondents out of total sample size response was in negative.

2. Right to Divorce

Nationally pnly 47 percent of male and 56 percent of female respondents were in favor of giving this right to women. Results from Balochistan show 39% female 31% male were in favor to give woman the right of divorce.

3. Right to Decide 'Haq-e-Meher' or Male Dowery

The survey indicates that Nationally around 56 % female and 60 % male respondents say that women have this right in Pakistan. One surprising result right in Punjab and Sindh Provinces is that more females than males think that women do not have this right, while the reverse pattern is observed in KPK and Balochistan Provinces. In Balochistan 30% female and 20 % male respondent consider it as a woman's right to decide.

4. Right to 'Khula

Khula is the right of women in Islam to seek divorce or separation. 66 % of females do not think women in Balochistan have this right. Whereas only 39 % female and 28 % male

respondent acknowledge that female has the right to ask for Khula. More than half of respondent replied that they do not have any knowledge regarding this right.

5. Dowry

Majority of National respondents (68 %females and 76 % males) are in favor that girls should be given dowry. The percentage of Balochistan was 83% female and 66% male agreed.

6. Participation in Sporting Events

Nationally, more than 50 percent of both males and females respondents said that girls should participate in regional, national and international sporting events. The results show considerable gender differences in responses in Balochistan and Gilgit with 80% females favoring participation.

Nationally, 34 percent male and 17 percent female respondents said that women should not be the head of State. In Balochistan 17% female and 20% male give negative response in this regard.

7. Women Claiming Their Rights

In Balochistan few women believe that the environment for women is changing, and they can leave their home for education and employment. Nationally 88% of male s and 71 % of female respondents cast their votes in the last election. In Balochistan 93% female and 91% male use the right to votes. 84% males acknowledge that women should be given the right to vote and they supported their household females to caste vote.

8. Computerized National Identity Card

87% females and 90% male in Balochistan give affirmative response for having or supporting Computerised National Identity Card.

9. Inheritance Rights

The importance of securing women's property and inheritance rights has been recognized, in a growing number of national, and international laws (e.g., in the International Covenants on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights and on Civil and Political Rights and the Platform of Action adopted at the 1995 Beijing World Conference on Women). In Balochistan 82% female and 65% male were aware of the woman inheritance right but only 32% female and 45% male acknowledge that Inheritance Right for woman are practically being followed.

10. Women's Empowerment and Decision Making Women working for a Living

Nationally, 71% female and 52% males responded that woman should work for a living. In Balochistan 30% female and 18% male confirmed that in their household female go outside to earn livelihood

11. Decision Making

In Balochistan 65% female and 39% male believed that women should be involved in financial decision-making. Average score for daily life decision making of Balochistan was 7.4 out of 10.

12. Domestic Violence

In Balochistan 73% female and 57% male said that male no right to hit a female. Domestic violence prevalence (do man hit female in our house hold) 39% female and 23% male replied in positive.

13. 'Karo-Kari' and 'Wanni'

Nationally 3% female and 6% male of total respondents agreed Karo Kari, honour killings, as justified custom. For Wanni women given in compensation for male sins. Nationally response was 5 % female and 7% male agree. In Balochistan 19% female and 27 % male responded that Karo-Kari is a justified Custom. 32% female and 21% male supported Wanni as a justified Custom.

14. Sexual Violence

Highest 6 % incidences were observed in Balochistan Province whereas Nationally respondents reported only 1.6% reported of being sexually abused.

List of Reference

Ahmed Saleem, Islamabad 20 Nov 2017, Research Fellow, Sustainable Development policy institute (SDPI)

Alternative Energy Development Board (AEDB) Balochistan, 12 Dec 2017. (Online available from: http://www.aedb.org/

Aurat Foundation, 2012 Gender Difference Understanding perception National baseline study for Gender Equity Program, USAID

Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation 2014 Violence against women in Pakistan a qualitative review of reported incidents January – December 2014

Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation, Islamabad, 18 Dec 2017 Online available from https://www.af.org.pk/index.php, 2017

Balochistan AIDS Control Program, 27th Dec 2017, Online available from http://www.bacp.gob.pk/, December 2017

Balochistan Government, 2017-2018, Provincial Budget Key fact, health Section

Bureau of Statistics, Islamabad, March 2016, *Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (2014-15)*, Government of Pakistan Statistics Division, Pakistan

Dams in Pakistan, 27th Dec 2017, Wikipedia Online available from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_dams_and_reservoirs_in_Pakistan

Dan Rohrmann, Islamabad, March 2015, *Out-of-School Children in the Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Punjab and Sindh Provinces of Pakistan 2013*, Global Initiative on Out-of-School Children United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund (UNICEF) forward (Country Representative UNICEF)

Development of Statistics Balochistan Quetta, 2017 Pakistan Census, 2017 District-wise government health facilities, Government of Pakistan, page No 197 to 199

Directorate of Colleges, Quetta 2011-12 Table: Detail of Government College in the province, Department of Higher Education, Government of Baluchistan, BEMIS also available online from: http://emis.gob.pk/

Education Department, Quetta, 2015, Situation *Analysis for Balochistan Education Sector Plan*, Government of Balochistan Pakistan

Election Commission of Pakistan: Islamabad, Oct 2017, Registered Voters in Pakistan, Government of Pakistan online available from https://ecp.gov.pk/frmGenericPage.aspx?PageID=3047

Finance Department, Islamabad, June 2017, Pakistan *Economic Survey 2016-17*, Government of Pakistan, chapter: Energy

Focus Group Discussion, Quetta BRSP, 6 Dec 2017, Community Organization Representative BRDCEP Project District, Participants 18 (7 female, 11 Male)

Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN) Islamabad, 2013 *Election Result Analysis: 2013 Complete Report*, Balochistan chapter

Free and Fair Election Network (FAFEN), Islamabad, 2017, *Performance of woman legislator, Performance of Balochistan Assembly's Women Legislators June 2013 - February 2017*.

Ghulam Rasool Jamal, Quetta, 4 Dec 2017 Director, Environmental Protection Agency, Balochistan

Girdi Pinkki, Qilla Abdullah, 5 Dec 2017, Focus Group Discussion FGD BRSP.

Government of Balochistan, 27th Dec 2017, *Balochistan Nutrition Program for Mothers & Children*, online available from http://bnpmc.gob.pk.

Government of Balochistan, Quetta June 2017, *Budget Briefings Balochistan Budget 2017-2018*, and Government of Pakistan, also online available from: http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_docman&task=cat_view&gid=167 4&Itemid=677

Government of Balochistan, Quetta, 2015, *Mineral Reserves in Balochistan*, (online available from

http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/~balochi/images/minespdf/Mineral%20Reserves%20in %20Bln%20DGMM.pdf) 22 Dec 2017.

Government of Pakistan Islamabad, March 2007 Policy for Development of Renewable Energy for Power Generation Employing Small Hydro, Wind, and Solar Technologies

Hizbullah Khan, Balochistan, May 23, 2017, *little space for women lawmakers in Balochistan* Human Rights Commission of Pakistan, Lahore, June 22-25, *2013 Balochistan giving the people a chance, 2013,* HRCP fact-finding mission

M.Hayat, Quetta, 4th Dec 2017, Director General Public Health Department

Management Systems International (MSI), Islamabad, February 11, 2012 Balochistan Evaluation Report Women's Economic Empowerment, United States Agency for International Development (USAID)

Ministry Of Finance, Islamabad, June 2017, Pakistan *Economic Survey 2016-17*, Government of Pakistan, Chapter Health & Nutrition

Mohammad Zakir Nasir, Quetta, 7 Dec 2017, Director, Department of Women Development, Balochistan

Ms. Saira Atta, Quetta, 4 Dec 2017, Directorate of Industries, Small Industries Wing Musharraf Zaidi, Islamabad 21st Nov 2017 Campaign Director,

Alif Ailaan National Institute of Population Studies, Islamabad, 2014, Demographic and Health Survey 2012-13 Key Findings, Government of Pakistan, ICF International

National Institute of Population Studies, Islamabad, 2014, Demographic and Health Survey 2012-13 Key Findings, Government of Pakistan, ICF International

Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Islamabad Dec, 2016 *The Household Integrated Economic Survey*, Government of Pakistan Statistics Division

Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Pakistan, Islamabad, March- 2016, *Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (2014-15)*, Government of Pakistan

Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS), Islamabad, 2014-2015, Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLM), 2015, Government of Pakistan

Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Islamabad, 2017, Census Results -Provisional Summary of 6th Population and Housing Census-2017, Government of Pakistan

Planning & Development Department, July 18, 2011, *District Development, Profile*, Government of Balochistan, UNICEF

Provincial TB Control Program, Balochistan 29th Dec 2017. online available from https://www.ntp.gov.pk/cmsPage.php?pageID=25

Quetta electric Supply Company, QESCO 20 Dec 2017 Government of Balochistan. Online available from: http://www.gesco.com.pk/

Sara Atta, Quetta, 4th Dec 2017*In-depth Interview*: Provincial Disaster management Authority,

Shah Meer Baloch, Quetta, December 19, 2017, *After Quetta Church Attack, Pakistan Continues to Blame Foreign Powers for Terrorism*, The Diplomat

South Asia Forum for Education Development (SAFED), 02 August 2017, Annual *Status of Education Report ASER 2016*, Idara-e-taleem-o Ahgaee

South Asian Terrorism portal, 19th March 2017, *Balochistan Assessment – 2017*, alone available from: http://www.satp.org/default.asp

Syed Fazl-e-Haider, February 05, 2007, Irrigation schemes for Balochistan, Daily DAWN

The Global Polio Eradication Initiative, Islamabad, April 21, 2017, *Pakistan Polio Program Update*, Government of Pakistan Online available from http://www.endpolio.com.pk/, December 2017

The International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES) Islamabad, 2013, IFES-PK Factsheet Government Balochistan

The water crisis, 26th Dec 2017 Online available from https://water.org/our-impact/water-crisis/, 2017

The World Bank, Pakistan, 10 Dec 2017 Solar *Power project details,* (online available from: http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/pakistan

The World Bank, 24 Dec 2017 *Country Profile, Indicators* (online available from: https://data.worldbank.org/country/pakistan?view=chart)

UNICEF, 28th Dec 2017, *Partnerships and Program* (online available from: https://www.unicef.org/pakistan/partners1788.html)

UNICEF, Islamabad, 2012 *National Nutrition Survey 2011*, Planning and Development Division Government of Pakistan, Aga Khan University,

UNICEF, October 2017, *WATSAN project report*, Balochistan Rural support Program BRSP; Project detail (online available from: https://www.brsp.org.pk/unicef.php)

United Nation Development program, UNDP, Quetta Sep 15, 2015, Drought risk management in Balochistan, Balochistan University, (Online Available from: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/presscenter/articles/2015/09/15/undp-participates-in-an-investigation-of-the-causes-of-drought-in-balochistan.html)

United Nation Development Program, Islamabad March 2016, *Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan, Report, Sustainable Development Goals*, Government of Pakistan

United Nation International Children Fund (UNICEF) 2015, Islamabad, Progress Report 2013-2015 Results for children in Pakistan Birth Registration

United Nation International Children Fund (UNICEF) Islamabad 2011, An *Analysis of NSER*, *Poverty Profile 2010-11*, Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP)

United Nations Development Programme UNDP, 2011, Report *on the Status of Millennium Development Goals Balochistan*, Government of Balochistan

UN Women, Islamabad, 2017, Women's Economic Participation and Empowerment-Status Report 2016, Page no: 139

Wikipedia (2017), Balochistan and Pakistan (online) available from: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Balochistan, Pakistan) 20th Dec 2017

Wikipedia article, 2017 *Hazara conflict, Human rights violations in Balochistan* 2016, (online available from

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Human rights violations in Balochistan, 2017)

Wikipedia, 27 Dec 2017, Afghans in Pakistan (Online available from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Afghans in Pakistan)

World Bank, Pakistan, 2011 Balochistan Development issues and Prospects, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Federally *Administered Tribal Areas and Balochistan*, Multi Donor Trust Fund

World Economic Forum, Geneva Switzerland, 2 November 2017, the Global Gender Gap Report 2017

ANNEX II – Interviews and Transcriptions

Irssa Ahuja

Ahmed saleem

| Department | Sustainable Development policy institute |
|----------------|--|
| Meeting with | Ahmed Saleem |
| Contact person | Ahmed Saleem |
| Contact Number | 03005544163 |
| Meeting | Ahmed Saleem , Irssa Ahuja |
| participant | |
| Date | 20/11/2017 |
| Time | 3.00 to 4.00 |
| Background | Ahmed Saleem has been working with SDPI for last 15 Years, he is Senior Advisor Education & Religious Diversity. , He is human right activist , Journalist , writer and Research scholar He has done substantial amount of work on Indo-Pakistan Partition, Bangladesh pre separation, Balochistan struggle, he gives an in-depth Historical account to different Human right struggles. |
| Description | It was really nice of Mr. Saleem to give me time to discuss and to share his insight regarding Balochistan and share his contacts in this regards According to Ahmed Saleem 1. Disturbance in Balochistan is based on distribution of resources. separatist moments are active because Center has deprived them of their own resource 2. Center is (even right now) deciding for the use of resource (of Balochistan) on their own , they are not asking for the consent and there is lack of profit sharing 3. Center take all the natural resources from Balochistan and deprive people of Balochistan from their right to use the resource for themselves. 4. We can understand usually government take resources and give it to other provinces and in return they facilitate the land where the resources are take , in form of infrastructure development and enhancement of human resource , in this case Balochistan is totally deprived , it is least developed province with lowest of development indicator and it suffer from multilayer gender parities 5. He inform about his book (Balochistan from Independence to provincial dependence) (he promised to send his book to office as he was out of copies) 6. Now many separatist are giving up arms , but still Establishment is not working toward the solution of the problem 7. Balochistan stand at the lowest for Gender awareness , people are scared |

| | Governance . it will take series of different development project to win people of Balochistan 8. Gender practice will prevail only if woman start taking participation in governance , financial Sector and industrial sector 9. He shared Human activist shah Mahmood Mari contact in Balochistan with Me : and promised that he will introduced us to him for contact establishment |
|------------------|---|
| Analysis | Gap and Disparities Female education is very low but female awareness level to medical health, Hygiene is non-existent in rural area of Balochistan Good practices As far I have seen They respect their female more than the indicator show in other provinces but due to security force upression and lack of Infrastructure and improper Human resource, they have literally locked their female in houses, because according to them they want to protect them If they are given the right opportunity they will let their female come out of their home and will allow them to get education and work in governments and private sector. Indicator of change For this question Mr. Ahmed Saleem Smiled and add for me indicator of change will be Balochistan people handling their natural resources and most importantly they will get equal profit sharing Gender Performance Indicators Woman given proper right in Property or inheritance |
| Suggestions | Natural Resources decision making should be in hands of Government and people of Balochistan AID agencies should work on Hygiene project with female Legal right campaign is very important for female and awareness of legal right for them is very important 3. |
| Reading material | Balochistan from Independence to Provincial NON-autonomy |

Meeting with Alif Ailaan

| Department | Alif Ailaan |
|--------------|--|
| Meeting with | Musharaf Zaidi |
| Meeting | 1. Musharaf Zaidi |
| participant | 2. Salman Naveed Khan |
| | 3. Afyia Zia |
| | 4. Irssa Ahuja |
| Date | 21/11/2017 |
| Time | 4:00 to 5:00 |
| Background | Alif Ailaan was launch in February 2013 for education development and improvement from Center to public in Pakistan. |
| | Their goal is to get every Pakistani girl and boy into school, keep them learning and ensure that they receive quality education. |
| | The campaign is run by small team of media and strategic communications specialists with experience from across the world. Alif Ailaan is funded by UK Department for International Development |
| Description | They Explain Alif Ailaan is engaged with Pakistan's education system at different level with different stake holders covering policy making, advocacy, Outreach to parents and communities through grassroots activists and civil society partners, they Engage school heads, teachers and education managers, arrange targeted campaigns in print, on radio and television, and on social media. Plus they are in Research and data compilation to assist decision makers, policy developers regarding discourse in education |
| | According to them poverty is not a problem in Balochistan, Balochistan is low in every Social development indicator because of its lack of properly policy planning and gap in service delivery |
| | • Enrollment of children in school is not a major problem, but to keep them in schools is an issues, Children dropout rate is a major issues in the 7districts EU is planning to work. Emphasis should be given to keeping children in school, we should find out solution to counter this high drop-out rate |
| | Balochistan Education Management Information System BEMIS is doing great work and their data is quite trust worthy, Alif Ailaan Uses their data as reference |
| | BEMIS have established collages system in Balochistan, they are very reliable and have a better education system (Balochistan Residential Collages) (BRC) |
| | Education system need state level comparative analysis, Alif Ailaan has conducted few comparative analysis, e.g; study on Matriculation, comparative analysis of the education department in Balochistan. It helps a lot in understanding they dynamics of existing status and problem |
| | Alif Ailaan partners with EIMS, BEMIS at different level as they find these organization trust worthy |

| | Balochistan and its governance fundamentally lack in Creativity , they do not think outside the box |
|------------------|--|
| | Political owner ship and Nepotism is the major issues behind untrained Human resource, person in power abused his influence to get his favorite people jobs, hence those people are obliges to him not the recruitment process hence they do not perform properly and usually they are not qualified for the jobs advertised |
| | Balochistan Government has always been ignored by the federal government, it BoG need to be more active regarding resource allocation and Budgetary distributions |
| | Balochistan University of Technology is doing very well, Universities like BUT are very important to expedite the development process |
| | Small Private school are establishing very well in Balochistan |
| | Balochistan Budgetary Allocation for Education is still very low, it need 40% increase to meet the need of the growing population |
| | They give shared their contacts in Balochistan plus they provided data sources for |
| | Literature review |
| Analysis | Gap and Disparities |
| | 1. Lack of educational institution for female at district level |
| | 2. Lack of technical training opportunities for female teachers |
| | 3. Less school for female as compared to Boys |
| | Good practices |
| | People are ready for Scio-economical Change , whatever program is implement |
| | they welcome it and try to support the agencies working in development sector |
| | Indicator of change |
| | Female school teacher in boys school |
| | Gender Performance Indicators |
| | Gender free school in every district of Balochistan |
| Suggestions | 1. Recruitment of teachers from external source(national and international) |
| | to Provide a boost to the education system |
| | 2. On job training of female teacher to polish their skills |
| Reading material | Status of MDGs in Balochistan by UNDP |
| 1 | |

Meeting with NRSP

| Meeting with | |
|--------------|---|
| Department | National Rural Support Program |
| Meeting with | Khaleel Ahmed Tetlay, Chief Operating Officer |
| Meeting | Khaleel Ahmed Tetlay and NRSP Team |
| participant | William Pitkin |
| | Afiya Zia |
| | Nadeem Bashir |
| | Irssa Ahuja |
| Date | 21/11/2017 |
| Time | 3:00 to 4:00 |
| Background | NRSP was established in 1991, is the largest R SP in the country in terms of outreach, staff and development activities. |
| | It is a non-profit, Non-Political organization working for the rural social development |
| | NRSP's mandate is to alleviate poverty by harnessing people's potential and undertake development activities in Pakistan. It has a presence in 64 Districts in all the four Provinces including Azad Jammu and Kashmir through Regional Offices and Field Offices. NRSP is currently working with more than 3.2 million poor households organized into a network of 201,218 Community Organizations. With sustained incremental growth, it is emerging as Pakistan's leading engine for poverty reduction and rural development. |
| | NRSP works to release the potential abilities, skills and knowledge of rural men and women, to enable them to articulate their aspirations and to effectively marshal the resources they need to meet their identified needs. The purpose is poverty alleviation - enabling people to break the cycle of poverty, which begins with lack of opportunity, extends to the well-known miseries of economic and nutritional poverty and leads new generations to endure the same conditions. The process is social mobilization - bringing people together on new terms for a common purpose. The conceptual tools are 'social guidance' (recruiting local men and women who will take on a leadership role), advocacy, capacity building and awareness raising. The programm tools are training, support to institutions, micro-credit, infrastructure development, natural resource management and 'productive linkages'. |
| | Our purpose as an advocate for the poor is to bring the concerns of economically-marginal men and women to public consciousness and to affect policy so that the poor are brought into the mainstream of the economy. |
| Description | NRSP people explain that the core assumption of NRSP's philosophy is that there is a tremendous willingness amongst the people to help themselves. However, people cannot harness this willingness on their own. There is a |

| | need to mobilize it. To achieve this, a support mechanism is required that can ensure the provision of social guidance to the people. Social guidance initiates a process wherein the communities learn to organize into socially viable groups, enhance their skills, expand their collective and individual resource base and optimally utilize their available resources. • Experience has taught NRSP that in the process of social guidance, the availability of an honest local level activist is vital. • The idea behind the process of social guidance is to find out what people really want to do themselves and to assess whether whatever they want to do is possible while keeping in view the resource constraints. If it seems that the identified activity is practical, then NRSP assists the community in arranging the desired resources which may be credit, technical assistance, or specialized skill training for overcoming those constraints. • As a result of effective management, despite financial constraints, NRSP has managed to extent its Programme outreach to twenty four districts of all four provinces and Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJK). • NRSP is working hand-in hand with BRSP, • BRSP has established a gender policy, understanding toward Gender policy is very important, they have a gender Coordinator • NRSP was active in 21 district of Balochistan but after establishment of BRSP it is now active in5 district of Balochistan • Gender Sensitive Policies are very important for social development, BRSP policies are progressing toward gender sensitization This meeting was more about introduction, break the ice and understanding of both party positions, this meeting created a clearer picture of consultant work |
|------------------|--|
| Suggestions | Gender District Profile are needed to make development program Gender sensitive 4. |
| Reading material | Material of NRSP was sent via email |

| Department | Public Health Department |
|----------------|--|
| Meeting with | Mr.M. Hayat |
| Contact Number | 081 - 9211356 |
| Meeting | Ms. Irssa Ahuja |
| participant | Ms Syeeda |
| Date | 4/12/2017 |
| Time | 10.00 to 11.30 |
| Website | They are still in process of making |
| Background | Department of Health works under the Government of Balochistan. 'Minister |
| | Health is In-charge. Secretary Health is Head of the Department while -DGHS is the Head of attached department - The Health Secretariat is the apex management unit for the entire health department. |
| | Provincial Health Department was established in 1971 when Balochistan was declared as province after end of one unit. in 2001 after devolution the Divisional Head Quarters were abolished and 'The District Health Management came under the District Governments. Executive District Officer Health (EDO Health) is the district manager health. At present 29 functioning districts are established in the province. In 2010 after 18th amendment, health policies were decentralized and power was given to provinces to invest in their own citizens. But the power given is not fully used in Balochistan, as evidenced by the current healthcare crisis and low healthcare spending. |
| Description | Mr. Hayat informed that Technical Staff are less as compared to increase in the population The health indicators in Balochistan are very poor and Infrastructure of the health institutes are not up to mark which adds up to the issue, health indicators like MNCH are higher than other provinces. Though health sector remain the focus of welfare programs launched by government, but discrepancies, misuse of public funds and lack of proper trained human resource in this sector caused problem to persist Main diseases that are prevailing and have no or very less relief Malaria, Typhoid, Hepatitis, gastrointestinal and respiratory disorders In rural areas health status are even worse. According to an estimate, a total of 1500 health units spread over the province. There is only one doctor available for 2000 persons, in average. Lack or absence of female health staff including female doctors in rural Balochistan worsen the situation. |

- Trained staff wants to work in the Quetta especially female majority are not ready to go to backward area (even if we facilitate them with house, vehicle and rural extra stipend) these qualified staff tends to stay in Quetta
- Balochistan Trained medical staff needs training to be able to use new scientific equipment, majority of them do not know how to use ultra sound apparatus and there are almost .05% nurses or female doctor or female technical staff, who know how to operate ultra sound machine
- Problem arises when majority of Hospital have male staff and family of
 patients, denies a female to be checked by a male Doctor or operated by
 male staff or technical examination done by male staff. The male relatives
 of a female patient say to doctors if their daughter, mother or wife dies they
 do not care but they won't let a male doctor examine her, despite constant
 public messages these people do not let go of old pattern
- They have 3 well- equipped hospital in Quetta
 - 1. Civil Hospital
 - 2. Bolan Medical complex
 - 3. SMH Quetta
- Woman who come for check-up 80 % of the cases are depressed, anemic, and are suffering from multiple Pregnancy Syndrome, our hospital need to have Counselor to psychological heal these woman. But unfortunately there is only few psychiatrists but no Counselor
- Biggest issues faced by Balochistan health sector is lack of trained staff, trained doctors and trained nurses
- There is only one trauma center in Quetta
- Linkage between different medical institution, medical department and medical experts is very important because that can ensure diligence of health ministry and Public private partnership is need of time to facilitate rural woman
- We need to develop Coordination and as well we need to develop what's app group to circulate information and be proactive in facilitation of patients
- Health department welcome woman as a staff member but lack of properly trained female to take up leadership roles are very few (lack of proper trained human resources), if there are female doctor they rarely take up rural area as their duty station
- Since monitoring and evaluation system is poor culprits get away with stealing of medicines, taking bribe in hospitals
- Hospital are gender sensitive they address to female at priority bases but it's the family of these woman who are backward and they do not let male

doctor exam female patient ,hospital and clinic prefer female staff as well but again there is a major gap of human resource and requirement

- Gender assessment of Health department and health institution is needed to develop right route for future functioning
- He informed us that according to his observation woman are more acceptant and open toward Family Planning techniques
- Mother mortality rate in Quetta is 10 app. out of 1000, but problem is that people bring case to Quetta Hospital very late.
- For the question of Gender policy with in the department and work plan in accordance to particular policy he did not replied anything solid as if he had no knowledge for this. but he inform us that whenever they are hiring staff they give consideration to female and ratio of male female in his department is balanced
- According to them Public messages are already gender oriented, they do
 not need any up gradation but he added that these messages are only in
 urban area they should be in rural sites as well
- Donor and government are already working in multiple programs like AIDS control program, it started back in 2007 and it is still effectively working for people living at high risk
- Medical Staff need to be trained in BIO_Ethics or this program should be added to study program of health sciences'
- Whenever we make press releases we keep gender balance in our information

5.

Analysis

Gap and Disparities

Female trained staff tends to stay in Quetta. If government facilitate them with things still they do not take up rural placement . field staff do not go to their placement especially lady health workers

There are no lady health workers or operational BHU in majority of rural area, he informed that lady health worker go to every settlement and they are allotted certain number of household to be covered in certain period of time, but in accordance with my field visit to Kila Abdualah, I found out that there are no operational BHUs nor any lady health worker visits in the village

Good practices

They give special Incentives to female Doctors / nurses / medical staff to work in Rural area but this practice in relatively new.

Indicator of change

They envision to develop support group at the grass root level , something like BHU in which female staff will operate the procedures

| | Gender Performance Indicators DG of public Health Department attended training on gender and health issues only once in his profession career back in 2008 provided by PEMAN (USAID funded program) |
|------------------|---|
| Suggestions | Government must announce special and attractive packages for female medical staff to serve in rural Balochistan. Gender assessment of Health department and health institution is needed to develop right path for futuristic functioning, They should have gender audit of Department Training on Hygiene and provision of sanitary pad and medicine for young female is very important Balochistan need trained female medical staff (Nurses, Midwifes, Technical assistance, Doctors and professor doctor and technicians) Health department need more public messages showing male doctors checking or talking to female and their relative male members this will cover the lack of human resource and eradicate gender imbalance at rural level Public service messages should cover pregnant woman and taking her to hospital at proper time with proper preparations (like UNICEF campaign for Punjab in 2008) |
| | Health department should team-up with Grass root organization /VSO for Mobile medical Facilitation for woman Labor room are need in BHU or mobile Labor room medical service are needed. For mobile service Duty should be given to staff in Quetta on rotation bases (every nurse and doctor need to make two visit per month as a compulsory part of their house job and Job descriptions) |
| Reading material | Status of MDGs in Balochistan by UNDP Health Facility Assessment – Balochistan Provincial Report, TRF and Government of Balochistan 2012 Health Facility Assessment – Balochistan District Quetta, TRF and Government of Balochistan 2012 |

Meeting with PDMA

| Department | Provincial Disaster management Authority |
|----------------|--|
| Meeting with | Attaullah Mengal |
| Contact Number | 92-81-9241117 |
| Meeting | Attaullah Mengal |
| participant | Sana Khan (Gender Expert) |
| | Irssa Ahuja |
| | Saeeda (BRSP) |
| Date | 4/12/2017 |
| Time | 12.00 to 1.00 |
| Website | http://pdma.gob.pk/ |
| Background | Balochistan Provincial Disaster Management Authority in order to promote disaster risk management approaches through coordination and collaboration to prevent and minimize damage to humans, livestock, property and environment. Mission of PDMA Balochistan is to ensure the protection of the people, property, infrastructure, and material resources in order to minimize injury, loss of life, and damage to property resulting from any kind of disaster. |
| Description | Attullah Mengal give us fifteen min to brief on to his department, he explained background of department and Explained structures of its working • Government of Balochistan will provide for continuity of management function, damage assessment, public and private and immediate attention to the re-establishment of normal operations so as to restore the normal economic functions whenever disaster strikes. The government of Balochistan will provide for the incorporation of Disaster Risk Reduction in its development program. Prevention, reconstruction, rehabilitation are the most important aspect of PDMA working |
| | After fifteen minute their Gender Expert Sana Khan Joined us from there onward she answer question and Mr. Attaullah Left the room for another appointment Ms Sana Khan informed us that she had recently joined PDMA as a gender expert, she is still in the learning process and she does not have access to data as well. She told us that she will share whatever information she has learnt so far. PDMA started working actively after 2010 flash floods to safeguard IDP's. they provided support in medical and lively hood development Response Activities of PDMA Activate Emergency Operations Centre (EOC) Deploy district Coordinators for the smooth functions of the response |

- Conduct initial assessment of disaster affected areas and determine the extent of volume, loss damage and relief required
- Coordinate and inform all concerned departments and stakeholders to get prepare for emergency response (UN Agencies, DDMUs and organizations working on disasters)
- Ensure the provision of food, drinking water, medical supplies and non-food items to the affected population.
- Prepare a transition plan from relief to recovery program.
- Organize regular media and public information briefings.
- With support from humanitarian agencies will prepare situation Report on daily and weekly basis and circulate to the relevant departments, UN, DDMAs and other I/NGOs working on the disasters
- PDMA Balochistan made a Gender & Child Cell (GCC) on 25th of May 2012. The GCC was established with the support of UN Women, with the aim of incorporating gender in disaster risk reduction (DRR) efforts in the province.
- The Gender Task Force (GTF) is functional in the province they provide support to different department to form clusters in case of emergency and provide advisory support to clusters on gender mainstreaming. They train and provided Gender Focal Points to clusters with proper screening and they make sure gender mainstreaming activities are added to all the program activities
- A Planning and Capacity Building Associate has also been designated by PDMA Balochistan to facilitate clusters in gender mainstreaming in their projects.
- PDMA have provide WATTAN cards to various community and in this WATTAN card they provide 60 thousand rupees to per house (she did not have any fact and figure how many house hold they have catered)
- They are working on vision 2018 to 2020 and in this vision and upcoming work plan they have gender factors and gender indicator in every activities. But gender issues is neglected within the organization as people do not take working woman seriously and woman in leadership has to face multiple challenges to make their voice heard and to make her work plan to reality. Man working in this department are not gender sensitive, they make jokes of female who are working in leadership in this department.
- We are working on Gender based public messages in accordance with out themes, they will release it soon.
- We send flood, earthquake, windstorm, alert messages to communities

- We provide facilities to a center point at the disaster hit area some time female are over looked by the provision of things, we need to cover-up this lack toward female
- We work with other government institution to protect and provide shelter to IDP woman in deserter area, we take care of these woman till we find their families or they come looking for her
- According to her Pro-gender policies are need in her department for internal restructuring
- District Disaster Management Authorities has been established by the provincial government in all Districts of Balochistan. The District Authority comprises of the Deputy Commissioner (DC), Police or levies and all line departments.
- The DDMA will: (she refereed us to Website for detail information this information is from their website)
 - 1. Formulate district disaster risk management plan, based upon local risk assessment, and coordinate its implementation,
 - 2. Review development plans of government departments and provide guidance on mainstreaming disaster risk reduction measures in these plans,
 - 3. Continuously monitor hazards, risks and vulnerable conditions within the district, municipality, or cantonment,
 - 4. Prepare guidelines and standards for local stakeholders on disaster risk reduction,
 - 5. Conduct education, training and public awareness programs for local officials, stakeholders and communities,
 - 6. Encourage involvement of community groups in disaster risk reduction and response by providing them necessary financial and technical assistance for implementing community level initiatives

Analysis

Gap and Disparities

Temperament with in department toward their female colleagues is not very encouraging

Good practices

They are part of Gender task force , they provide training on gender to different cluster for better delivery of work plan

Indicator of change

According Sana khan biggest Indicator of change will be if her male colleagues start taking her position more seriously

| | Gender Performance Indicators They are providing support to other department to enhance gender sensitivity and improve on gender indicator but in their own department their female colleague, who is as well a gender focal person is not happy with male colleague attitude toward her |
|------------------|--|
| Suggestions | Training of lower and middle level management is important to change the internal temperament of the organization Gender assessment audit within the organization is needed |
| Reading material | website |

Meeting Environment Department

| Department | Environmental Protection Agency, Balochistan (BEPA) |
|----------------|---|
| Meeting with | Ghulam Rasool Jamal |
| Contact Number | 081-9202484 |
| Meeting | Irssa Ahuja |
| participants | Ms. Saeeda (BRSP) |
| | |
| Date | 4/12/2017 |
| Time | 10.00 to 11.30 |
| Website | http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=172&Itemid=241 |
| Background | Environmental Protection Agency, Balochistan (BEPA) was created on 22nd February, 1992 and under the administrative control of the Urban Planning & Development Department. Subsequently it was relocated under the administrative control of the Department of Environment, which was abolished and put under the administrative control of Environment, Wildlife Livestock and tourism Department. At present due to the long consultations and endeavor the Government of Balochistan has notified it as a separate department headed by Secretary Environment and Sports. |
| Description | Mr. Ghulam Rasool was not very cooperative to share information , he had no |
| | interest in answering the questionnaire in fact he was more interested to talk about current affairs, it took some effort out of me to make him speak by constant probing and staying focused on the questionnaire Balochistan Environmental Protection Agency's role is to serve as main environment regulatory body for Balochistan Province It is responsible for implementing National and Provincial Laws, and improving the state of protection of the Environmental and Natural Resources of Balochistan, It develops policies for improvement and sustainable use of natural resources They provide Public service messages to control killing of birds They distribute information on environment issues They are running three different what's app group for information to grass root level: Baloch Environmentalist group Zindabad Group Friends of Environment Currently Balochistan is going through a Drought, he stated that Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) has marked 29 out of 32 districts |

- of Balochistan are affected by drought. Primary reason for drought in Balochistan is that fewer rainfalls
- He informed us that Balochistan needs small dams
- He inform that they heir female and disable people in accordance with their policy that is of 5% of the total staff
- 70% woman are effected at the grass root by the environment issues like lack of water supply, clean water.
- The house hold in villages are made of kacha material, tress are very important for the habitat
- They have sexual harassment policy in their department but they have not formulated gender policy
- They are working on tree plantation in 5 districts but they have not involved any female
- They are working on 2 environmental rehabilitation project with international donor (he was reluctant to speak about it)

Work and services

- 1. To protect the environment of Balochistan with a view to promote and attain pollution free livelihood of both human and natural resources in accordance with the Environmental Laws and Natural Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS)/check list /guide lines.
- 2. To implement environmental Laws, regulations and National Environmental Quality Standards.
- 3. To promote environmental awareness and conduct research on environmental issues.
- 4. To integrate the principle and concerns of environmentally sustainable development into provincial development plans and polices.
- 5. To enforce environmental Laws, regulations and National Environmental Quality Standards with effect from 1st July, 2000ment
- 6. To measure and monitor industrial, urban and agriculture pollution discharge in the air, water and soil of Balochistan.
- 7. To institute Environmental Impact Assessments (EIA)/IEE process for the project formulation by the Government Department /Agencies.
- 8. To increase the awareness level of policy makers and general public on damage to the environment and Natural resources.
- 9. To build the capacity of Environmental Protection Agency, Balochistan, both in terms of human resource development and infrastructure development.
- 10. To arrange adoption of Pakistan Environmental Protection Act, 1997 through provincial legislation

| Analysis | Gap and Disparities |
|------------------|--|
| | They do not prefer to hire females within the office and in field as well |
| | Good practices |
| | They have open door policy for department co-workers |
| | Indicator of change |
| | To have female working in the field as "Environment Motivators" like Lady health |
| | worker at grass-root level |
| | Gender Performance Indicators |
| | There were no female present and it was peak working hour because there was |
| | no female staff in the department |
| Suggestions | BEPA needs to lower down its guard against female hiring |
| | They need to redesign their HR policy , they should encourage female to be |
| | employed at all levels |
| | They should involve female of community in tree plantation activities |
| | They should provide vocational training to female for kitchen gardening |
| | and how to use natural resources to build a comfortable habitat |
| Reading material | None |

Meeting Small Industry

| Department | The Directorate of Industries , Small Industries Wing | | |
|----------------|---|--|--|
| Meeting with | Ms. Saira Atta | | |
| Contact Number | 081-9211160 | | |
| Meeting | Irssa Ahuja | | |
| participant | Ms. Saeeda (BRSP) | | |
| Date | 4/12/2017 | | |
| Time | 3:00 to 4:30 | | |
| Website | http://www.dgicb.gob.pk/index.php/small-industry/the-marketing-function-of-siw | | |
| Background | The Directorate of Industries Small Industries Wing has dual functioning with regard to its official activities. At one side it is providing skill developing training in the art traditional handicrafts and on the other hand it is striving to preserve, promote and protect the rich heritage of the province. 2010 Amendments have given this department a lot of Autonomy , these 7 year had been phenomenal for development and growth Idea behind SIW is to provide access to market outlets to craftsmen/women because craftsmen especially women are place in remote areas they do not have the access to larger profitable outlets . The (SIW) have "lady demonstrator", they collect final products from the home of these craft man or woman or they come to one of the centers which are located in different districts and can deposits the final product and collect his/her piece wages. The centers take care of the final products and transport them to Quetta, after proper finishing the products , these are transported to sales & display shop operated by the (SIW). | | |
| Description | Ms. Saira Atta was very cooperative and she shared information without any | | |
| | hesitation. • She introduced structures and objectives of their department, she stated that we are like a MARKET ACCESS FOR CRAFTSMEN/ Woman | | |
| | We arrange surveys to determine potential for establishing training centers. | | |

- 2. We create training centers for men and women working in traditional crafts, these training center have device a system of collection of handicraft from every trainee or register craftsman, these products sold in Display centers, in exhibition and on shops run by SIW
- 3. To develop Small Industrial Estates are part of our department main work
- 4. We Preserve & promote traditional handicrafts and provide outlets and promote cottage industry. where woman and men handicraft are sold in retail outlets
- 5. We Organize and participate in exhibitions and EXPOS
- 6. We collect data and Provide market feedback about (trends, fashion, and buyer's preference, to making our craft man, enhance their products quality, this help them develop new ideas and polish their product further
- She further added on department Objectives that Facilitation and improvement of skills of the labor who are working in traditional handicrafts. In case a woman at grass root level cannot afford to buy raw material, we support her and make raw material available to her but first we examine her work
- We keep an eye on Market price list of product and keep Improving craftsman payment about in accordance with handicrafts products value
- We believe in entrepreneurship and we are creating opportunity for young woman to become entrepreneur since Skill level of rural woman are very low, in our training center we provided training to different craft and make them aware of different style. When they are trained, we arrange for their development in this field. we want to eliminate the middle man that is why we encourage these woman to approach us directly
- There is not Gender Policy introduced as yet but since this department is headed by me I keep an eye on my staff, though I would like the Department of Industry to work on some gender policies, she said that if something comes up she will volunteer to device gender policy for the department
- She said that since Balochistan is highly patriarchal, people do not welcome a female boss, woman have to face many challenges while she is in leadership position, she add to that "at first my juniors took my rules and regulation non- seriously but then I took firm action on it and made every one realize that I am head of the institute". it is much easier for man to be

- in upper management roles as acceptance for a man is very high on the contrary female boss get labeled and threatened
- Usually female is not given a lead in any project, male are given training opportunities and they are brought forward in leadership roles
- She said that she follows an open door policy and is always ready to listen to complaint of any woman who is facing problem in the department. there never been any harassment case
- Gender sensitization is very important for department development
- We prefer woman to register their NGO's
- Whenever we introduce new product or new service ,we advertise it in newspaper and television
- The operation of small scale industries in the province is badly hampered due to inadequate and non-availability of funds in time. Existing industrial units are suffering from lack of working capital.
- We are welcoming CEPAC, it is going to change structures and will provide
 a lot of new opportunities for woman. But Existence of proper
 infrastructural facilities is necessary for the development of
 industrialization. In the absence of proper infrastructure like power supply,
 road communication etc, it is difficult for the industries to reach
 satisfactory levels.
- Poor infrastructural facilities and geographical obstacles rule out the feasibility of major industries. Small and Medium Scale or Agro-based industries can be established in this context. The government should make attractive schemes and incentives to catch the attention of talented young entrepreneurs in this sector and collaborate with large industrial houses of the country or even foreign companies to promote industrialization.
- The importance of a peaceful and harmonious employer-employee relationship cannot be ignored for having a good working environment.
 The employer-employee relation is closely related to the growth of industries

Analysis

Gap and Disparities

The Directorate of Industries & Commerce, Balochistan do not have a properly developed and devised gender Policy

Good practices

Since SIW is run by a woman , she prefer woman from grassroots level to develop into small and medium entrepreneur

Indicator of change

Indicator of change according to her are three

| | Equal employment opportunity for females | |
|------------------|--|--|
| | 2. Equal business opportunity for male and female | |
| | 3. Increase budget spending on industry development | |
| | Gender Performance Indicators | |
| | Woman in leadership position are not taken seriously as decision making | |
| | authority | |
| Suggestions | If the government works on the potential hydroelectric power generation or alternative source of energy with full swing, the government has all possibilities to become self-sufficient in power generation for industry development Development of peaceful and harmonious employee-employee relationship is very important, work ethics and harassment policy need to be redefine within the department They need to Develop their gender policy and work plan in accordance to coming Industrial change | |
| Reading material | | |

Qilla Abdullah

| Qilla Abdullah | Qilla Abdullah or Killa Abdullah or Abdullah Qilla is the name of a historic fort (qilla) built by Sardar Abdullah Khan Achakzai, a Khan of Kalat. Qilla Abdullah was part of District Pishin; it was notified as separate district in 1993. Tehsil Chaman is head quarter of the district. The district is located in the north-east of Balochistan, sharing its northern and western boundaries with Afghanistan. Administratively the district has been divided into four tehsils of Chaman, Dobandi, Gulistan and Kila Abdullah. The four tehsils are further divided into 25 union councils According to census of 2017 it has 97210 Households, out of which approximately 78 thousands are in rural area, comprising of approximately 40 thousand male and 36 thousand female out of the total district population. average growth rate of population Is 3.9% whereas rural growth rate average is 4.02 % Killa-Abdullah tribal distribution: Killa-Abdullah predominantly is inhibited by |
|-------------------|---|
| | Pashtoon Achakzai tribe which is 63% of the district total population, Achakzai |
| | sub tribes are Malazai, Noorzai , Hassanzai |
| UC of | Girdi Pinkki , Arambi |
| visit | |
| Village | Wali khan , Karwan |
| Meetings | Focus Group discussion with woman COs (Wali) |
| | FGD with male LSO (Karwan) |
| | Meeting with Chairman / Councilor : UC Girdi Pinkki , UC: Arambi |
| Date | 5/12/2017 |
| Time | 9:00 to 4:30 |
| Climate | Dry |
| Dams | Arambi dam |
| Physical | Agro-ecological zone |
| condition | |
| crops | Major crops in the district wheat, Apple, pomegranate and water melon ,vegetables barley, potato and tomatoes are also sown. |
| Livestock | Livestock is also important source of livelihood in rural areas, Goats, Sheep and Cattle are the major type of livestock in the district |

Village with Limited Livelihoods

both male and female expressed grievances over lack of Physical Infrastructure development, like in-availability of school, health facilities, while both men and women experienced "modern" amenities (such as Clinic, buses) at one or more point in life and a few even had schooling.

Water

This districts is also in the drought affected areas. Water table is fairly low. Safe drinking water storages are not available, if available, there is no facilities of supply it to the community , woman fetch water and it take 4to 5 hours out of their daily work routine to collect water . Community also needs water for their agricultural & livestock activities, They are experiencing drought in the area, and have difficulty growing crops. Due to drought Karezes system had failed

Woman and Customs

Man work in orchids as agriculture workers, according to them this is the only work they can do there is nothing else. Since this area is with Pashto belt they have very strong Patriarchal values. Woman work in household chores only they do not go outside to work and earn, they do not allow woman to go out of house alone , she has to have a male to accompany her even if she needs to see a doctor . They are very rigid in their customs, Polygamy is very common and its part of every house hold , 70% woman are suffering from Depression , anemia , and multiple pregnancy syndrome .

Woman status is not very encouraging, they are not aware of their right, they have no income, no right in property or inheritance (in fact they cannot claim their right in property as per law even). Their lively hood skills are not very hopeful and they do not have any equipment or skill that could enable them women to take part in income generation activities.

Health

In infrastructure: labor room are not available in BHU. Female ward are available only at RHC Gulistan. No Pediatric health care facilities available, they go to Chaman or Quetta in case of emergency

Staff shortages included staff (Lady Health worker or midwife)

Drugs, supplies, vaccines and FP commodities are not available, they have to buy it themselves

Immunization coverage; polio worker visits these settlement but rest of the immunization process are not completed for most of the villagers, Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) is comparatively high, it is 49 per 1000 live births

Gynecological care \cdot Comprehensive family planning services including sterilization was not being practiced nor they had any interaction with any medical facility offering these services. They have deliveries at home, usually resulting in complication, young woman are not given proper gynecological care

Energy

For cooking they use wood, kerosene lamp type stove, Cylinder (only in socioeconomic well-off families). They use PV solar panels to light-up their houses, Water pump at orchard sites are operated by solar energy.

Household structure

Majority of houses in settlement are made of soil with plastic roofing or iron sheets they live in kutcha houses, since it is climate wise very cold and dry, their houses are made to resist the extreme cold weather, like an igloo made of soil

Community Issues and Institutions

The main issues voiced was lack of opportunities to earn income in the village, combined with the lack of resources to be self-sufficient, as they perceived themselves to be stuck in drought.

Two institutions within the village that deal with community issues – council of elder men, the Village Organization VSO . The membership of the VO and the elder overlap, with the elders taking part in both and retaining influence over decision making within the newer mechanism. elders solve the people's disputes.

The VSO were established by BRSP, VSO are developing the linkages and are becoming very prominent with in the community, they provide villagers with access to some basic services and they try to involve them in decision making processes about their needs . still woman representation and woman awareness level in decision making and taking part in community development was not very hopeful. But their activities are encouraging small changes they have a small groups of female who are SO and these woman now have voice to the over all development of village

The area majority population lack in Lively hood skill, if they are given raw material, training, they can weave carpets, do embroidery, Leather crafts and earn some income

These woman are very good with Live stock they can work from home and can be part of Organic protein chain

Gender Issues in Community Decision Making

First and most prominent problem of area is that woman themselves are not aware of their right, their knowledge to exercise their right is non-existent. These women's Lack freedom of mobility, constraints of lack of transportation and lack of road give them zero opportunities to participation in public life.

Local perceptions and practices of gender roles and responsibilities give them zero chances or opportunity to make decision.

These are secluded and restricted in their village – and that their male relatives (husband, father) do not treat them well. Domestic violence is very common practice. Purdah (female seclusion) is considered necessary for protection of family honor, and though it is determined by local norms it does vary from household to household. Usually every one follows it without questioning

Majority of woman get married quite young (before 15year of age) and out of which majority have their first child at the age of 14 or 15

Female meeting spaces are centered around their house hold boundaries or water collection points, fire wood collection area, animal livestock rearing and caring, preparation for funerals, and social occasions such as weddings.

Woman do not have any access to information they are not allowed to a mobile phone, as they are prohibited to use it and what they know is limited to their roles and responsibilities or it is limited to their daily life, use of mobile is consider bad because they have determined its use as anti-parda promoter The women depend on their husbands to give information or share information regarding their community with them. These woman are deliberately keep backward because in case they will come to understand that they are being deprived of their basic right they will start voicing their right and they will stand for it.

Role of External Agents development partners

Qilla Abdullah many development agent or partner have work and are working on community development initiatives; each of these organizations have a commitment to including women and supporting the development for better decision making processes.

Ngo or donor or their consortium who want to venture in this area they should make woman participation number one priority. Aid should be sanctioned to female either owning or participant of community organization

Government Department like health Education and *Veterinary* are not very active, there are no Lady Health work visits recorded with in the last three months, only one teacher for primary school and more over one primary school for three villages (and distance from the village settlement to school is 5 kilometer

Since government is making gender free schools to cover the lack of infrastructure. People are not ready to send their girl child to a boy's school. This program needs a lot of awareness support hence community will start accepting this change

Since due to Drought, Karaize System in these areas have failed, Government should act upon it to build reservoirs

VSO

Each VSO has a chairman, an assistant, a cashier, a clerk and six to 8 other members. It has regular meetings held on both weekly and monthly basis attended by the representatives of each village or settlement , they are trying to involve woman and they have encouraged female participation in meetings. Females usually have separate meetings in a woman social organizer home

BISP

Every woman has a CINC and they had applied for BISP program but only 6 woman (Wali khan village) got BISP approval

One thing is very interesting to note that these woman know the importance of CNIC as they get paid by political agents against their CNIC to vote for certain party, but they chose not to favor education because it does not give instant financial benefits, they are not aware of the importance of education and voicing their right. I have not come across any woman who wanted to be educated for herself, community woman emphasized on school and education institution for their children

Non formal way of solving community issues

In majority of cases people respect the elders and listen to their advice for community and household level problems. Sometimes they also come together in the mosque and first try to solve their problems through elders of the community, and share their household's problems and personal problems

They do not restrict a woman who is seeking advice for her problem from community elder but if she tries to go out of this defined structure or to a judicial institution, she is threatened and she is not treated fairly by community

Suggestions

- 1. Whenever any development partner launch a program they should keep in mind Clarity of objectives, benchmarks and indicators on gender equality, women's empowerment and participation. There is lack of clarity on what interventions will work with women in particular communities
- 2. Work with men to find out acceptable forms of participation for women. With this understanding, it will also be easier to understand how far the local community can be pushed to include women to a more productive manner
- 3. Observing, understand and implementing a local development agenda.
- 4. Ngo and development partners should always keep in mind there is a difference between providing access to services and resources than providing people with tools to ensure more equitable access and distribution amongst themselves.
- 5. There should be literacy courses for women, so that they can improve their knowledge skills, in order to know about their rights and their roles in the household and the community level

6.

6. BRSP should consider working with field staff to develop more explicit objectives and indicators that indicate which kinds of participation they are looking for females.

7.

7. Developing lines of accountability between the NGOs, the VSO and their male and female representatives and Gender focal person

8.

8. Skills training programs, like carpet weaving, tailoring, and embroidery, in order to improve women participation in social activities and giving them opportunity to earn to support their families through these skills.

9.

- 9. BRSP should Market the products made by female after skill enhancement courses, this will eliminate the middle man monopoly
- 10. BRSP should include this to their programs to build Bridges between Government, District authority, Local Elders and Community representative, Combine discussion on site with government authority, District authority and they should work with the villagers women and men on conflict resolution better use of resources, management plans and skills enhancement, they need to bring forward villager to be enable to communicate and negotiate about their needs and interests and come up with local solution

Meeting with BRSP Staff

| Department | Balochistan Rural Support Program (BRSP) | | |
|----------------|---|--|--|
| Meeting with | Program , Finance and HR department | | |
| Contact person | Dr. Shahnawaz Khan | | |
| Meeting | Attendance list from BRSP | | |
| participant | | | |
| Date | 6/12/2017 | | |
| Time | 10.00 to 11.30 | | |
| Website | https://www.brsp.org.pk/index.php | | |
| Background | BRSP is governed by a Board, which consists 15 Directors and 2 Advisors. It has more than 400 staff members. BRSP management structure comprises of different sections under the overall leadership of the CEO. These sections are: | | |
| | 1. Social Sector Services | | |
| | 2. Social Mobilization & Human Resource Development | | |
| | 3. Physical Infrastructure and Technology Development (PITD) | | |
| | 4. Information and Communication Technology | | |
| | 5. Wash Program | | |
| | 6. Emergency Response Unit | | |
| | 7. Administration | | |
| | 8. Finance & Accounts and Internal Audit and Compliances | | |
| | 9. PMER and Knowledge Management | | |
| | BRSP out reach 25 districts | | |
| | BRSP out reach 211 Union Council | | |
| Description | CEO and Staff of BRSP welcome us and they were proactively willing to share | | |
| 2 coorperon | information | | |
| | BRSP is working on multiple projects with different Donors and they | | |
| | collaborate with government to facilitate Target population and facilitate | | |
| | development processes | | |
| | Prominent donor are PPAF, EU, UNICEF, UNHCR, DFID, GIZ, PATRIP | | |
| | Foundation, Save the Children, NRSP, RSPN, USAID and other UN agencies | | |
| | Thematic area where BRSP maneuver | | |
| | 1. Health | | |
| | 2. Education | | |
| | 3. ICT | | |
| | 4. Community economic empowerment | | |
| | 5. Drinking water supply and sanitation facilities | | |

- 6. Livelihood Sector (Capacity Building) (data available on their website)
- 7. Physical Infrastructure and Technological Development (PITD)

Now they have added

- 1. Gender development
- 2. Monitoring, Evaluation and research
- 3. Micro financing and Enterprise development
- Balochistan Rural Development and Community Empowerment Program: The program is to empower citizens and communities and provide them with means enabling them to implement community-driven socio-economic development interventions, an increased voice and capability to influence public policy decision making through active engagement with local authorities for quality, inclusive, and equitable service delivery, and civic-oversight.
- Target group(s)Men and women community organizations (CO) formed at settlement, village and Union Council (UC) levels; elected members of local councils at UC, municipality and District Council levels and the line departments and local government authorities in seven targeted districts at present
- Final beneficiaries 1,702,185 Pakistani citizens (247,956 households) of the targeted 7 districts, 2,500 council members, 300 chair & vice chairmen of elected councils, 200 union council secretaries & other Government of Balochistan Local Government and Rural Development Department's staff.

Capacity Building activities covering above mention themes

| Trainings | Events | Participants |
|-----------------|--------|--------------|
| Community | 6,748 | 182,130 |
| Based Trainings | | |
| Staff Trainings | 108 | 1,004 |
| Internship | | 78 |
| Total | 6,856 | 183,212 |
| beneficiaries | | |

• *Gender Sensitization:* Gender mainstreaming has always remained a main concern in the socially tribal set up, particularly, in the bordering districts like Killah Abdullah, which is influenced by Afghanistan context. Despite

this BRSP extensively social mobilized women and formed 48 female institution (Cos and VOs) s and many capacity building interventions were conducted such as CMST, LMST, Gender sensitization trainings and recreational activities. The GIZ-RAHA project benefited mostly the females as they benefited from the water activities, household cropping & cultivation, the installed washing pads and livestock interventions.

- They have one Gender Coordinator with in there office and have Gender focal Person in VSO working on gender sensitization through indirect approach in almost 7 district but this initiative is relatively new and it has a lot of room for improvement as rural area need a lot of work to overcome gender disparities
- Their Gender Policy cover basic topic for any organization and it is quite similar to RSP's gender policies
 - 1. Gender main steaming at organization level
 - 2. Personal Policies and procedures
 - 3. Recruitment, promotion appraisal and leaves
 - 4. Boarding, logistics, and transportation
 - 5. Social mobilization strategies
 - 6. Human resource development
 - 7. Monitoring, assessment and planning
 - 8. Social Sector strategies
 - 9. Rural Credit and Enterprise development
 - 10. Natural Resources management strategies
 - 11. Main steaming gender at external level
 - 12. Implementation and accountability
- BRSP program staff were not very much familiar with the details of the policy
- BRSP staff suggested that Local government need to have a Gender expert for better development of work plan with in the local government
- HR team mention to have Revision of Gender policy as it is dated back in 2003
- Proposal Development and involvement with different donor should always highlight gender values and practices of BRSP
- Micro-finances theme need to be develop in accordance with gender perspectives that credit should be given to female, hence they can use it for their development, or if male does all the deal still woman can ripe frutation out of it. gender related parameter needs to be added to the program

| | Collective evaluation of BRSP team is needed, staff, project staff, gender focal person, partners and other influential member need to sit together and discuss on gender issues and how to eliminate gender imbalance BRSP arrange meeting regularly with in organization and with outside partners but gender issues have not been in focus yet Livelihood program can be more gender oriented if it support woman to enhance her skill, hence she can work from home and can produce a product that can be sold. Since these women will not come in contact with person collecting finish product from their home, a male member from their household can play this part Gender focal point from Zhob had played a very active role with BRSP program implementation, due to this intervening of this gender focal person, female have come forward and are becoming aware of their right, there are 52 woman working at grass root level Program implementation can improved if we can add gender practices to program planning To enhance the leadership of female in it is very important to evaluate programs in respect with gender indicators, how accurate gender approach is for the area, how focused is gender topic relating different themes |
|-------------|--|
| Analysis | Gap and Disparities Majority of staff do not have understanding of BRSP gender policy, Good practices They are open to discussion with in the organization regarding sensitive issues like gender, reproductive health and female role in family life, they are true to the practices of Dialectical Intellectualism within the organization Indicator of change According to CEO, indicator of change within the organization will be when Male staff take up practices of gender understanding to their personal and professional life Gender Performance Indicators |
| | Gender Coordinator is a female and Majority of gender focal person at the grass- root level are female there were 8 woman present as gender focal person for the FGD with Community focal person |
| Suggestions | They need to develop gender sensitive program that help raise awareness of target population at grass root level Training of BRSP staff on the issues of gender and how they can make their work and project more gender oriented |

| | Research study or gender audit of 7 districts based on Gender indicators is |
|------------------|---|
| | very important, a KAP study on gender indicators with community people |
| | can help cover the gap |
| Reading material | BRSP: Gender policy 2003 |
| | BRSP: Anti Sexual Harassment Policy |
| | Attached for reference |

FGD community organization representatives from relevant district

| Department | BRSP | | |
|----------------|--|--|--|
| Meeting with | Community VSO , Gender Focal person , Woman representative | | |
| Contact person | Ms. Naseema , Gender Coordinator | | |
| Contact Number | 081 2470194 | | |
| Meeting | Community Representative, Gender focal person | | |
| participant | Irssa Ahuja | | |
| | List of participants attached | | |
| Date | 6/12/2017 | | |
| Time | 11.00 to 1.30 | | |
| District | | | |
| participating | 9. Killa Abdullah 10. Jhal Magsi 11. Loralai 12. Kech 13. Pishin 14. Washuk 15. Zobh 16. Khuzdar | | |

Description

Participant Name Fida Hussan

District: Jhal Magsi

UC: Barija

Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| | Rural | Urban | Total |
|------------|--------|-------|--------|
| Population | 141400 | 1825 | 149225 |
| Male | 72948 | 3954 | 76902 |
| Female | 68452 | 3870 | 72322 |
| Household | 23791 | 1256 | 25047 |

Jhall magsi is a tourist attraction because of the paradise point – Pir Chattal Noorani Gandhawa, and the Jhal Magsi jeep rally, it has a lot of development potentials and many Socio-Economic activities can be developed , if this district has proper plan, proper facilitation it can attract a lot of economic development.

Woman status is not very encouraging , woman do not have right in decision making regarding property neither they are given right for higher education as they are not given the freedom to mobility outside their community . For access to information they are depended on the male relatives. They are not allowed to have mobile, majority do have access to cable T.V or any kind of Computer. But they are relatively vocal to their need and demand

They are not allowed to work outside home few woman work in handicraft to support their families, same story as the rest of Balochistan, woman do household work, rearing and caring of dependents, collect water, fire wood and they look after livestock.

In majority of cases they are not give right to choose in marriage, marriage is pre-decided by elders of family and sometime elders of the community decide.

Suggestion Given by community person

- 1. To have a gender audit of District Council, officers, (health and Education department)
- 2. To have gender expert at local governance level
- 3. Poverty Scorecard need to be established
- 4. Government should work on provision of Water
- 5. NADRA Should send mobile service for CNIC

Participant Name Haji Abdul Alvi, HabibUlah Akhakzi

District: Killa Abdulah

UC: Wali khan

10. Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| | Rural | Urban | Total |
|------------|--------|-------|--------|
| Population | 141400 | 1825 | 149225 |
| Male | 72948 | 3954 | 76902 |
| Female | 68452 | 3870 | 72322 |
| Household | 23791 | 1256 | 25047 |

Kila Abdullah is no different from rest of the Balochistan in Status of woman existence, woman have literary no say in decision making what so every, they are deprived of right to mobility and access to information. They have poor status of health and Education. Most of household activates include cleaning, washing, cooking, rearing and care of dependents, collecting water and woods and taking care of livestock Suggestion made by community person

- 1. Woman need education and Health facilities
- 2. Water supply to community and settlements

Participant Name: Mohammad Wali / Aliya Naz (Gender Focal person)

District: Loralai

UC: Bori

11. Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| | Rural | Urban | Total |
|------------|--------|-------|--------|
| Population | 332462 | 64938 | 397400 |
| Male | 176153 | 36298 | 212451 |
| Female | 156308 | 28640 | 184948 |
| Household | 47143 | 8733 | 55876 |

Woman are deprived of Basic necessities like water, health and education. Woman are not given decision power in marriage, Children future, sell and purchase of household commodities business and property. Male relatives do not acknowledge woman as part of active household. Even if they invest money in business of male relative, they are not given profit out of running business.

They are not allow to go out of their home they need to accompany male relatives even for basic needs. Honor Killing cases are comparatively high in this district Suggestion

- 1. We need to have woman in Local Government or woman representative are need at Councilor level
- 2. We need to start involving Local Decision making power with in Provincial Government
- 3. Awareness on woman right and practical participation of woman in community life through economic activities

Participant Name: Syeed Abdul Nabee / Saeeda Habiba /Raheem khan Saasoee

District: Washuk

UC: Jangian

12. Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| | Rural | Urban | Total |
|------------|--------|-------|--------|
| Population | 154334 | 21872 | 176206 |
| Male | 80583 | 11448 | 92031 |
| Female | 73751 | 10424 | 84175 |
| Household | 27517 | 4023 | 31540 |

the area of Washuk totally lacks other basic amenities of life like hospital, dispensary or BHU, people go to tehsil Shahogeri for treatment when they need medical help

Educational system or institutes are very backward, people have no concept of education neither they are convince to send their children to school. The elected MPA and MNA have not done anything to restore Government school, they let their people remain uneducated Water shortage is great challenge in daily life. Women travel very long distance to fetch water for household. They collect water from ponds and rarely from water supply schemes which are far away from settlements. Usually this water is not clean, it is contaminated and it causes grim diseases in area people

Woman do have access to education, they do not even have CNIC and if they have CNIC male member of family keep their CNIC with them.

Woman do not have right in inheritance, Washuk people do not ask their children (male or female) on the chose for partner in marriage, these decision are still done by family elders. People who chose for themselves are treated very badly, there were few cases in which women and men got killed

Suggestion

- 1. Awareness Session are need to make them understand importance of education.
- 2. Woman should be given chances to work, they have skill that can support them to work and earn something it will be very convincing for male and then they will allow rest of the female to come out of the houses to work and earn
- 3. There should be a female representative in Local government

Participant Name: Riaz Ahmed / Nassmeena Mangul / Musarat Yaqoob

District: Khuzdar UC: Abad Karkh

13. Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| | Rural | Urban | Total |
|------------|--------|--------|--------|
| Population | 525071 | 277136 | 802207 |
| Male | 275488 | 145780 | 421268 |
| Female | 249583 | 131356 | 380939 |
| Household | 81296 | 39109 | 120405 |

Same as rest of the district women are not allowed to move alone they are not given freedom to decide for them self or for their children, she is not given her basic rights of education, health and even food

Domestic Violence is a common practice in every home

There is one Hospital for the entire District which is in really bad condition, shortage of doctors, medicines, clean wards, equipment, hygiene is poor, and immunization center are missing. Gynecology ward is in worse condition, it totally lack Hygiene and lot of diseases are transferred while woman is giving birth to child as the sheets where she is put are not clean plus equipment are not sterilized

Socio-economic differences have created class difference, Farming and livestock was main livelihood of majority of population but due to constant droughts these professions have suffered badly. And this has resulted in unemployment, poverty and rise in crimes and social economical class difference

Suggestion

- 1. Woman organization should provide educational session to woman on treating woman fairly. Giving respect does not mean that you lock them in home in fact they should allow them to study and go to work
- 2. Lady Doctor should visit hospital
- 3. Awareness training session of male population for better understanding of why and how female are suffering, and what they can do to support their females
- 4. To eliminate class difference, better earning facilities should be provided hence people can work on their life to make it better
- 5. Skill development in deprived area to make them capable to enhance their financial aspects

Participant Name: Agha Kakar

District: Pishin UC: Khushab

14. Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| Population | 593339 | 143142 | 736481 |
|------------|--------|--------|--------|
| Male | 306079 | 73043 | 379122 |
| Female | 287258 | 70098 | 357356 |
| Household | 102304 | 25776 | 128080 |

- **15.** Woman are not allow to have education, they do not have right to choose their partner in marriage. They are deprived of their right in inheritance.
- **16.** Since there are no medical facilities available in the area, they cannot go to urban area alone, they have to accompany a male to see a doctor
- 17.
- 18. Suggestion
- **19.** Discussion forum is needed with in the community to find solution for the community and problem faced by woman
- **20.** Female representation in local Government
- 21. Government should open more school and hospitals

Participant Name: Khuda Dar khan /fozia Yasmeen /Qamer Fatima

District: ZHOB UC: Garda Babar

22. Population structure accordance with Censes 2017

| | Rural | Urban | Total |
|------------|--------|-------|--------|
| Population | 264296 | 46248 | 310544 |
| Male | 142831 | 25527 | 168358 |
| Female | 121465 | 20721 | 142186 |
| Household | 39094 | 6868 | 45962 |

They have primary school and woman from this area are demanding a higher school. They have a Dispensary but it does have a LHV or trained Midwife

Like rest of the area were discussed earlier , woman are not allow to have education , or access health facilities or even they are not allowed to access family planning advice from an expert

Marriages are done with-out asking for the consent of female

They are not given their right in heritance

Domestic violence is increasing

Suggestion

- 1. Training center or skill enhancement center are need to train woman in Embroidery, Tailoring or carpet weaving. Since man do not allow us to go out of house to work and earn, with this skill enhancement we can stay at home and work from home and can uplift our financial status
- 2. Zhob should have more schools for girls
- 3. Awareness session of male making them gender sensitive

23.

24.

UNESCO

| Department | United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) |
|----------------|--|
| Meeting with | Mr. Qaisar Jamali |
| Contact person | Mr. Qaisar Jamali |
| Contact Number | |
| Meeting | Irssa Ahuja |
| participant | Ms Saeeda (Documentation Officer BRSP) |
| Date | 6/12/2017 |
| Time | 4;00 to 5:00pm |
| Website | http://www.unesco.org.pk/ |
| Background | UNESCO started working on Mehrgar in 2004, it is one of the most important |
| | Neolithic (7000 BCE to c. 2500 BCE) sites in archaeology. It is one of the earliest |
| | sites with evidence of farming and herding in South Asia. |
| | Other projects are , Hingol Cultural Landscape, 2016, Karez System Cultural |
| | Landscape(2016), Ziarat Juniper Forest (2016) |
| | UNESCO has always collaborating with different National and international |
| | Organization on Education and especially on Girl Child Education |
| | Mr. Jamali is serving in UNESCO since June 2010 as the Provincial |
| | Coordinator Baluchistan. Mr. Jamali has been working in the development sector since |
| | 1995. His areas of work vary from community development, social mobilization to |
| | education, science, culture and Climate Change |
| Description | Our meeting with Qaisar Khan Jamali was very productive, he had been working |
| | in the Development sector in a very proactive method |
| | He informed that UNESCO has always been a major support to Girls |
| | education, he says due to lack of awareness and gender disparity millions |
| | of school-going children are kept out of school, enrollment in the school is |
| | not a major issues but keeping them in school is main target to achieve, |
| | Balochistan government need to prevent the drop-out rate especially girls, |
| | Due to increase in Fundamentalism and Extremism trends,not taking a |
| | child to school have increased. Girl child education is mainly jeopardized |

- due to bad governance and lack of quality education. Out of over 12,000 schools in 32 districts of Balochistan only 3,400 schools are for girl
- To encounter these figure and keeping in view budget constraints of Balochistan government, Primary school are converted into gender Free School, Now there won't be separate Boys and girls schools. They will have combine school. Government has taken initiated but this process will take time to advance. Government of Baluchistan at Present have 20 gender free schools running in different districts
- Female teacher are being hired to teach in school, this practice will eliminate male child battering, child abuse cases and it will give empowerment to woman to take up good position in Education sector
- Balochistan's education department Lack Proper planning and implementation. Right now we are working on Education Sector Plan 2012 to 2017, in this plan Gender is playing a crosscutting theme.
- Balochistan government has started working on making school and other curriculum gender sensitive.
- Policy Planning & Implementation Unit (PPIU) Department of Education
 Government of Balochistan is playing a very active role in development of
 Gender based policies particularly in Education, Balochistan Education
 Policy Reform is gaining ground, it is Progressing with the consultation of
 UNESCO and NCHD Early Chidhood Education (ECE), Education For All(
 EFA) Plans at provincial and district levels are in progress of finalization.
- Technical & Financial Support for PPIU at the initial stage was provided by UNESCO, the support was e.g.; software and logistics. More support is sought for the strengthening of PPIU especially in the following heads Planning and capacity building of Human Resource, Equipment & Software
- Major issues woman facing in regard to realization of Importance of education are
 - Early Marriages
 - Domestic Violence

- > Poverty
- > Lack of school availability
- Domestic Work(household work)
- Community lack of awareness
- To overcome these issues a lot of home ground work is needed among which
 - > Skill enhancement and financial opportunities for parent group
 - Local community Awareness
 - Gender sensitization of local government
- Government of Balochistan has given 14 million approximately to Boy
 Scott for training and camping grant but they have granted only 25
 hundred thousand to girl Scott, clear difference and gender Gap can be
 seen in the preference of providing with all funding to male and reducing
 female unit to minimum as just to provide them as much to retain girl guide
 name
- Woman MPA Usually do not get complete portion of their budget granted by the government they get 30% of the approved Budget, if they are heading any ministry and what ever budget is allocated to them, Their party usually take the Granted budget in their hands and she is rarely given chances to handle budget and its allocation by herself. He as well added that these MPA are placed by the political parties in government, to show female representation, in fact she cannot decided or give statement without the approval of her political party. They are there to represent them self-in front of camera or Media. Political Party Groups do not allow their female representative to use as she desire to use or what she foresee it to be used
- Female participation is there in policy development and reform but it is relatively new, as female leader have minimum knowledge regarding policy and its impact

- Woman Universities performance is not very encouraging, they do not know their right or you can say they do not exercise their right with university Board regarding budget, allocations, teaching staff and other rules and regulations
- Budget needs to be more gender sensitized, while making Budget open door policy are needed to make it more effective for common people.
- Awareness sessions regarding budget and its allocation are very important, in those session, pressure group, civil society activist, academia, Economist, female politician, ngo worker, female right activist should take part . these Awareness session should have gender session and open form discussion
- Training session of Development sector should have curriculum made in accordance with gender frameworks or should have prominent Gender indicators
- To strengthen the system regarding gender issues mass awareness is needed at all level of society

Analysis

Gap and Disparities

- Head of Different departments do not admit they are lacking behind in gender consideration in development of plan, program, Hiring of staff and implementation of different activities
- Raw Material for Human resource is not available especial relating to gender participation in professional field. Lower level of woman education, lack of technical exercise for female, not being well equipped technically. Female in Balochistan do not have enough education and experience to take up leadership roles.
- Now Government is offering placement for female in multiple sector but there are few female who are able to fulfill the criteria's and requirement of that leadership role

Good practices

➤ Balochistan Government had accepted and working on making all Government Primary schools Gender free

➤ Gender sensitive curriculum is advised, Government and book board are looking into this matter, process of crosschecking of curriculum and making gender sensitive is in process

Indicator of change

 According to UNESCO indictor of change will be seeing at least 65 % girls in school and more importantly to have their presence in school after primary level, at least up to Higher secondary level

Gender Performance Indicators

World Economic Forum's Global Gender Gap Report 2016 ranks 144
countries on the gap between women and men based on health, education,
economic and political indicators, Pakistan is ranked 143 out of 144
countries, holding the scorecard for the worst-performing state in South
Asia.

Suggestions

- Young people with technical and scientific approaches should be injected
 in the system and in different department , their interactive dealing with
 department people can bring about perspective change
- Education department should have gender audit
- Training of existing female staff in education is required
- Since raw material in human resources sector is lacking in Balochistan.
 Balochistan female are not qualified enough to take up leadership positions
 , to eradicate this gap advertisement for the job needs to lower down their
 requirement when they want to heir female staff
- The short listed female with comparatively low level of professional skill, experience or education achievement, should be given 3 month crash course training to cope with their lack, making them aware of problem and enhancing their skills in the direction they can successful take up the job, this will help increase female representation in public spaces and government institutions

| | Since UNESCO is supporting Policy Planning & Implementation Unit (PPIU) |
|------------------|---|
| | in human resources Development, they can intervene and inculcate more |
| | women manpower to the structure |
| | A Subject of technical Training and skill enhancement after primary school |
| | should be introduced to make woman capable to produce financial sources |
| | for her survival |
| | Female leader should be given training/ awareness session on policy |
| | development and its reform. special workshop to inform these female |
| | regarding impact of policy planning and how to add on Gender flavor while |
| | they are participation in policy planning, it is a need to be develop as part |
| | of development Projects |
| | 25. |
| | |
| Reading material | http://www.unesco.org.pk/education/prov_ece.html |
| Reading material | intep.//www.unesco.org.pk/education/prov ece.num |
| | |

Meeting with Woman Development department

| Department | Department of Women Development ,Balochistan |
|----------------|---|
| Meeting with | Mohammad Zakir Nasir, (he had recently join WDD) approximately two |
| | months |
| Contact Number | 03003824645 |
| Meeting | Irssa Ahuja |
| participant | Naseema (BRSP Gender Coordinator) |
| Date | 7/12/2017 |
| Time | 11.00 to 11.30 |
| Website | http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/women-development-departmenthtml (under |
| | construction) |
| Background | Provincial Government of Balochistan had Social Welfare Department and woman development operated under this department as a small initiative, it was performing activities for woman right and it had some awareness program for gender responsiveness from 1995 to 2008. On 3 rd November 2009 Government of Balochistan created Woman development department and it was given a separate Identity and it became and independent Department. |
| | Now Women Development Department is functional at Secretariat and Directorate level. They liaison with NGOs, National and International Agencies to empower and development of women in Province. they have envision to work in policy making regarding gender equality, woman empowerment and financial up lift of woman by providing them substantial opportunities to work and earn |
| | In collaboration with national level they have undertaken responsibility to implementation of National Plan of Action for Women and stand by and safeguard Convention on the elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). |
| Description | Meeting with head of Woman Development Department Zakir Nasir was very Informative and Helpful. He informed regarding background of WDD and it's operation under Social Welfare department. 18th Amendment ,Provincial Autonomy and formulation of a separate department has given this area a lot of attention to work and expand their horizon |
| | Since 20010 they have established "Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Shelter home" previously these shelter homes were operating under social welfare authority, these shelter homes are operational in 6 districts. They rescue, Provide shelter, Legal Aid advice and counselling to woman in distress. Case studies are taken up at the Shelter home, in a case were woman decided to go back to their home, Home visit and client case worker visit and discuss situation with Family, judicial and medical for proper patching and conflict |

- resolution of the case. In case were a woman decided not to go back, they make arrangement for her rehabilitation, counselling, job placement, proper living situation. These cases are handled by Legal officer. A person who come forward with a complaint has to launch and register a complaint at the district headquarter and these officer of shelter home help them.
- They have envision to establish these similar shelter home in every district
 of Balochistan but due to lack of resources this seems impossible at this
 point of time. Currently Quetta SBB Shelter home is in a rented building,
 they have requested for a government own building
- Within the department they have approved policy on "Violence against Woman", currently they are establishing work plan in accordance with Budget. They have envision activities to implement the policy in action
- They have hired new Assistant directors, all of them are female, they are
 making work plan in accordance with the bigger goals to stop violence and
 enhance awareness level. these A.D are adding financial Activities into the
 work plan to evaluate woman who can become small Enterprises in
 handicraft and home based work units
- They have join hands with Ombudsman Protection Against Harassment of Women At Work Place, Since the inception of Anti-Harassment Act for Women Protection at Workplace passed in 2010, they have been trying to establish coordination but due to constant changes within the department it was not quite workable but now firm grounds are being lead for proper affiliations but Online Complaint Managing Information System was launched on 15th July, 2015 and WDD has recognized it and are willing to help woman who need help. Overall if such type of case is registered the woman judicial councilor take-up this case and take it to court within 24 hours. (they have provided the report to BRSP office for data availability)
- They have contacted the line department regarding complaint registration for Harassment in work places. They have interacted with female to understand why there has never been any case registered on this particular issues. He believed that this topic is consider as taboo and people do not come forward to register a case against coworker because that results in labeling and effecting the honor of woman and most importantly their families do not support the victim to come forward as they are afraid of societal pressures, people lack awareness and they do not understand the right and structure of work places
- Female of different line department need training and awareness related harassment at work places and preventions they need to understand that this is their right

- WDD had been part of the process of making of "The Balochistan Domestic Violence (Prevention and Protection) Act 2014 (Act No. Vii of 2014)". now they are making their yearly programs in accordance to this acts (repeat of information He had already mention this)
- Whereas 'Harassment at the Workplaces" was restructured and relaunched with in their department in 21 Jan 2016 (this is with the information earlier mention for Harassment at work places)
- They are Collaborating with UN Woman to make a roadmap to establish rule of law for all line department covering gender issues and gender sensitization
- WDD had been working for quite some time but other line-department do
 not take our work seriously. If there are any cases they do not get
 registered as people like to solve them through discussion they do not
 intend to involve legalities. for example a woman goes to her superior with
 a complaint against a coworker or some woman comes up with a complain
 , in work places these issues are solved without proper proceeding but the
 heads of departments deals with it without any legal action
- But if a girl or woman come to Shelter home, all relating department including police handle her case at first priority
- No FIR registered cases are in record against any woman for last two year, in case if a woman is found guilty of a crime she is given a sympathetic reaction and usually is set free. He said that Majority of population I come in contact say a woman cannot commit a crime" and they take woman a very low specie and its very insulting for a man to register a complaint against woman, as its common practice that a man is judged by his command on woman, it is said that a man who cannot control a woman is worthless. Actually status of woman is consider lower than animal, her say, her complain and her agitation is given no importance
- They are working on Acid Thrown cases Bill, work on it is in pipeline
- They are working on economic-uplift of woman belonging to Lower status, they have given recommendation to build a "Woman Display Center" were they are planning to display handicraft made by local woman. They have firm believe to eliminate the middle man and place their official staff for gathering and payment to the woman, for pricing of article they are going to fix a proper system to avoid financial manipulation.
- Government of Balochistan has granted 10 million to start this Woman Display Center but they do not have land to build and develop this center, WDD have requested land for establishment of center

| | In 2014 they arranged "mass marriage or collective marriages" In the event they arrange marriages of 25 couple on the same day They hire as many female with in their department in accordance with "The Balochistan Employees' Efficiency And Discipline Act, 2011 (Act No.Vi Of 2011)" act allow them to intake They are willing to opt for grant from national, international donors and government for result oriented plans. working on this they are arraigning woman Conference on woman participation in Public spaces and they are inviting activist, social organizers, Ngo worker and government officials that are working on woman right and participation issues to give these people recognition and create networks |
|-------------|--|
| Analysis | Gap and Disparities Inline department do not understand what are gender gap and how these gaps effect progressive functioning Worse Problem that he mention and quite evident against their work was lack of financial resources. Budget constrains effect Program Implementation, overall their administrative cost are 50% of the approved Budget People talk about Woman and Gender right but Implementing it with the department are rarely seen They have money in bank to start woman display center but they are seeking land from government to build center instead they should take-up a rented building and start process of WDC, when it will develop into a success story they can shift this to department own building Good practices Woman cases are given importance and all line department which are related to the case become active to solve and rehabilitate female cases are taken to court with in 24 hour of registration of complaint Indicator of change While discussion head of WDD mention indicator of change for them will be when they can establish their center and shelter home in Zhob |
| Suggestions | They need awareness session with in and with LINE department to understand what are gender issues, how to deal with them and how to add them while formulating any policy or work plans Balochistan Need Public message service for indirect Uplifting of Woman Image in public spaces, to end Violence against woman and eradicate the gender imbalance |

| | They should have gender audit of all line Departments |
|------------------|---|
| Reading material | The Balochistan Domestic Violence (Prevention And Protection) Act 2014 (Act No. Vii Of 2014) PROVINCIAL OMBUDSMAN SECRETARIAT, BALOCHISTAN annual report 2015 Sexual Harassment at the work place bill 2010 Valance against woman 2014 (WDD document, to be given by BRSP) Harassment at work place 21 Jan 2016 (WDD document, to be given by BRSP) THE BALOCHISTAN EMPLOYEES' EFFICIENCY AND DISCIPLINE ACT, 2011 (ACT NO.VI Of 2011) |